

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



TRANSGENDER DISPUTES, CONVERSION THERAPY AND GOVERNMENT ACTIONS¹

A series of Presentations

SUSAN GILCHRIST

SuP0731q

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



BACKGROUND

These presentations are extracted from a series of annotated presentations, available at Gilchrist, S. (2022): *“Christian Communities, Transgender People and Christian Traditions” (Draft)*: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/037B-PresDoctrinesDisputesTransPeople.pdf>

They examine in detail, religious and scientific attitudes and to transgender people and show how these interact with feminist issues

For more information on these matters see: Gilchrist, S. (2022): *“No Blacks, No Irish, No Homosexuals, No Transgender People”*: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/252P-NoBlacks.pdf>

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



FRAMEWORK

These presentations are divided into five parts. Click on the titles below to go directly to the section

[THEORIES AND DISPUTES](#)

[ATTACKS](#)

[CURRENT CONCERNS](#)

[INTERFERENCE WITH HUMAN RIGHTS LEGISLATION AND GOVERNMENT ACTIONS](#)

[RELIGIOUS INTERACTION AND IMPACTS](#)

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



TRANSGENDER DISPUTES, CONVERSION THERAPY AND GOVERNMENT ACTIONS

SUSAN GILCHRIST

PART 1: THEORIES AND DISPUTES

[Top](#)

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



GENDER IDENTITY

- In a United Kingdom Parliamentary debate on the 1 March 2021, Penny Mordaunt remarked that *“Trans men are men and trans women are women”*. The context of this remark was the discussion of an amendment to the Ministerial and other Maternity Allowances Bill. That statement is hotly contested in today’s febrile atmosphere, where disputes rage about the nature of transgender conditions².
- The Professional Institutions and World Authorities almost universally regard these *“as naturally expected variations of the human condition, which are intrinsic to the personality created, that arises very early in development and cannot be changed either by the individual concerned or by the predations of others in subsequent life”*
- That is confirmed by much research and experiential evidence, which show that a core sense of belonging to a particular gender is formed very early in life, starting as soon as the process of separating the self from the other begins.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



DISAGREEMENT

- However, this is rejected by many feminist groups who argue that gender identity is formed entirely as a collective experience associated with the development of the gender role. Although the development of the core gender identity starts from birth, the neural co-ordination and social awareness needed to enable the gender role identity to develop is not present before the age of around two to three years.
- Professional explanations now define gender identity as a combination of the two, where the gender role identity acts an overlay on the core gender identity, which has already been formed.
- Although on average pre-and post-natal male and female physiologies, such as neural maturation rates, endocrines, and aggression profiles differ significantly between men and women, major overlaps occur.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



GENDER AND SEX

- These interactions mean that either or both elements of gender identity usually, but do not always follow biological sex.
- The same processes apply to everyone, so male, female, and transgender gender identities are equally firmly held. Major neural and cognitive changes during the first three years lock this in place.
- Because gender-critical groups refuse to recognise the existence of the core gender identity and confine the development of gender identity to the collective experience associated entirely with the gender role, the effects of the massive neurological advances and changes during the first three years of life are dismissed or ignored.
- Therefore, a clear and objective analysis of both approaches is crucial because the motives and methods of management conflict strongly conflict:

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



DANGERS

- In line with the viewpoints of the Professional Institutions, discrepancies to the core gender identity are recognised as personality variations, which involve the search for identity and the rejection of what is wrong, they are internally focussed, they do not attack others, and are about being yourself.
- On the other hand, disturbances to the gender role are identified as perversions or disruptions driven by motives of behaviour, desire, and sex.
- These can be used to promote fears of predation and allegations that male to female transsexuals are potential threats. They must be treated as personality disruptions instead.
- Motives and methods of management strongly oppose each other, and considerable harm can be created when the choice is incorrect.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



GENDER OR SEX?

- At the core of this dispute is the disagreement about whether gender identity is merely a social construct or lies at the heart of the personality that is created.
- When gender identity is used as the primary marker for social identification, it is possible for someone who is male to identify with women from the moment of birth have a sense of identity, outlook, behaviour, and lifestyle which is in harmony with women, respects women, and who fights as assiduously and strongly as any woman for the protection and security of her safety and her gender-based rights.
- Using biological sex as the primary marker for social identification turns the same transsexual with precisely the same outlook, from an ally into an opponent, who is then perceived to be erasing women's identities and attacking their hard-won sex-based rights.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



DISCRIMINATION

- None of this can ignore the massive discrimination, violence, abuse, and domination of women, by men which has existed from time immemorial and is worldwide today. Many try to justify this using the excuses that men and women have different mental and social capabilities and abilities, and that these boundaries are innate.
- Feminist gender theories take many forms but perhaps, not surprisingly their focus is on the gender role. It is a fundamental tenet of all feminist movements that the existence of all these innate gender-based differences must be absolutely denied.
- Gender-critical groups also dismiss the existence of gender identity as anything other than an undefinable social concept, so that unless some disruption occurs, gender identity must be identified with biological sex.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CHALLENGES AND CONTRADICTION

- Although many different theories are offered³, many feminist approaches regard transgender people to be deluded or are hostile to them. These often presume that male to female transsexuals are predatory men who seek to exert power and domination over women, who manipulate femininity to their own desires and advantage by adopting a female role. Having failed to do this in the male role they may seek to do it in the female role instead.
- There is a contradiction in the gender-critical approach. If it is accepted in line with professional studies, that an elementary core gender identity arises very early in life and that this is effectively fixed by the age of three years, then the gender-critical feminist approach is invalidated. If instead the gender-critical approach is taken to be correct, transgender conditions must then be diagnosed as perversions, paraphilias or disruptions, therefore the depth of transgender identities is denied.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



AUTOGYNEPHILIC TRANSSEXUALITY

- Gender-critical groups get round this contradiction by adopting autogynephilic theories to explain male to female transsexuality⁴. This theory was put forward by Dr Ray Blanchard in the 1980's and 1990's.
- Blanchard proposed that male-to-female transsexuals are either sexually attracted exclusively to men (homosexual) or are sexually attracted primarily to the thought or image of themselves as female (autogynephilic), and that autogynephilic transsexuals seek “*sex reassignment*” to actualize their autogynephilic desires
- According to this theory sexual orientations are still considered to be personality variations. However, transgender identities are perversions of male homosexuality instead (the word paraphilia is used)⁵ These autogynephilic theories fit the dogmas defined by gender-critical groups for they presume that no sense of gender identity can develop until the social implications are first understood and are responded to.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



DEFICIENCIES

- Therefore, development of gender identity is associated entirely with the gender role and the impact of earlier development processes, including the core gender identity is ignored or denied,
- In contradiction to the viewpoint of the professional institutions, which consider transgender conditions as personality variation this theory demands that they are treated as personality disruptions instead.
- The motives, consequences, and methods of management directly oppose each other, and great harm can be encountered when the wrong one is applied
- There is little disagreement about how the gender role develops. The focus of this dispute is about the impact, if any, the core gender identity has on the development of personality and identity in early life.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CONFLICT

- We have two completely different explanations for transsexuality, coming from different sources. One describes it as a search for identity and the rejection of what is wrong, with no behavioural implications involved. The other presents it as a sexually motivated perversion or disruption of the gender role, where behaviour and desire provide the driving forces, and the dangers of predation occur.
- The understanding of gender and sexually variant behaviour has advanced greatly since in the 1960's with the use of Freudian Psychodynamics when the first three years were considered as a period of seething emotions, with little constructive occurring. The development of gender identity and personality was presumed to take place, as if on a blank canvas, from the age of three years.
- Then there was no understanding of the existence or impact of the core gender identity, so gender identity was exclusively attributed to that of the gender role. As we have seen there is strong pressure on feminist groups to keep the same approach

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



SUMMARY

- In summary, these disagreements create toxic conflicts where on the one hand traditional Christian teaching and gender critical-feminist groups see transgender and sexually variant conditions as personality disruptions having maybe sublimated motives of desire and sex.
- On the other hand, the world authorities and professional institutions identify these conditions as personality variations which are driven by the rejection of what is wrong, and are concerned with the search for identity, and not of sex.
- The motives and methods of management are almost opposite to each other. That has profound consequences. The first is seen to be driven by motives of behaviour, desire, and sex, which can be used to promote fears of predation, and allegations that male to female transsexuals are potential threats. The second seeks identity, it rejects what is wrong, it is internally focussed, does not attack others, and is about being yourself.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



GENDER EXPRESSION IN TRANSGENDER PEOPLE

- We have seen that the overall expression of gender identity in transgender people is a combination of two potentially conflicting elements: Therefore, gender expression can vary widely depending upon how the battle lines are drawn at any specific time.
- For significant numbers of transgender people there are periods when all conflict seems to disappear, and identification aligns with that of the gender role. At other times intense trauma and potentially overwhelming drives to reject the gender role appears. The bipolar nature of these must be treated in any management regime,
- The trigger which releases these conflicts may have little to do with gender. It may be depression or the loss of hope of fulfilment in the expected gender role.
- It can also spring into conscious awareness at any time. For some it is already present from earliest memories, for others that may happen when puberty occurs.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



HIDDEN CONFLICTS

- This examination treats the development of gender identity in the same way as other core elements of personality and identity. It applies to all people, men, and women alike
- In line with gender-critical approaches, which deny the impact of the neural and cognitive changes in early development, most people naturally presume that gender identity must follow biological sex
- For most people both the core gender identity and the gender role identity are in harmony with that expected by the biological sex, therefore no awareness of any conflict, or even the possibility of any conflict, is expected to exist.
- That makes it easy for gender-critical groups to pursue their arguments, for these are in line with what most people expect. It is not so simple when the core gender identity conflicts with what biology expects

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



TRANSGENDER CONSEQUENCES

- Some transgender people can from infancy reject all identification with the biological sex. This is when both when both the core gender identity and the gender role identity conflict with biological sex.
- The major conflicts occur when the gender role identity aligns with biological sex, but the core gender identity does not. Fighting these battles fails, since this attacks the foundation upon which the sense of selfhood is built; and that can lead to collapse.
- The World Professional association for Transgender Health (WPATH), provides comprehensive standards of care for transgender people. These are subscribed to by the great majority of Professional Institutions on a worldwide basis. Methods of treatment seek to establish the gender role each person is most comfortable with, by treating the distress caused often by the lack of acceptance and expectations of others, including the vilification of transgender people and personal attacks

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



ATTRITION AND ALIENATION

- For many transgender people, even if they could not at first put a name to it, the discomfort with gender identity has been present from their earliest memories.
- Attempts to suppress or deny this often catastrophically fail, since there is nothing to replace this identity, and that leaves a vacuum inside. The more this is fought the stronger it becomes. That is also why methods of management appropriate to personality variations and not disruptions must be applied
- It is also why approaches such as “*Conversion Therapy*” or “*Reparative Therapy*” are so disastrous, for they simply reinforce what transgender people have been trying to do for themselves, without success often for many years, and the guilt that is heaped on transgender people when that fails can be enormous, not least because of the misdiagnosis that has been applied.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



PROFESSIONAL APPROACHES

- Professional approaches give children the freedom to explore their sense of gender identity give them the ability to find it. They do not give them freedom to choose it⁶.
- These take an affirmative approach which enables people to discover self-identity, self-respect, and self-esteem, and to develop strategies needed to deal with them... and not approaches based on denial and suppression, which leads to the imposition of trauma, guilt, and the desperation which destroys many lives.
- These are anathema to gender-critical groups and to others who diagnose these as perversions instead. For these groups giving this freedom of exploration simply feeds the desires of perversion and disruption, and that leads to a runaway drive

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



INSTITUTIONAL VIEWPOINTS

- The American Psychiatric Association regards affirmative treatment and management as the only legitimate approach for managing transgender conditions.
- This same viewpoint is taken, for example by the British Royal College of Psychiatrists, the British Psychological Society, and parallel United Kingdom organisations. Corresponding positions are taken by the American Psychiatric Association and the American Psychological Association who have released statements which are equally as strong.
- Each of the major medical organizations across the UK has signed a memorandum of understanding which very strongly condemns any attempt to try to ‘cure’ gender and sexually variant people, and that is endorsed on a worldwide basis⁷.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



WORLDWIDE CONSENSUS

- Other international organizations, including the World Health Organization have followed. All of these are signatories to the World Professional Association for Transgender Health standards, which provides the consensus view.
- We have seen that, giving children the ability to explore their gender identity enables them to find it. It does not give the freedom to choose it. While a great majority of children do find that they identify with their biological sex, a minority will not, and the hurt, guilt and self-loathing created may have a very harmful effect. The great trauma, guilt, and the high rates of attempted suicide in young transgender people is not caused by giving children freedom to explore it: it is caused by its denial instead.
- That rings alarms in those who take the opposite view, I examine these in: Gilchrist, S. (2018c): *“The Safeguarding of Transgender Children”*⁸ also in Gilchrist, S. (2017). *“No, Pope Francis: Gender Identity is not a Choice, it need not follow biological sex”*⁹.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



WATCHFUL WAITING

- An approach often adopted is “*Watchful Waiting*”, which encourages transgender children to find ways to conform to the gender identity expected of them and to refuse any irreversible changes, before they make an adult decision about the path to adopt.
- Regardless of any diagnosis that approach must be conservatively and rigourously applied. The concern is about implementation, and this is where the dispute gets hot.
- Treating these as personality disruptions involves an open choice based on behaviour and desire, which can be freely made after adult status is reached. Treating these as personality variations is instead one of suppressing or fighting a deep-seated core sense of gender identity, often from infancy, until attrition and exhaustion forces a decision to be made. Transgender children may be determined to transition at a very early stage. Thus, it is crucial that the correct methods of management and compassion are applied.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



MEDICAL INTERVENTIONS

- Regardless of any diagnosis, any affirmative approach must be adequately tested before undertaking any medical, surgical, or other life changing physical intervention¹⁰. Not to do so is unacceptable on any grounds.
- The administration of puberty delaying hormones is a topic that is hotly contested and depends on the diagnosis that is made. Those who consider that these conditions are personality disruptions argue that nothing should be administered before people are able to make an informed choice, around the age of eighteen years.
- Those who regard these conditions as personality variations argue that these may be administered at an earlier stage to calm the trauma and rejection that often has existed from early childhood, also to delay irreversible actions, and to keep the options for successful transition open so that a fully considered decision can be made.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



DEVELOPING AWARENESS

- The stages in gender identification are important. Children first become aware of gender around the age of two years, but they do not start to form strong gender stereotypes or respond to social implications until around the age of three years. However, children do not develop an adequate *“Theory of Mind”*¹ until about the age of four years. This enables children to *“stand outside themselves”* and to examine what has occurred. It also means that previous development stages are hidden from view
- For most people there is no awareness of these earlier processes, and no perceptions of these early conflicts between gender identity and what the body expects.
- Gender identity is presumed to be determined entirely through social constructs arising from associating with the gender role, therefore the earlier development processes are hidden or ignored. This means that the gender-critical movements can use this lack of awareness to deny that any meaningful changes occur during the first three years.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



BORN INTO THE WRONG BODY

- Some transgender people describe themselves as “*Being Born Into the wrong Body*” but this is a product of experience and earliest memories. Few if any believe that we literally change biological sex. Terms like “*Gender reassignment*” are usually used. This is a product of initial development processes, where a profound sense of identity is created before later behavioural implications come into effect. It also means that the forces which drive early development are those of gender and not sex.
- Gender-critical groups define women as “*adult human females,*” or argue that a woman is exclusively defined as having female reproductive organs, and no other definition is allowed. Among these groups the legitimacy of gender identity is also denied. Allegations that “*male to female transsexuals believe that they change biological sex*”, and descriptions of this as “*gender ideology*” are foisted on transgender people. They are entirely the product of gender critical groups, and they place the integrity of transgender experiences and identities under attack¹².

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



GENE EXPRESSION

- Males have XY chromosomes, Females have XX chromosomes, but to be effective, genes must be switched on
- That is why genes alone are not sufficient. People With Androgen Insensitivity Syndrome develop physically as females, they integrate fully into society as women, but have XY chromosomes, and they may not discover that something is unusual until menstruation fails to occur. Babies born with cloacal exoplasty but who are immediately reassigned to a more cosmetically conventional gender appearance often experience considerable discomfort with the gender identity assigned to them: even when they are completely unaware that this had occurred.
- This indicates that there are other conditioning factors which lead to the development of gender identities. These include endocrines and different neural maturation rates. Now surgery is often deferred until the child decides¹³

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



EARLY NEURAL DEVELOPMENT

- The development of gender or sexual identities requires interaction with others. This means that neither identity can form before birth. However, studies on masculinity and femininity, show that considerable overlap occurs even though male and female attitudes on average, including on aggression, respond very different ways.^{14 15}
- Since the 1960's, neurological studies have shown that early development takes place in a very strongly pro-active, contagious, and self-reinforcing manner. This is to the extent that *"the foremost challenge to be explained is not about how learning develops but about but how this process can be controlled and inhibited for constructive effect"*¹⁶
- The contagion and the self-reinforcing nature of these early forces mean that once development starts in a particular direction it can be difficult to stop. Girard, Dawkins, Gallese, and others showed from the 1960's onwards that the momentum created is so great that only a small trigger is required, and the evidence for this may later be lost¹⁷

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



NEURAL MATURATION

- The pre-frontal cortex, the part of the brain primarily responsible for reasoning and understanding is very primitive at birth. The number of neural connections within it grow rapidly from a small value to reach a peak around the age of three years. Those which are most used grow stronger, those which are least used die back. The total number of neural connections¹⁸ drops to about half this peak value when adulthood is reached
- Up to the age of about two years there are key peak periods of neural development. Capabilities which are not stimulated at the peak time become permanently lost.
- In my own work I show that the same applies to personality and identity, therefore core gender identities for everyone first form during these peaks, and the same way, so that future changeability is lost¹⁹. By mapping the endocrinal, physiological, and psychological changes over these first three to four years I show that the creation of the core gender identity is a dynamic process, and that it need not follow biological sex.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



TRANSFORMATION IN NEURAL CAPABILITIES

- This is not a steady process. Around the age of one and a half to two years a rapid and wide-ranging transformation in neural co-ordination and reasoning abilities takes place.
- It has been described by various investigators as the time when the brain “*lights up*”. Neural activity, which was previously localised in nature rapidly spreads, distant areas of the brain become connected, and networks between the two hemispheres develop.
- There is an explosion in language abilities and cognitive capacity. Before this time, the pre-frontal cortex of the brain had been in a relatively undeveloped state; but that rapidly changes: Significantly, for the first time, the pre-frontal cortex of the brain can start to function effectively as a single co-ordinating unit. The existence of a close correlation between the development of language capabilities and a child’s first awareness of what gender means has been noted by different key investigators.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



COGNITION AND CONTINUITY

- The major changes in neural processing during these early years, the peak periods of neural development, the rapid growth of the neural interconnections and their subsequent pruning, together with the knowledge that to have the greatest effect, the cognitive and mental advances must also coincide with these early peak periods, all describe a brain which is tuning itself to its environment.
- Babies learn enormous amounts before the transformation in cognitive capabilities around the age of one and a half to two years. That is likely to explain the later changes in learning abilities since cognition gives abilities to reason between cause and effect
- What is most notable is that all these transformations are age dependent. This provides a basic continuity of personality and identity which, unless dementia or physical brain injury intervenes, lasts for life, and is created by the age of three years.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



SCOPE

- An important feature to note is that this study did not begin with the objective of identifying how transgender identities develop
- The aim of the study was, and still is, to examine how many different aspects of personality and identity form and develop in early life.
- The development of transgender identities is therefore used as a case study to check and test the validity of the arguments presented. It was not set as the primary focus of the investigation
- Therefore, it should be possible to apply the same arguments to how other non-gender related aspects of personality and identity form in early life.
- The pre-frontal cortex in humans is very primitive at birth. There are enormous advances and changes which take place during the first three to four years of life.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



TUNING AND OPTIMISATION

- Development during these first three to four years is therefore characterised by the intense and continuing struggles between the inbuilt, contagious, internally focussed, feed-forward and physiologically driven forces which dominate in infancy against the controlling, feed-back and externally moderated processes of cognitive development which take over control in later life.
- In my own research I show that all the physiological, neurological, and psychological aspects of brain development act together at this time to form a finely tuned system in which the maximum amount of individuality, possessiveness, intelligence, and inquisitiveness, together with the minimum degree of energy expenditure are generated. Typical or atypical gender identities can therefore develop and, from a statistical point of view alone it is expected that a proportion of people who have gender or sexually variant identities must be created without requiring any external cause.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



GENDER AND BIOLOGY

- Although typical male and female patterns of behaviour on average differ greatly considerable overlap occurs. For most people behaviour and biology agree with each other, so that the only awareness that people have is the deep-seated nature and the hidden but high levels of intensity of belonging to a particular gender that are created.
- The great majority form core gender identities which match biological sex, but some do not. The massive transformations in neural capabilities before the age of three years then lock these in place so continuities of identity and personality are created
- The same processes apply to everyone. For transgender people this harmony is broken, and the result is often a continuing and irreconcilable conflict which may be felt from the earliest years. For gender-critical groups to sustain their arguments all these earlier processes, with the intense levels of conflict that creates, must be denied.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



BIPOLARITY AND TRANSITION REGRET

- This is an area where there is the greatest contention. The professional gender identity clinics use their statistics to report very low rates of transition regret, while gender-critical groups, usually citing individual examples claim that these are very high²⁰.
- One area which I believe has not been properly addressed is the strongly bipolar nature of the conflicts. Attempts to fight or suppress these conflicts fail for the reasons I describe, but many or most male to female transsexuals fight desperately against this drive. It is often driven by conviction that *“I ought to be a woman”*: That only translates into *“I want to be a woman”* when these battles are lost. When transition is complete it is not *“being a woman”* that is important, it is the ability to be oneself.
- I use own experience to say that a threshold can be crossed when the conflict seems to disappear. But it never goes away; and may explode with greater force in later years²¹.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



RIPPON

- The denial that any changes of significance occur during the first three to four years can be seen in the book the: *“The Gendered Brain: The new Neuroscience that shatters the myth of the female brain”*: Gina Rippon, a prominent neuroscientist, argues that unchanging patterns of cognitive processing, social conditioning and passive interactions with others drive development forward from birth²²
- She dismisses the significance of the early neural changes and the transformations in early learning abilities as *“Whack a mole Myths...”* She states that these are untruths which, as they are so often repeated, people come to believe they are correct.
- Her argument is that the great and lifelong ability for the brain to mould, tune, and reshape itself to fit current conditions does create strongly gendered brains, but that this relies entirely on the social conditioning factors which are active throughout life²³

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



INTERPRETATION

- Rippon only considers transgender people in passing. Her recognition that the brain becomes a strongly gendered structure and that the motives are about identity, not about sublimated sexual attractions are welcome
- However, as a self-avowed radical feminist, and along with others, such as Cordelia Fine²⁴, Rippon endorses the argument that gender identities are determined by social conditioning alone. For most gender-critical feminists, who's views align with Freud, that process starts to take effect from about the age of three years. Rippon tries instead to prove that the same processes deliver the driving forces from birth.
- Many of Rippon's arguments are directed against Simon Baron-Cohen²⁵ and others. However, the major concern with gender-critical feminist views is that the existence of the core gender identity and the transformations in early learning patterns are denied.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



INTERACTIONS

- The identification of the “*Core Gender Identity*” as a separate entity arises from the work of Stoller, Money and others in the Johns Hopkins University in the 1960’s. It does not have behavioural implications. Since then, it has been a mainstay of virtually all clinical, medical, and psychological work on how atypical gender identities are formed.
- Their work showed that it had become unchangeable at the latest by the age of three years. However, children do not start to enforce gendered expectations before about this age of three years. From that time onwards the “*Gender Role Identity*” is created, and very strong gender stereotypes may then be formed.
- This means that the gender role identity is an overlay on what has already been created. The overall expression of gender identity combines the two. Thus, the reality of the core gender identity and the early shifts in learning patterns must never be denied.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



IMPACTS

- The development of the core gender identity is through fragmented and strongly proactive processes. Therefore, different end-stages are reached for every individual. The social pressures which had forced development into a binary trajectory are now much less evident, and many transgender people today identify with a non-binary role²⁶.
- For transgender people the core gender identity departs from that predicted by biology, but the gender role identity may not. Many may desperately try to identify with the gender role expected of them. This means that there may be large swings in gender expression and conflicts may only erupt into consciousness after a threshold has been crossed²⁷. That can happen during puberty or at any other time.
- Gender-critical groups interpret this pattern simply as gender fluidity. By denying the existence of the core gender identity they also deny the conflicts that exist.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CHRISTIAN AND OTHER CHALLENGES

- Contrary to feminist concerns, accepting the existence of the core gender identity can considerably strengthen feminist arguments. There are no behavioural implications, and it enables transgender people, and others to argue feminist points of view from a stronger base
- People challenge gender stereotypes for many reasons. The professional institutions identify transgender conditions as personality variations which involve the rejection of what is wrong and the search for identity. However, gender-critical groups find strange bedfellows in the traditional teaching of the Christian Church.
- For Christian and gender-critical groups transgender conditions are exclusively identified with disturbances to the gender role. The motives are understood to be sexually determined behaviours and desires. They are also diagnosed as personality disruptions, and existence of the core gender identity is denied or ignored²⁸.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



PROOF

- The denial of the existence or influence of the core gender identity means that the onus is on gender-critical groups to prove their arguments. However, that does not happen.
- Only an alternative explanation is offered. Gender-critical groups provide an explanation of autogynephilic transsexuality which identifies sexual identity (expressed in terms of sexual orientation) as a personality variation. That is in line with the advances in science and knowledge of the last sixty years: however it defines male to female transsexuality as a perversion or disruption of male homosexuality... which denies these advances of the same sixty years.
- The approach adopted by the professional institutions, including the clinical and experiential evidence collated by world authorities is also ignored, or is dismissed by those in the gender-critical movement as the partisan work of “*transgender activists*”, who also present their own approach as “*The only credible approach*”

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



EXPERIENTIAL EVIDENCE

- The adoption of autogynephilic theories by gender-critical groups is hardly surprising since they support their mantra that gender identity is purely a social construct, and that this is identified entirely with the gender role. However, the theory was already being challenged as being out of date and incorrect by many others working in the field.
- This theory was only developed for male to female transsexuals. It ignores female to male transsexuals. No equivalent autogynephilic parallels for these people have been identified.
- It also fails to deal adequately with non-binary roles, and it does not provide adequate explanations for the wide range of transgender conditions that exist.
- Autogynephilic theories associate transgender conditions with sexual motives, including behaviour and desire, instead of identification and rejection. This allows people to identify all male to female transsexuals as potential threats to women in society.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



MISDIAGNOSES

- The neurological advances during the first three years are further ignored. The activating forces that are due to gene expression (not directly by genes) and the influence of endocrinal (or hormonal) elements are similarly disregarded or denied²⁹
- Perhaps more importantly, autogynephilic theories do not match the lived experiences of transgender people. There is a great deal of anger among transgender people over an incorrect diagnosis being imposed upon them for the purpose of preserving a gender-critical approach, instead of protecting transgender people's lives.
- No argument which claims to have a scientific basis can ever be justified unless experiential evidence or testing and research proves its viability
- We have seen that the motives and methods of management are opposite to each other. Great harm can be created when the wrong diagnosis is made

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



ARGUMENTS

- For most people, feminism advocates social, political, economic, and intellectual equality for women and men. It defines a political perspective. This is distinct from sex or gender. For most feminists the creation of gender identity as a collective social experience, determined entirely by engagement with the gender role.
- Various explanations are put forward to explain transgender conditions. For some it is an attempt to exert power over women. Gender-critical groups go one step further by denying the existence of gender identity as a meaningful element. They define biological sex as the determining role: and use the work of Judith Butler, who is an icon of feminist movements, to justify their arguments.
- Although Butler had argued that gender identity was created entirely by performing the gender role, this was not her argument³⁰. In the later sections I show why I join forces with Judith Butler using my own, and her own, criticisms of the gender critical approach.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



ACCEPTANCE

- Today, for the most part, transgender people are well accepted in the United Kingdom. Most people, including many feminists are happy to accept the statement that “*Trans women are women*”, because they find that they integrate seamlessly into society in that role. Gender-critical groups cannot accept this definition because they define women exclusively in terms of their reproductive organs or biological sex.
- Many gender-critical feminist groups claim that they welcome transgender people, but there is a fundamental contradiction between the quality of the welcome they give and their approach which leads people to believe that male to female transsexuals threaten women’s identities and are at least as prone as all males to engage in predation, sexual abuse, and physical attacks. However, there is no unanimity in the feminist movements as to how male to female transsexuals should be treated, and gender-critical feminists represent only a minority in the various feminist groups³¹.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



SAFETY AND ROLE

- It is impossible to underestimate the need to ensure the safety and security of women against male abuses and attacks: That must be an overwhelming priority. However, the enormous pressures this creates and the imperative need to protect women against mainly male attacks, abuses, and sexual violations, as seen in the “*Me too*” movement means that impeccable standards of objectivity and impartiality must still be applied.
- It should be noted that all these arguments are about the existence of the core gender identity and the sense of belonging it creates. Gender-critical groups who deny the existence of the core gender identity may presume that transgender people seek gender stereotypes or sexual gratification, but transgender people search for identity instead, and there should be no dispute with any feminist group over the gender role.
- For many years, large numbers of male to female transexuals have held leading positions in the feminist movements and, unlike these attacks, have been considered as allies, not as enemies, in the feminist cause.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



MISLEADING INFORMATION

- Many of these conflicts spring from the movement to allow transsexual people to “*self-identify*” their gender identity. This meant that they did not need a medical diagnosis of “*Gender dysphoria*” to be able to change their legal sex, but still faced certain checks.
- The removal of the medical diagnosis would require reform of the 2004 Gender Recognition act. However, this act does not contain the legislation to protect women’s identities and spaces. That is instead contained in the 2010 Equality act.
- There was no proposal to change this legislation in any way or in any residual data in the 2004 Gender Recognition Act. Thus, the protection of women’s identity and spaces was to be totally unaltered, regardless of whether self-identification was granted or not
- Unfortunately, that was not the information distributed to the public, where it was alleged that all protections would be removed, women’s safe spaces would vanish, and women would be made vulnerable to male abuse and attacks.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



AVOIDANCE

- We have seen that the methods of managing personality variations and personality disruptions are in direct opposition: what is seen as compassion and concern by one side is almost by definition treated as coercion and recruitment by the other. Groups like Transgender Trend, who treat transgender conditions as personality disruptions, worry that the affirming approaches used by the professional institutions recruit children into being transgender.
- That is why objective studies are needed. The major issue is the core gender identity. Professional approaches identify it as one of the key elements of personality and identity which forms early in life and gives a foundation on which future identity is built.
- Therefore, the onus is on gender critical groups to show why its existence should be denied. That does not happen. Instead, the approaches of the professional institutions are ignored and dismissed as the work of “*transgender activists*”, alleged to contain no “*credible science*”, and those who advocate it are subjected to personal attacks.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



WHAT IS “GENDER IDEOLOGY”?

- Gender-critical groups define women as “*adult human females,*” and no other definition is allowed. The 2020 Transgender Trend website alleges that: “*Changing gender is presented [by transgender people] as synonymous with changing sex*”^{32 33}.
- As Judith Butler notes, in recent years the attacks on this so-called “*gender ideology*” alleged to be adopted by transgender people, have grown throughout the world, dominating public debate, stoked by electronic networks, and backed by extensive right wing Catholic and evangelical organizations. Many of these groups concur that: “*The traditional family is under attack, that children in the classroom are being indoctrinated to become homosexuals, and that “gender” is a dangerous, if not diabolical, ideology threatening to destroy families, local cultures, civilization, and even “man” himself*”³⁴.
- Allegations that transgender people believe this ideology to be true are foisted on transgender people. They are entirely the product of gender critical groups, and they place the integrity of transgender experiences and identities under very strong attack.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



ATTITUDES

- It is very important to note that many gender-critical groups strongly deny they are not transphobic and do welcome male to female transsexuals into their ranks. They may identify themselves as trans women but should not call themselves women.
- Instead of accepting the approach adopted by the World Authorities and Professional Institutions, which involve an internally focussed search for identity and the rejection of what is wrong, which also does not attack others, and is about being yourself, an approach is taken which leads people to believe that male to female transsexuals threaten women's identities and are at least as prone as all males to engage in predation, sexual abuse, and physical attacks.
- Unfortunately, that same welcome is not accepted elsewhere. It is seen in the attacks on transgender people in America, including by the American Roman Catholic Bishops and religious right, also in many other countries in Europe and Africa, who seek to erase the legitimacy of transgender identities and destroy their rights.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



TRANSGENDER DISPUTES, CONVERSION THERAPY AND GOVERNMENT ACTIONS

SUSAN GILCHRIST

PART 2: ATTACKS

[Top](#)

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



BACKGROUND

- In Part 1 of these presentations, we have examined the nature and origin of transgender conditions. We have seen that two completely different explanations are offered: one is in line with the viewpoints of the Professional Institutions, discrepancies to the core gender identity are recognised as personality variations, which involve the search for identity and the rejection of what is wrong, they are internally focussed, they do not attack others, and are about being yourself.
- On the other hand, gender critical groups associate these with autogynephilic transsexuality, where disturbances to the gender role are identified as perversions or disruptions of male homosexuality driven by motives of behaviour, desire, and sex. These can be used to promote fears of predation and allegations that male to female transsexuals are potential threats. They must be treated as personality disruptions instead. Motives and methods of management strongly oppose each other, and considerable harm can be created when the choice is incorrect. Currently transgender people are coming under increasing attack. We will consider that next

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



REALITY OF GENDER IDENTITY

- Gender critical groups argue that there is no innate, or deep-seated sense of gender identity. Using the work of Judith Butler in the 1990's³⁵. Its creation is stated to be entirely due to “performative acts”, which is a product of social conditioning alone.
- For other groups, gender awareness begins from the time when a baby starts to separate the self from the other. That is at a very early stage. For most babies gender awareness (in terms of difference) is evident by the age of two years, but children do not start to react to or adopt its social implications until at least three years.
- This means that for gender-critical groups the massive changes and advances in neurological development during the first three years are ignored³⁶. That throws all arguments back into 1960's Freudian psychodynamics, when up to three years of age was believed to be a time of seething emotions where little constructive occurs.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



TRANSGENDER TREND WEBSITE

- Despite the current evidence, and the advances in understanding that have taken place, Transgender Trend states on its 2020 website that: “There is no scientific basis for the idea of innate deeply-held sense of gender”^{37 38}
- On the advice given to schools on the “Impact of Teaching Gender Identity to Children” Transgender Trend states “Transgender organisations such as Gendered Intelligence³⁹, GIRES⁴⁰ and Allsorts Youth Project⁴¹ deliver training for teachers and PSHE classes for children in schools. Their teaching is backed by no credible science but has been adopted by government, the NHS, schools, and therapists.
- We have seen that this site also alleges that: “Changing gender is presented as synonymous with changing sex”⁴². That statement is categorically rejected by transgender people who see any surgical or hormonal intervention as gender affirmation procedures instead.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



AUTOGYNEPHILIC TRANSSEXUALITY

- Autogynephilic transsexuality⁴³ was a theory put forward by Dr Ray Blanchard in the 1980's and 1990's
- Blanchard proposed that male-to-female transsexuals are either sexually attracted exclusively to men (homosexual) or are sexually attracted primarily to the thought or image of themselves as female (autogynephilic), and that autogynephilic transsexuals seek “sex reassignment” to actualize their autogynephilic desires
- According to this theory sexual orientations are personality variations, and transgender identities are perversions of male homosexuality (the word paraphilia is used)⁴⁴
- Despite being rejected by many mainstream workers; this is the theory which gender-critical feminists use to justify the arguments they make⁴⁵

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CONTRADICTION

- Autogynephilic theories for transsexuality fit the dogmas defined by gender-critical groups for they presume that no sense of gender identity can develop until the social implications are first understood and are responded to.
- They also hide this fundamental contradiction inherent to gender critical theory⁴⁶.
- If it is accepted in line with professional studies, that an elementary core gender identity arises very early in life and that this is effectively fixed by the age of three years, then the gender-critical feminist approach is invalidated.
- If instead the gender-critical approach is taken to be correct, transgender conditions must then be diagnosed as perversions, paraphilias or disruptions, and the depth of transgender identities is denied.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



PROBLEMS

- There are various problems with autogynephilic theories. The theories presume transsexuality has a sexual motivation with a personality disruption, while professional studies identify it as the search for identity and a personality variation instead.
- Blanchard only considered male-to-female transsexuals. This theory ignores female to male transsexuals and no equivalent paraphilia for these people has been identified.
- The theory also fails to deal with non-binary roles. and it does not provide adequate explanations for the wide range of transgender conditions that exist.
- It associates transgender conditions with sexual motives, including behaviour and desire, instead of identification and rejection. This identifies all male to female transsexuals as potential threats to women in society.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



DISCONNECTIONS

- The theories also presume that sexual orientation is determined by genetic factors, and that homosexuality is a personality variation. Transgender conditions are disruptions of this. However, the activating forces are due to gene expression (not directly by genes) and the influence of endocrinal (or hormonal) elements are disregarded or denied⁴⁷
- This autogynephilic theory at the time it was being applied was regarded as outdated and incorrect by other clinicians in the field. The clinic which promoted it was shut down in a hotly contended dispute
- Perhaps more importantly, autogynephilic theories do not match the lived experiences of transgender people. There is a great deal of anger among transgender people over an incorrect diagnosis being imposed upon them for the purpose of preserving a gender-critical approach, instead of protecting transgender people's lives.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



OBJECTIVITY

- If science is to be used correctly it is essential that all viewpoints are considered
- Therefore, it would be expected that the approaches adopted by the Professional Institutions, World Authorities, WPATH (World Professional Association for Transgender Health) and clinical authorities, would be properly considered, but the existence of these and the arguments they make are dismissed or ignored⁴⁸.
- There is no reference to the “Memorandum of Understanding” produced or endorsed by all of the major Professional Institutions in the United Kingdom which condemns “Conversion Therapy. The existence of this memorandum is also totally ignored⁴⁹
- Support groups such as Stonewall⁵⁰, GIRES⁵¹ and others who support the approaches adopted by the professional institutions are virulently condemned.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



RESEARCH

- Objective research needs experiential evidence to prove it. This is an essential element in validating any study. That must be questioned in this gender-critical approach.⁵²
- The use by gender-critical groups of a seminal paper by Joel et al⁵³ in attempts to prove that gender identity is purely a social construct is directly contradicted by Joel in another paper, written by Joel, Swaab et al, and by other leading researchers who are working directly in the field^{54 55 56 57 58}.
- The use of another influential paper by Dhejne and others^{59 60 61} in attempts to prove that male to female transsexuals continue have the same propensity to violently attack women as all males, also that the trauma faced by these people arises because they are the agents for their own misfortunes... instead of the persecution and vilification of others, is also vociferously denounced by Dhejne, the lead author of the paper.⁶²

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



STATISTICS

- Gender-critical groups attempt to use statistics to prove that male to female activities engage in sexual abuses at the same rate as the overall male population
- This is done by taking the distribution of people in prison for sex offences who claim to be transgender and extrapolating this figure to assume that the proportion of those in prison can be extrapolated to include the whole transgender population.
- Individual cases are highlighted to emphasise the perceived dangers. However, this ignores demographics, incentives, lack of statistical significance, changes in attitudes during the years, errors, and the inconsistencies in extrapolation.
- This has been challenged in many quarters. Broader studies do not support these claimed results⁶³

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CAMPAIGNS

- The “Stonewall” reports documenting discrimination against transgender people, including children, are dismissed as propaganda by gender-critical groups, even though the same results are replicated in many other worldwide studies⁶⁴
- Perhaps the most serious and significant criticism of the gender-critical movements comes from Professor Judith Butler who, in her 1990’s book, provided much of the initial inspiration for the gender-critical approach⁶⁵.
- In a 2021 article in the Guardian newspaper⁶⁶ she says: “The anti-gender movement is not a conservative position with a clear set of principles. No, as a fascist trend, it mobilizes a range of rhetorical strategies from across the political spectrum to maximize the fear of infiltration and destruction that comes from a diverse set of economic and social forces. It does not strive for consistency, for its incoherence is part of its power”.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CLINICAL INPUTS

- These comments by Butler are extremely strong, and it would be good to read her complete article. That can be accessed here: [\(Butler 2021\)](#). An alternative way of examining these issues is to look at the clinical inputs
- We have already seen that gender critical feminist groups accept sexual orientations as personality variations but consider male to female transsexuality as a perversion of male homosexuality. The professional institutions and word authorities diagnose both conditions as personality variations which arise very early development and cannot be changed either by the person concerned or the predations of others in later life
- Great harm can occur if the wrong management method is applied. The mass of clinical and professional evidence that is available is dismissed by gender-critical groups as the work of “transgender activists” and its influence is denied⁶⁷.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



RECRUITMENT AND REGRET

- For most people the intuitive expectation is that gender identity should conform to biological sex; and that any departure from this is either because of predations, the engagement in sexual abuse or the rewards of inappropriate sex.
- A major allegation made against the use of an affirmative approach by the gender identity clinics and transgender people is that of predation and enlistment to the cause
- Gender identity clinics all report low rates of regret after gender reassignment surgery, but gender critical groups cite very high rates, with individual cases highlighted⁶⁸
- When what one side sees as compassion and understanding is invariably interpreted by the other as coercion and enforcement, and when these early development processes are dismissed or ignored, transgender people come under strong attack.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



IDENTIFICATION

- At the heart of this dispute is the disagreement over the origins and nature of gender identity. The gender-critical groups argue that it is a social construct and deny that any deep-seated gender identity exists.
- We have seen that the Professional Institutions, World Authorities, and the clinical consensus argue that the core or basic elements lie at the heart of the personality that is created and it is one of the first elements of personality to be formed.
- Using this gender entitlement, it is possible for someone who is male to identify with women from the moment of birth, have a sense of identity and an outlook, behaviour and lifestyle which is in harmony with women, who respects women, and who fights throughout life as assiduously and strongly as any woman for the protection and security of her safety and gender-based rights.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



DISAGREEMENT

- Applying the same gender entitlement to the second explanation of autogynephilic transsexuality, where sexuality and sexual orientation is still treated as a personality variation but transsexuality which is treated either as a paraphilia, perversion, disruption, or sublimation, turns the same transsexual with precisely the same outlook, from an ally into an opponent, who is then perceived to be erasing women's identities and attacking their hard-won sex-based rights.
- We have seen that if it is accepted that an elementary core gender identity arises very early in life and is effectively fixed by the age of three years, then the gender-critical feminist approach is invalidated. If the gender-critical approach is accepted, then transgender conditions must be diagnosed as perversions, paraphilias or disruptions. Transgender people can then be presented as potential predators, threats to women's safety, pursuing sexual motives, and the reality of transgender identities is denied.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



SOME PERCEPTIONS: BORN INTO THE WRONG BODY?

- Transgender people may describe themselves as being ‘born into the wrong body’, It describes the sense of being trapped in the wrong gender; but this is a truth of memory and experience. Few, if any, believe that we literally change biological sex⁶⁹.
- For all transgender people the search is for identity and the rejection of what is wrong, it is not about behaviour or sexual desire
- The allegation that “changing gender presentation is synonymous with changing sex” is a fiction imposed on transgender people by opponents, and by gender critical groups
- Most people consider trans women to be women because of the ways we interact with society, and how we share common interests and concerns. This high degree of acceptance is far more important than any condemnation based on biological sex.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



ATTACKS

- In June 2021, the Hungarian parliament voted overwhelmingly to eliminate from public schools all teaching related to “homosexuality and gender change”, associating LGBTQI rights and education with paedophilia and totalitarian cultural politics.
- In late May 2021, Danish MPs passed a resolution against “excessive activism” in academic research environments, including gender studies, race theory, postcolonial and immigration studies in their list of culprits.
- In December 2020, the supreme court in Romania struck down a law that would have forbidden the teaching of “gender identity theory” but the dispute still rages on.
- Trans-free spaces in Poland have been declared by over 100 authorities eager to purify Poland of corrosive cultural influences from the US and the UK.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



MORE ATTACKS

- Turkey's withdrawal from the Istanbul convention in March 2021 sent shudders through the EU, since one of its main objections was the inclusion of protections for women and children against violence, and this "problem" was linked to the foreign word, "gender".
- In recent years the attacks on so-called "*gender ideology*" have grown throughout the world, dominating public debate, stoked by electronic networks, and backed by extensive right wing Catholic and evangelical organizations.
- As Butler notes, although they are not always in accord, these groups concur that the traditional family is under attack, that children in the classroom are being indoctrinated to become homosexuals, and that "gender" is a dangerous, if not diabolical, ideology threatening to destroy families, local cultures, civilization, and even "man" himself.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



ANTI-GENDER MOVEMENTS

- The anti-gender ideology movement crosses borders, linking organizations in Latin America, Europe, Africa, and east Asia.
- Butler indicates that opposition to “gender” is voiced by governments as diverse as Macron’s France and Duda’s Poland, it circulates in right wing parties in Italy, it shows up on major electoral platforms in Costa Rica and Colombia, boisterously proclaimed by Bolsonaro in Brazil, and responsible for closing gender studies in several places, including the European University in Budapest in 2017 before it relocated to Vienna.
- Butler also notes that these reactionary flames have been fanned by the Vatican, which has proclaimed “gender ideology” “diabolical”, calling it a form of “colonizing imperialism” originating in the north and raising fears about the “inculcation” of “gender ideology” in the schools.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



UNITED STATES

- Transgender people have been under assault from many angles in the United States. In the past year a record-breaking number of anti-transgender bills have been filed, and more have passed than in the past ten years combined^{70 71}
- Attacks by the Roman Catholic Bishops in the United States, as exemplified in the Arlington letter, combined with those of the gender-critical movements, conservative evangelicals, and the far right, are being used to discredit the identities of transgender people and give support to the secular scapegoating that also exists⁷².
- I believe that justification for these condemnations is made using partisan applications of science to “prove” a particular cause. For details, see: Gilchrist, S. (2021a): “Gender Identity, Feminism, and Transgender People”:⁷³ and also Gilchrist, S. (2017e): “Gender and Sexual Malpractice and Abuse in the Christian Church”:⁷⁴

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



OVERVIEW

- The “sexual orientation gender identity complex” lies at the heart of the personality that is created. It provides an initial and basic foundation on which self-identity is based.
- Since sexual identity and gender identity depend on interaction with others neither can form before birth. However evolutionary, physiological, endocrinal, and temperamental, including differences in patterns of aggression provide pre-natal effects
- Gene expression rather than chromosomal composition is the trigger which determines the direction the development of both gender and sexual identities take. A spike in testosterone levels in male babies at the time of birth may give the trigger needed⁷⁵
- Finely tuned physiological, neurological, and psychological facets of brain development create an underlying constancy of personality and identity during the first three years.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



TRANSGENDER FEMINISM

- Although Butler only considers the gender role, she is resolute about respecting the gender identities that are created. She treats transgender conditions as personality variations rather than disruptions from an original course.
- Accepting the existence of the core gender identity can considerably strengthen Butler's arguments. There are no behavioural implications, and it enables transgender people, and others to argue feminist points of view from a stronger base.
- Many male to female transsexuals have proud histories of supporting feminist movements, many use Butler's work, and have taken leading roles. Contrary to the attacks made on male to female transsexuals which state that they attack their sex-based rights and erase the identities of women, male to female transsexuals affirm the identities of all women through their advocacy of women's gender-based rights.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



AGENDAS

- There are clear agendas being pursued by various groups
- For gender-critical feminists any suggestion that the repulsive discrimination against women is due to any innate gender difference must be denied: so that gender identity must only be a product of the gender role and is created by social conditioning alone.
- The traditional teaching of the Christian Church since the 12th Century regards all forms of gender and sexually variant behaviour without exception to be a disruption of the divine order, a falling from grace and the pursuit of improper acts
- To maintain these positions both groups misdiagnose transgender conditions as perversions or disruptions driven by behaviours and desires that are seen to threaten others and attack family life. This can have a very harmful effect.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



ACCEPTANCE OF TRANSGENDER PEOPLE BY GENDER-CRITICAL GROUPS,

- A feature of these groups is that many of them very strongly deny that they are transphobic and that they welcome transgender people into their ranks. Debbie Hayton, who is herself transgender, is a prominent campaigner for the gender-critical cause
- A major fear among amongst many women, and not just gender-critical feminists, is that giving male to female transsexuals, greater degrees of acceptance, notably the ability to self-identify, will result in hordes of males, intent on sexual abuse invading women's spaces, and reinforcing the attacks and discrimination that all women face⁷⁶.
- Like those in some religious organisations, many passionately and genuinely believe that they are acting in the best interests of transgender people. These concerns must be taken very seriously, but it does not justify the misdiagnosis that occurs. That level of concern is expressed in the condemnations that Judith Butler makes.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



BUTLER'S ARGUMENTS

- In her 2021 Guardian article, Judith Butler argues: *“It is not easy to fully reconstruct the arguments used by the anti-gender ideology movement because they do not hold themselves to standards of consistency or coherence. They assemble and launch incendiary claims to defeat what they see as “gender ideology” or “gender studies” by any rhetorical means necessary. For instance, they object to “gender” because it putatively denies biological sex or because it undermines the natural or divine character of the heteronormative family”*
- *“The anti-gender movement is not a conservative position with a clear set of principles. No, as a fascist trend, it mobilizes a range of rhetorical strategies from across the political spectrum to maximize the fear of infiltration and destruction that comes from a diverse set of economic and social forces. It does not strive for consistency, for its incoherence is part of its power”.*

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



TRANSGENDER DISPUTES, CONVERSION THERAPY AND GOVERNMENT ACTIONS

SUSAN GILCHRIST

PART 3: CURRENT CONCERNS

[Top](#)

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CONFLICT

- It is useful to remind ourselves of the conflicts which currently being fought.
- The professional Institutions and world authorities identify gender and sexual variations as personality variations which form and become unalterable very early in life. The core gender identity forms first: this gives a sense of belonging alone. It precedes the gender role identity, and later forms in response to expected roles in society. Incongruences in the former must be managed as personality variations; driven by searches for identity; and rejecting what is wrong. Disturbances in the latter arise from maybe unconscious or sublimated desires, and these must be treated as personality disruptions instead.
- Gender-critical groups refuse to separate the elements and associate the formation of gender identities entirely with the gender role. The management methods totally differ from each other. That contributes greatly to the toxic nature of the conflicts that occur.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



EARLY FORMATION

- For the great majority of people, the core gender identity and gender role identity will be in harmony. The same processes apply to everyone. For the majority of people, apart from the firmness with which the sense of gender identity is held, there will be no perception whatever of the core gender identity, for this is created before conscious awareness occurs. Contrary to this, the severe attrition, intensity, and strength of the conflicts transgender people face arise because incongruence occurs.
- Pre-natal influences, such as gene expression (not genes), endocrines, differing neural maturation rates, aggression potentials may provide triggers but both gender and sexual identities need interaction with others to form and neither can form before birth. Although typical male and female patterns can differ greatly considerable overlap occurs. The great majority form core gender identities which match biological sex, but some do not. Massive neural advances in the first three years lock these in place.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CONSEQUENCES

- Instead of challenging the arguments and views of the professional institutions, gender-critical groups but not most feminists... as is seen on social media, ridicule opposing arguments, dismiss them as the work of “*transgender activists*”, and claim their own analysis gives “*the only credible approach*”. Science is used in attempts to prove that all male to female transsexuals are potentially as great threats to women as every male. Also, that unless disruption occurs gender identity is determined by biological sex.
- Such arguments have been justified by Freudian psychodynamics, where development before the age of three was believed to be a time of seething feelings and little structure was created. Butler perceived that earlier non-directly gender related forces were active, which preceded the creation of the gender role. Traditionally development of gender identity was only believed to start from this age: but that is only the gender role. For gender-critical groups to justify their arguments, all early elements must be denied.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



EVIDENCE

- In the previous presentations, I have shown how distortions of science in key papers, including that by Joel al⁷⁷ are used in attempts to prove that gender identity is purely a social construct. I show how a biased analysis of another influential paper by Dhejne et al^{78 79 80}, and how questionable statistics are used in attempts to prove that male to female transsexuals continue have the same propensity to violently attack women as all males⁸¹. This includes the allegation that the trauma faced by transgender people arises because they themselves produce their own misfortunes. All of these views are vociferously denounced by the lead authors of these papers. They are also directly contradicted in other publications, see for example the review paper by Joel, Swaab, et al, and those of other researchers who are working directly in the field^{82 83 84 85 86}.
- In the rest of this presentation, I will compare Butler's comments with the approach taken by gender-critical groups in the United Kingdom, and with my own work.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



OBJECTIVITY

- Although most people are simply unaware of the massive neural changes and transformations in cognitive processes during early development, the gender-critical movements actively deny their effects. That unawareness has a profound effect.
- Arguments by gender-critical groups that more scientific study is needed cannot be justified, for their own dogmas demand that the already existing science is ignored.
- In the previous presentations, we have already seen that the defamation of clinical experiences, the disregard of the approaches of the professional institutions, including the Memorandum of Understanding, the deriding the support groups who endorse the work of these institutions, the dismissal of responsible research as the work of “*transgender activists*” and the attacks on the personal integrities of people supporting this work, also preclude any objective approach.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



DISMISSAL OF EVIDENCE

- It is entirely appropriate for any group to use scientific evidence to justify its approach. Nevertheless, it is important that without exception, all disagreements and arguments are fully analysed, criticised, and subjected to full academic scrutiny. What is most important is impartiality and objectivity. That has not occurred... In the first section of this particular presentation, I will consider gender-critical approaches, in the second section Christian concerns, and in the third section, the impact these have.
- Impartiality is even more crucial when the great majority of the population do not have any awareness of the processes in early development, and it is perfectly reasonable to presume that, unless a disruption occurs, gender identity must follow biological sex. When that belief is already accepted, as Butler argues: It is only necessary for gender-critical groups to set objectives which discredit the approaches of the professional institutions, dismiss the experiential evidence, and deny the clinical research.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



REFORM OF THE 2004 UNITED KINGDOM GENDER RECOGNITION ACT

- The 2004 United Kingdom Gender Recognition act enabled transexual people to change their legally assigned gender and their birth certificates, so that for all social purposes, with some key exceptions they may marry and be fully accepted in that role.
- In 2004 transgender people were considered as suffering from a medical condition called “*Gender dysphoria*”. This was then understood as disturbance or disorder. Today transgender conditions are considered as personality variations within the normal range of development. While the requirement for a medical diagnosis could previously be argued for; for these reasons the same arguments cannot be justified today.
- The reform of the Gender Recognition Act proposed removing this diagnosis. It was also made clear that there would be no change to the protections against abuse for all women through any reform of the act. These are instead in the 2010 Equality Act.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



FEARS OF INVASION

- The 2010 Equality Act had already allowed for the principle of self-declaration. This identifies “*gender reassignment*” as a protected characteristic. Anyone who states that they are seeking gender reassignment is protected by it, they do not need to show proof of intention or medical assessment. Therefore, the proposed recommendations for reform of the 2004 Gender Recognition Act are limited in effect
- Unfortunately, that is not the impression created by campaigning groups. Reform of the Gender Recognition Act is presented as a charter for unreformed males to destroy the privacy of women and invade women’s spaces intent on sexual abuse
- The protections offered under the 2010 Equality Act are ignored. The route to gender reassignment is presented as if it were a “*cafeteria style*” approach. This raises unjustifiable alarm for no invasions have occurred under the 2010 Equality Act⁸⁷. Also, no invasions have occurred in countries where the reform has already been introduced.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CONTRADICTION

- In all these cases we see confirmation of Butler's arguments that gender critical groups *"mobilize a range of rhetorical strategies from across the political spectrum to maximize the fear of infiltration and destruction"* for everyone in society... not just in the groups.
- Gender critical groups also face a contradiction since their arguments are invalidated if gender identity lies at the core of the personality that is created, or if its core elements are established before identification with the gender role takes place
- Adopting autogynephilic theories of transsexuality resolves this contradiction: for these argue that male to female transsexuality is a perversion or disruption of male homosexuality driven by sublimated sex. The methods of management of personality variations and disruptions are almost opposite to one another. For those people who look, these are easy to see, and different clinical practices are involved

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



PROPOSALS FOR REFORM OF THE GENDER RECOGNITION ACT

- Transgender people are angry because this theory and its pursuit do not correspond to the realities of their own experiences, it identifies them as potential predators, is discredited by mainstream clinicians, and it continues to be pursued to preserve the gender-critical approach
- In 2017, Minister for Equalities Justine Greening outlined proposed reforms to the Gender Recognition Act to de-medicalise the process, with the principle of self-identification included. One of Greening's successors, Penny Mordaunt, affirmed that the consultation on the Gender Recognition Act would come from the starting place that *"transgender women are women"*
- Most people identify men and women through the ways in which people integrate into society. Many people now see that male to female transsexuals integrate seamlessly into society as women and have a proud history of fighting for women's rights.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



DENIAL AND BEHAVIOUR

- Studies and surveys also show that a large majority of women fully accept transgender women as women, and as allies in a common cause⁸⁸. That creates more disputes because gender-critical groups deny this definition. As well as denying gender, they declare that men and women must exclusively be defined by their biological sex.
- Motives are also important. Professional institutions diagnose these conditions as personality variations, where the drives are for identity and the rejection of what is wrong. Gender critical groups define these as being driven by behaviours and desires
- Advances in understanding have transformed attitudes to all gender and sexually variant people from a situation where all gender and sexually variant behaviour regardless of motive was subject to very severe penalties, including death, to one where full gender equality and same-sex marriages are accepted today.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



FALSE BELIEFS

- A threshold is crossed when science begins to be manipulated to attempt to prove a particular dogma, doctrine, or objective, instead of taking an objective approach
- When it succeeds it creates false realities which people can be persuaded to believe in. When this is established, it gives grounds for greater falsehoods to be created. These arise from fears of the other, rather than the realities which an opposing side enacts.
- That occurs in the imposition of a so-called “*gender ideology*” enforced on transgender people by Pope Francis and the gender-critical groups⁸⁹. This alleges that transgender believe they “*change biological sex*”, or “*choose gender*” when it is far from the truth.
- The worst possible response is for transgender people to respond with equally virulent attacks for that simply increases the false belief that has already been created.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



ESCALATION

- This cycle of misinformation is repeated with growing intensity, creating self-reinforcing patterns of abuse and toxicity, which results in tribal violence in many parts of the world
- This is of even greater concern when governments become involved in promoting the same strategies. In the previous sections we see how this is used to justify extreme attacks on transgender people and gender and sexually variant people more generally.
- A standoff is presently being encountered between the present United Kingdom Conservative government and the United Kingdom Women and Equalities Parliamentary Select Committee. Since taking office the present United Kingdom Government has disbanded key consultative groups which could advise them on transgender and LGBT issues, and government ministers have failed to liaise with the Women and Equalities Parliamentary select committee.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



TRANSGENDER DISPUTES, CONVERSION THERAPY AND GOVERNMENT ACTIONS

SUSAN GILCHRIST

PART 4: INTERFERENCE WITH HUMAN RIGHTS LEGISLATION AND GOVERNMENT ACTIONS

[Top](#)

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



STANDOFF

- The current standoff relates both to the reform of the Gender Recognition Act and the proposals to introduce legislation to ban conversion therapy
- A Parliamentary Report published by the Women and Equalities Committee on the 21 December 2021 declared that the gender recognition process is urgently in need of reform, that the failure to reform it is causing real distress, and it strongly criticised the government for its failures to act on the process⁹⁰
- In a further article in the Guardian, Caroline Noakes MP, a Conservative Member of Parliament and the Chair of the Women and Equalities Select Committee asks: *“Why am I being abused for trying to improve the gender recognition process?”*⁹¹
- There is also concern about bias in the consultation papers issued by the government

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



DOCUMENTS

- On the 16th. July 2020, shortly before a key parliamentary debate on gender recognition, unannounced changes were made to the briefing paper on “*Gender Recognition and The Rights of Transgender People*”, (number 08969) in the House of Commons Library. In this new revised document virtually all reference to the protection of transgender children against bullying in schools was left out. Instead of regarding the correct application of hormone therapy as reversible, assertions alleging the dangers of it were made. Both changes were in line with the demands of gender-critical groups⁹²
- On the 3 July 2018, the UK Government Equalities Office (GEO) had previously launched a public consultation on reforming the 2004 Gender Recognition Act⁹³. The results were analysed by Nottingham Trent University. They showed a clear majority in favour of adopting self-identification and reform of the act. The results were also checked against skewing by actions of pressure groups. No distortions were found

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



OUTCOMES

- On the 22 September 2020 The Minister for Women and Equalities, Elizabeth Truss, issued a written statement to parliament saying: *“it is the Government’s view that the balance struck in [the Gender Recognition Act (GRA)] is correct, in that there are proper checks and balances in the system and also support for people who want to change their legal sex.”*⁹⁴ She made it clear that the Government will not change the criteria in the GRA for legal gender recognition, meaning that a system based on self-identification is not being introduced⁹⁵.
- Other than to make the process simpler, there was a great deal of anger about the refusal to implement any change. In a letter to the Chair of the Parliamentary Women and Equalities Committee⁹⁶, Liz Truss, the government minister for Equalities defended this refusal by saying that *“The consultation was just that, a consultation to gain further insight, and not a referendum on what changes should be made”*.⁹⁷

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



EQUALITY AND HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION REMIT

- As a quasi-statutory non-departmental public body established by the Equality Act 2006, the Equality and Human Rights Commission (EHRC) operates independently⁹⁸. It aims to be an expert and authoritative organisation that is a centre of excellence for evidence, analysis and equality and human rights law.
- That demands it must take a truly objective attitude. This means it must take account of gender critical viewpoints, but it must also take full account of the viewpoints of the professional institutions, worldwide authorities, the full range of scientific analysis, experiential evidence, clinical, medical, and psychological expertise.
- That demands the full assertion of the independence of the EHRC from government and other bodies, and that it presents a comprehensive and impartial account of the understandings that exist.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



ANALYSING THE EHRC APPROACH

- If we are to further examine the approach that the Equality and Human Rights Commission has taken, there are three key EHRC documents to consider: these are:
- Morgan, H., Lamprinakou, C., Fuller, F., Albakri, M.: (2020): *“Attitudes to Transgender People August 2020”*: Equality and Human Rights Commission”: Published August 2020⁹⁹
- Equality and Human Rights Commission (2022): *“Response submitted to UK Government consultation: Banning conversion therapy”*: 26 January 2022¹⁰⁰
- EHRC (2022): *“Protecting people from sex and gender reassignment discrimination”* EHRC 4 April 2022¹⁰¹ ([EHRC 2022](#))

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



TRANSFORMATION

- On the 26th. January 2022, the UK Equality and Human Rights Commission (EHRC) published two statements asking government bodies to hold back civil rights reforms affecting trans people. One was sent to the Scottish Cabinet, telling them to pause plans for reforming the Gender Recognition Act (GRA) for transgender people alone, citing the "*polarised debate*", and a lack of "*detailed consideration*" of the issues¹⁰². This is also despite the latest Scottish Government Reports¹⁰³
- Two years beforehand, before the present chair was installed by the Conservative and Unionist party, the EHRC had issued documents which directly contradicted its present statements. These had contained clear recommendations in favour of reform of the GRA and recommended that current regulations should be greatly reduced¹⁰⁴.
- This transformation raises further serious questions about the impact of political appointments on the impartiality of the Commission and the objectivity of its approach.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



ALLEGED LACK OF EVIDENCE

- The current 2022 EHRC statement now declares *“Given the documented lack of evidence about conversion therapy in relation to being transgender, recent attention and litigation on the implications of medical and surgical transition, and the ongoing NHS-commissioned independent review of gender identity services for children and young people led by Dr Hilary Cass OBE, we consider that these matters require further careful and detailed consideration before legislative proposals are finalised and the implications of them can be fully understood”*.
- This EHRC statement is unequivocally condemned by almost every group involved in the care of transgender people¹⁰⁵. Details of these condemnations and the evidence available is given in the notes to these presentations. The great majority of this evidence comes from academic sources, world authorities, professional bodies, clinical and experimental evidence, which the gender critical groups dismiss or ignore¹⁰⁶.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



ATTITUDES TO TRANSGENDER PEOPLE

- In 2020, the previous EHRC report on “*Attitudes to Transgender People*”, showed that on the whole transgender people are well received in the United Kingdom. About three in four (76%) respondents said that prejudice against transgender people was always or mostly wrong. A further 17% thought it was sometimes wrong while 5% said it was rarely or never wrong.
- However, it only takes a minority of the population to attack. A Stonewall report showed that in one year, 41% of transgender people have experienced a hate crime or incident because of their gender identity¹⁰⁷. These figures are not unique, they are replicated in numerous studies carried out by many organisations on a worldwide basis.
- Neither of these 2 reports contradict. They survey different populations. Even though transgender people are mostly well accepted; they stay one of the most vilified groups.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



EHRC DEFINITION OF TRANSGENDER

- In 2011 the EHRC had endorsed its own description of “*transgender*”. It said: “*People who are transgender have gone through all or part of a process (including thoughts or actions) to change the sex they were described as at birth to the gender they identify with or intend to. This might include by changing their name, wearing different clothes, taking hormones, or having gender reassignment surgery*”¹⁰⁸.
- Note that this describes a journey, not an identity. There is nothing about whether transgender conditions arise because of personality variations or disruptions. That is crucial in any definition because it fixes the management methods that must be applied
- It also presumes that the only valid end goal of the process is gender reassignment. That is totally out of date. Many transgender people now identify as non-binary... and management methods appropriate to personality variations must also be employed.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



NON-BINARY TRANSGENDER PEOPLE

- Today many transgender people are refusing to accept or identify themselves with a male or female binary gender identity or role. However, as we have seen, the current advice given by the EHRC refuses to define transgender, or to acknowledge the validity of non-binary gender identities. The gender-critical feminist groups deny the existence of any fundamental sense of gender identity, or of being transgender, by defining all gender variant identities and behaviour as disruptions or disturbances of sex.
- The Public Sector Equality Duty of the UK Equalities and Human Rights Commission, requires the EHRC to ensure that government and public bodies, eliminate discrimination, advance equality for people with protected characteristics and foster good relations for those who do not¹⁰⁹.
- In the Equality Act all actions must be individually justified. Excluding everyone from a resource if some people abuse it or by appearance or identity, is not justified in the act.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



PROTECTED CHARACTERISTICS

- The current Equality Act states that the Protected characteristic of gender reassignment applies to anyone who is “*proposing to undergo, is undergoing or has undergone a process or part of a process to reassign their sex*’. There is no requirement for a trans person to have any kind of medical supervision or intervention in order to be protected from this gender reassignment discrimination. A trans person is protected from the moment he or she makes that declaration.
- That is harmful for many transgender people fight never-ending battles between their allegiance to the identity they possess, and their loyalty to the love and commitments they have made. To keep this intact, the first requirement is to create self-acceptance and self-esteem so that conflicts do not explode, and catastrophic collapse occurs. This is the approach the professional institutions adopt. As it stands the current Equality Act requires people seeking this outcome to lie, to be given the protection they need.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



IDENTIFYING TRANSGENDER

- It should also be easy to tell transgender people apart from others who cross dress or present in the opposite gender. For transgender people the motive is the search for identity and the rejection of what is wrong.
- For most people, defining this term this is relatively simple. Someone who is transgender is someone who has a gender identity which does not conform in whole or in part to that expected by the biological sex
- For gender-critical groups gender identity is presented as a social construct driven by sublimated sexual motives. Therefore, the existence of any transgender or innate or deep-seated gender identity is denied. Under the newly issued EHRC submission on conversion therapy, transgender identities are still not recognised, and in its advice, non-binary people are specifically excluded from the protection of the act¹¹⁰.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



DEFICIENCIES

- Some of these problems are in part due to the legal definitions involved. In the Equality Act 2010, being a man or a woman, is defined as being a male or a female of any age (Equality Act 2010, Section 11 Equality Act 2010, Section 212 (1)). Therefore, according to how gender-critical groups interpret this legislation, biology exclusively determines what is a man or woman. No other is allowed.
- However, most people identify men and women through the ways in which people integrate into society. Many people now see that male to female transsexuals integrate seamlessly into society as women and have a proud history of fighting for the rights of all women. The statement that “*Transgender women are women*” is the definition that many people, including many feminists and transgender people, are happy to use
- Thus: “*Transgender women are not women*”, for gender-critical groups, and the EHRC.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



UPDATING THE EQUALITY ACT

- Another problem with the 2004 Gender Recognition Act and the 2010 Equality Act is that they only recognise binary roles. Gender reassignment is at one pole, biology and sex is at the other. The word “*transgender*” is used to describe someone on a journey between the poles. Under the Act’s binary remit, no other definition can be used.
- That restriction is no justification for the EHRC or anyone to deny the reality of transgender identities, or to refuse the protection of anyone’s human rights because the condition is not listed as a protected characteristic under the 2010 Equality Act. Yet that is implied by the exclusions in the current EHRC advice.
- If the Equality Act is to meet present needs, then in addition to race, religion, etc, both sexuality and gender identity should be protected characteristics under the act.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



2010 UK EQUALITY ACT PROVISIONS

- Major contentions arise because of the rights of access the Equality Act in its present form gives to transgender people to access single-sex spaces, including toilets, refuges, and other areas¹¹¹.
- Section 370 of the act states; *“A provider can deliver separate services for men and women where providing a combined service would not be as effective. A provider can deliver separate services for men and women in different ways or to a different extent where providing a combined service would not be as effective and it would not be reasonably practicable to provide the service otherwise than as a separate service provided differently for each sex. In each case such provision has to be justified”*
- The official guidance to the 2010 Equality Act makes it perfectly clear that access to these spaces must be made on a case-by-case basis, be objectively justified, and be a proportionate means of achieving a legitimate aim^{112 113}

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CURRENT EHRC INTERPRETATION OF THE 2010 EQUALITY ACT

- Despite recent advances, the current EHRC interpretation still states that: “*you are not protected from discrimination unless you propose to change your gender or have done so*”. According to this EHRC directive, you are only protected from discrimination under the 2010 Equality Act if someone who acts against you, thinks you are transsexual, or that you are connected to a transsexual person.
- This new advice states that anybody who seeks to enter spaces usually reserved for women, and is assumed to be a man, is not protected by the Equality Act. However intersex people are covered... by the protected characteristics of disability or sex¹¹⁴.
- Thus, you are only protected from discrimination if you genuinely are seeking complete gender reassignment, or someone rightly or wrongly believes you to be transsexual. This means that all non-binary people are excluded from the protection of the act.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



EXAMPLES 1

- The current EHRC advice gives several examples where it states discrimination would be legally allowed
- Example 1: A community centre has separate male and female toilets. It conducts a survey in which some service users say that they would not use the centre if the toilets were open to members of the opposite biological sex, for reasons of privacy and dignity or because of their religious belief. It decides to introduce an additional gender-neutral toilet. It puts up signs telling all users that they may use either the toilet for their biological sex or to use the gender-neutral toilet if they feel more comfortable doing so.
- The practical effect of this would be to require all male to female transsexuals to use either male toilets or disabled toilets, regardless of their appearance, possession of a gender recognition certificate, or the innocence or appropriateness of their behaviour.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



EXAMPLES 2

- Example 2: A women's clothes shop has changing areas for customers to try on garments in cubicles. The shop decides that it is not necessary to exclude trans women as the privacy and decency of all users can be assured by the provision of those separate cubicles. However, the advice also permits trans women to be excluded where it is most likely to be *“proportionate to exclude, modify or limit their access where a service provider has limited resources and physical space to alter the way the service is provided”...“in the presence of someone they perceive as male”*.
- Such a requirement is understandable in a public changing area where people change together, but this advice provides no incentive to provide such facilities.
- Also, this advice makes it clear that people are allowed to discriminate against all transgender women on perception alone.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



OBJECTIVITY

- The original guidance to the 2010 Equality Act makes it perfectly clear that access to single sex spaces must be on a case-by-case basis, objectively justified, and that providing a single-sex service is a proportionate means of achieving a legitimate aim¹¹⁵
- What constitutes an objective justification depends greatly on whether you understand... in line with the world authorities and professional institutions... that gender and sexually variant conditions are *“personality variations which arise very early development and cannot be changed either by the person concerned or the predations of others in later life”* or they are personality disruptions, where fears of predation are fostered and attacks on women’s identities are presumed. The latter is claimed to be correct by gender-critical groups, who argue that no other credible explanation exists.
- The two examples cited, and others, are blanket condemnations of all members of a group for the alleged abuses of some, and are based on peer group opinion alone

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



LEGALITY

- No advice is acceptable if it is only based on the views of one pressure group. Objective justification requires a full and impartial assessment of all the evidence available. Discrimination by perception is still unlawful, even if any peer group or other organisation who is doing it innocently believes it is following the correct path. Nor can discrimination against a whole group be justified for the claimed abuses by some.
- Any condemnation of a whole group for the alleged abuses of some, which is based on peer group opinion alone is unlikely to satisfy the requirements of the 2010 Equality Act. The only other escape route is to argue, as is done, is that all non-binary transgender activity or condition is not subject to human rights protection under the Act.
- Discriminating against transgender people on the grounds of identity is the same as discrimination on race, religion, etc. Laws should never be used for this purpose.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



PROTECTIONS

- It is hardly necessary to describe the gross and sickening abuses and discrimination that all women face. Identifying as women also makes transgender women subject to these, and even more vulnerable to the attacks and abuses that all women face. Therefore, the issues concern women's safety and the side that trans women are on.
- The current protections in the 2010 Equality Act, protect all women; trans women included. They require objective reasons to be given for any exclusion and are based on abuse, not identity. The government has said that these protections will not be changed, and no trans person I know would wish to see these protections reduced. The only changes that trans people would like to see relate to transition. Gender-critical groups who make the claims that trans women want all restrictions abolished, that they attack women's identities, and that they impose the same threats to women as all males, are allegations which insert much of the venom into the present disputes.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



SENSITIVITIES

- These are issues where enormous sensitivities are involved. While the advice given in the current EHRC document seems reasonable and logical, it ignores the attempts by gender-critical groups to force a diagnosis of autogynephilic transsexuality which has been discredited by most clinicians onto transgender people¹¹⁶.
- This theory presumes a personality disruption and sexual motivation. It ignores female to male transsexuals. No equivalent paraphilia for these people has been identified. It also fails to deal with non-binary roles, and it does not provide adequate explanations for the wide range of transgender conditions that exist. It does not match the lived experiences of transgender people. There is a great deal of anger among transgender people over an incorrect diagnosis being imposed upon them with the aim of preserving a gender-critical approach, instead of protecting transgender people's lives.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



WITHDRAWAL

- I conclude that this EHRC advice is based entirely on the views of those in gender-critical feminist movements who regard transgender conditions as personality disruptions driven by behaviour and desire. Nowhere in it do I find any representations of the views of the professional institutions who regard transgender conditions as personality variations driven by the search for identity and rejection of what is wrong. The motives and methods of management are almost opposite to each other, and considerable harm will occur if this advice is pursued.
- The refusal to provide any meaningful definition of a transgender person, the fears created by the consequent obscuration, and advice which excludes all members of one group for the unproven abuses of some, leads to the scapegoating of all transgender people, and is not acceptable on any terms. I conclude therefore that all of this advice and also, the submission on conversion therapy should immediately be withdrawn.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



EHRC RESPONSE TO THE GOVERNMENT CONSULTATION ON BANNING CONVERSION THEORY

- This response includes the following statements: *“The consultation document contains no clear definition of what will amount to “conversion therapy” caught by its proposals, nor of the meaning of “transgender” – a term which has no clear legal meaning, is potentially wider than the concept of gender reassignment in current UK law and is understood by different people in different ways”. This is of particular importance given the lack of evidence about conversion therapy in relation to being transgender.*
- *Given this, we recommend that legislation should initially focus on banning conversion therapy attempting to change a person’s sexual orientation, where the evidence and impacts are clearer. Legislation to ban conversion therapy attempting to change a person to or from being transgender should follow, once more detailed and evidence-based proposals are available which can be properly scrutinised¹¹⁷.*

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



DUTY OF CARE

- As a quasi-statutory body whose remit is the protection of human rights for all people, it is essential that the EHRC takes a fully researched and totally impartial approach¹¹⁸.
- It seems that experiential evidence is being dismissed in these EHRC statements and policies, as well as the scientific consensus adopted by world authorities, and the viewpoints of the professional institutions in pursuit of a gender-critical approach¹¹⁹
- Other concerns arise from the ending of government consultative committees on LGBT matters, and standoffs with the Women and Equalities Parliamentary committee¹²⁰.
- The interpretation in this current EHRC guidance excluding all non-binary transgender people regardless of motive, from the protections of the Equality Act, is a failure of the duty of care that anyone seeking protection of their human rights must expect.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



DEFICIENCIES

- Because it is a quasi-statutory body with a duty to protect equality and human rights, one would have thought that establishing these definitions using clear and objective analysis would be the responsibility of the EHRC itself¹²¹. Therefore, it is astonishing that the EHRC attempts to place the blame for failing to define the terms “*transgender*” and “*conversion therapy*” on the government consultation process.
- To state that the term “*transgender*” is a “*term which has no clear legal meaning, is potentially wider than the concept of gender reassignment in current UK law and is understood by different people in different ways*”, then to judge it without declaring their working definition allows for obscuration and the misrepresentation of facts
- To my mind, these statements are also major failures of the duty of care required of the Equality and Human Rights Commission and the protecting of human rights.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



USE OF EVIDENCE

- The quasi-statutory nature of the EHRC¹²² means that it is crucial for us to challenge the statements which the EHRC has presented to the public consultation on banning conversion therapy. The first repeatedly states: “*Given the documented lack of evidence about conversion therapy in relation to being transgender*”. Using this it argues that the ban on conversion therapy be delayed for transgender people, but that a ban on conversion therapy for lesbian and gay people should immediately proceed¹²³.
- The EHRC response also notes that a key element of the evidence base underpinning the current proposals on conversion therapy is the UK Government’s 2017 National LGBT survey¹²⁴. However, a recent government paper “*The prevalence of conversion therapy in the UK*”, published on the 29th. October 2021¹²⁵ today alleges that there are significant deficiencies in the conclusions of that 2017 survey. The EHRC currently advises caution in using its results. That also seems evident in its submission¹²⁶

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



HISTORY

- It should be noted that this 2017 survey strongly advocated major reform of the Gender Recognition Act and banning of conversion therapies. A government action plan was created. This was strongly supported by the EHRC at the time, but under the present administration that plan was abandoned, and the planned reforms of the Gender Recognition Act are not now to take place.
- The UK government consultation document on *“Conversion Therapy: An Evidence Assessment and Quantitative Study”* commissioned from Coventry University and published on the 29 October 2021¹²⁷ is cited only once in the EHRC submission¹²⁸. This states that *“Given the lack of evidence that conversion therapy is effective in changing a person’s sexual orientation or gender identity, its statistical association with negative health outcomes, and the evidence of risk of powerful community and belief”*, demands that the individual is able to give *“informed consent”*, by knowing its implications.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



EVIDENCE

- However, note that the statement about *“lack of evidence”* in the original report can now be read in the present EHRC response to have an opposite meaning to that which the original statement described. The EHRC presents little evidence. No documentation is cited in the submissions which would prove its allegation that: *“Given the documented lack of evidence about conversion therapy in relation to being transgender”* is correct.
- Nor does allegation this sit well with condemnations by the Royal College of Psychiatrists¹²⁹, the Memorandum of Understanding issued by all the other major United Kingdom professional institutions concerned with transgender matters¹³⁰, the condemnation by the American Psychiatric Association¹³¹, the World Professional Association for Transgender Health¹³² the World Health Organisation¹³³, The UN Committee on Human Rights¹³⁴ and others¹³⁵, all of whom assert that applying conversion therapy to transgender people is not only ineffective: it can have serious harmful effects.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



RESEARCH

- The same paper by Coventry University, commissioned by the Government on “*An assessment of the evidence on conversion therapy for sexual orientation and gender identity*”¹³⁶ states that the main evidence from research programmes on conversion therapy for gender identity comes only from 4 studies, 3 from the USA and 1 systematic review of international evidence.
- This paper comments on the limitations of existing studies on all forms of conversion therapy, however it agrees that this is the highest possible, given the moral and ethical problems of engaging in truly randomised trials and blind based studies.
- Despite these limitations the report by Coventry University shows that there is a great deal of evidence to highlight the potential harm that conversion therapy can cause¹³⁷.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



EXPERIENTIAL AND OTHER EVIDENCE

- I have already described how evidence and science is being used in a partisan way in the previous parts of these presentations, and at the start of this part.
- In addition to this research, there is also a mass of clinical and experiential evidence gathered by clinicians, support groups, religious groups, and others who confirm its harmful effects. For a comprehensive review of this evidence see Gilchrist, S. (2021a): *“Gender Identity, Feminism, and Transgender People”*¹³⁸. Also Gilchrist, S. (2020b): *“Responsibility in Transgender Disputes”*¹³⁹:
- Hundreds of religious leaders, including Desmond Tutu and the Chief Rabbi in the UK have called for a total ban on transgender, lesbian, and gay conversion therapy¹⁴⁰. A recent letter from senior religious leaders following the government’s decision not to proceed with the ban on conversion therapy makes the same point.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



GLOBAL INTERFAITH COMMISSION 21-22 MARCH 2022

- The 2022 Global Interfaith Commission on LGBT Lives Conference was held in the prestigious Locarno Suite of the Foreign Office. It was attended by over 150 senior religious leaders, academics, and lay leaders from around the world with the help of the Foreign Office to agree some Safeguarding Principles to Protect LGBT+ Lives.
- The conference looked at how this can be done this legally, before then receiving clear evidence of the harm LGBT+ people suffer in cultures and settings that are hostile to them. The principles were announced at 6:30pm on Tuesday 22 March after an Act of Commitment led by the Dean of St Paul's¹⁴¹.
- The commission issued a clear statement confirming the need to avoid harm and ban all forms of conversion therapy for all lesbian, gay and transgender people¹⁴².

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



OUTCRY

- The universal condemnation of the EHRC submission on the banning of conversion therapy, and the raising of awareness of evidence from other sources, had almost certainly meant until the recent government statements denying it, that the banning of conversion theory for transgender people would be included in the forthcoming bill¹⁴³
- In a letter sent to Jayne Ozanne, the director of the Ozanne Foundation on the 2 March 2022, the Member of Parliament and Equalities minister Mike Freer said that a conversion therapy ban would cover religious practices and all LGBT+ people.
- Government proposals, he said, mean that people “*will still be able to access support and counsel from religious leaders*”, but that any activity “*carried out with the intention of changing a person’s sexual orientation or changing them from or to being transgender will be captured*”. There is still the issue of what “*informed consent*” means.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



MORE SOURCES

- The Ozanne foundation has published another report by senior legal counsel on recommendations on effectively legislating for a UK ban on Conversion Therapy¹⁴⁴
- The HRC Foundation has published a survey confirming the crushing condemnation of this practice by the major professional organisations on a worldwide basis^{145 146}
- There are many books and articles available where transgender people write about their experiences.
- One book is *“This is my Body: Hearing the theology of Transgender Christians”*. This is particularly relevant to these presentations. Further books in this series provide guidance about supporting transgender people in a Christian context¹⁴⁷. Other books include: *“Trans Britain: Our Journey from the Shadows”* and *“Heaven Come Down: The story of a transgender disciple”*¹⁴⁸. Full bibliographies are available elsewhere¹⁴⁹.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



WHERE DOES THIS ALLEGATION COME FROM?

- To find the source for these allegations it is necessary to look at certain feminist organisations and gender-critical groups. Transgender Trend¹⁵⁰ Woman's Place¹⁵¹ and the LGB Alliance¹⁵² are three of the most prominent organisations.
- All endorse the theory of autogynephilic transsexuality to explain the condition. This identifies transsexuality as a perversion or disruption of male homosexuality. Therefore, homosexuality is considered a personality variation and transsexuality a personality disruption. With this theory, transsexuality is then amenable to conversion therapy, but homosexuality is not. And this is the justification their attacks.
- Both autogynephilic theorists and gender-critical feminists believe that gender identity forms by social conditioning alone. That confines their analyses to the development of the gender role. The prior existence of the core gender identity is denied. Therefore, crucial features which occur in the first three years are ignored.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



AGGRAVATION

- In a June 2020 report, the European Commission classified the legal procedures for gender recognition of 28 European countries into 5 categories based on the barriers to access. The Gender Recognition Act 2004 came second from bottom with "*intrusive medical requirements*", which lag behind international human rights standards¹⁵³.
- The United Kingdom is a member of the Council of Europe, which is responsible for overseeing the judgements of the European Court of Human Rights. When the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe met in January 2022, it singled out a small collection of countries, Russia, Turkey, Poland, Hungary, and the United Kingdom, as the most inhospitable to LGBTI rights.¹⁵⁴
- This is also when the government public consultation on legally banning all forms of conversion therapy to change gender identity or sexual orientation was taking place¹⁵⁵

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CAMPAIGNS

- The quiet withdrawal of documents and their replacement with ones more amenable to gender-critical approaches, the refusal to proceed with reform of the Gender Recognition act, the standoff and disregard of the views of the Parliamentary Women and Equalities Committee¹⁵⁶, the disbanding of LGBTI consultative groups and the selective nature of the evidence produced by the EHRC, all strongly suggest that a campaign is being mounted by the present UK government
- As the government Equalities Minister Liz Truss has power to make appointments to the independent UK Equality and Human Rights Commission. She has since made appointments of people who endorse the legitimacy of gender critical beliefs¹⁵⁷
- As great a concern as any transgender matter, is the apparent manipulation of science, evidence, and public opinion to enforce any unequal human rights documentation or any partisan approach.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



ACADEMIC INPUTS

- One of the most prominent academic advocates for gender-critical theories is Kathleen Stock, formerly professor of Philosophy at Surrey University¹⁵⁸. I examine her approach in my other writing¹⁵⁹ and her condemnation of Stonewall in separate literature^{160 161}. While she has every right in academic circles to present a gender-critical argument, I believe, with 600 other academics, that her performance on social media goes far beyond academic probity and it presents a closed mind which seeks to discredit any other view¹⁶².
- Another prominent campaigner for the gender-critical viewpoint is Debbie Hayton¹⁶³, herself a male to female transsexual. I observe that Debbie has caused a great deal of anger among transgender people by dismissing Stonewall¹⁶⁴ and fellow transgender people who disagree with her as the actions of mobs, activists, and by her ridiculing of personal integrities of those who hold any opposing view¹⁶⁵.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



RESPONSES

- Predictably Kathleen Stock and Debbie Hayton have reacted to these statements, and those by Butler, by denying that the United Kingdom is following any fascist trend¹⁶⁶. However fascist trends develop through the creation of false realities which are built on the selective use of science and or on a partisan or populist approach.
- That pattern is now seen in the disregard of the approaches of professional and world authorities, ignoring the UK Memorandum of Understanding, discounting of clinical experiences, deriding the support groups who endorse the work of these institutions, dismissal of responsible research as the work of “*transgender activists*”, attacks on people’s integrities, impacts of the massive changes in neurological and cognitive capabilities, with the transformations in social interactions in the first three years of life.
- Sadly, these absences also appear in the recent EHRC documents and advice.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



EXPERIENCES

- I accept Debbie Hayton's attempts to get male to female transsexuals accepted in the gender-critical feminist movements, but there is a very strong contrast between the degree of acceptance that is given and the virulence of these attacks.
- This is not just about the definition of women as "*adult biological females*" or the use of the word "*women*", it is about the differences in motives that each diagnosis expects.
- When transgender conditions are treated as personality variations, gender identities for everybody form the same way. The great majority develop core gender identities that are in harmony with the biological sex, but some do not. This demands a total respect for every person's experience and rights including the right to privacy, and to separate treatment, where needed, over matters which concern biology and sex. It does not support a blanket condemnation of everyone on the grounds of biological sex.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



FEMINIST CHALLENGES

- Many radical feminist groups and individuals interpret transgender conditions as perversions or disruptions of sexual desires. Gender-critical groups go a step further by viewing gender identity either as a purely socially learned construct, nothing more than an ill-defined idea, or being synonymous with sex¹⁶⁷.
- Autogynephilic theories continue this approach by regarding sexual identity as a personality variation, but male to male transsexuality as a perversion or disruption of an original course. In common with other groups, this identifies transgender objectives in terms of enforcing of power over women where subverted sexual motives are the driving forces, and where women's identities are placed under threat¹⁶⁸.
- To justify this approach gender-critical groups must deny or disprove any changes in neural maturation patterns, and how gender identity forms in the first three years of life.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



WOMEN'S FEARS AND RIGHTS

- What must be an absolute priority is the safety of all women, including their protection against violence, abuse, and discrimination. Evidence of these abuses, and the lack of confidence in the police and the courts abound. Actions by groupings such as those be the *“Me Too”* movement have become very valuable tools in exposing some of these abuses, but that may still only expose the tip of the iceberg that exists.
- It should not be in the least surprising that many women are suspicious of the motives of male to female transsexuals who seek to integrate fully as women into society. The concerns expressed by groups such as *“A Woman’s Place”* and *“Fair Play for Women”* including the arguments and theories they put forward must be taken very seriously, but that also demands that such arguments can survive detailed scientific scrutiny.
- There should be no place any approach which promotes a partisan view.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CURRENT EHRC ADVICE

- We have seen that the most recent EHRC statement on *“Protecting people from sex and gender reassignment discrimination”*¹⁶⁹, published on the 4 April 2022 does not alter the protective legislation already in the 2010 Equality Act, but it changes its effect.
- The advice given in the 2010 Equality act adopted the starting point that transgender people were genuine in their attempts to respect women’s identities and integrate seamlessly into society. Thus, the advice given with this act condemned abusive and inappropriate behaviour: it did not presume that all transgender people are a threat.
- The current advice now implies a blanket point of view that all transgender people are potential threats. People may now be more easily excluded just because they are transgender, or look transgender, and those with Gender Recognition Certificates are also denied the protections offered to them in the 2004 Gender Recognition Act¹⁷⁰.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CONSEQUENCES

- The reasons the present Government gives for refusing to include transgender people in its legislation on the banning of conversion therapy are set out in the current EHRC statements where it says: *“we recommend that legislation should initially focus on banning conversion therapy attempting to change a person’s sexual orientation, where the evidence and impacts are clearer. Legislation to ban conversion therapy attempting to change a person to or from being transgender should follow, once more detailed and evidence-based proposals are available which can be properly scrutinised¹⁷¹”*.
- This statement cannot be justified when the massive amount of evidence already available is denied or ignored. I consider that the Government should without delay proceed to banning conversion therapy for transgender people. Also, that present EHRC submission on conversion therapy and its advice on transgender people be instantly withdrawn and substituted with those where objective assessments are made.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CONCERNS

- Any policy which excludes every transgender person from the protection of any Act for the alleged abuses of some or identity should never be in any Act. That should apply to abuses alone. I believe that excluding by identity is not lawful in the 2010 Equality Act.
- In my own experience of reconciliation work in divided societies, I find that much discrimination is mistakenly carried out by ordinary decent people on presumptions of false belief. I do not seek to discredit the genuineness of anyone's approach
- Therefore, it is crucial that all approaches, including gender-critical approaches are fully, fairly, and impartially examined. Universities and academic institutions are bastions of free speech, but they are also guardians of scholarship and objectivity, thus their role must be call out any approaches based on the manipulation of science, personal attacks, and abuse. It includes statements any Prime Minister makes¹⁷²

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



USAGE

- Probably the most pressing concern is over how the current advice is used. Clearly those who regard transgender conditions to be the product of personality disruptions, with fears of predation will take a very different approach from those who consider them to be personality variations, where there are not
- A key issue relates to access to spaces normally reserved for either sex. Their advice now states that anybody who seeks to enter spaces usually reserved for women, and is assumed to be a man, is not protected by the Equality Act. However, intersex people alone are included... but by the protected characteristics of disability or sex¹⁷³.
- The advice given by the EHRC makes it clear that non-binary transgender people do not come under any protected characteristic. It is my conclusion that the EHRC believes that its duty is only to protect protected characteristics, not all human rights.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



WARNINGS

- In her 2021 Guardian Article Butler wrote: *“The anti-gender movement is not a conservative position with a clear set of principles. No, as a fascist trend, it mobilizes a range of rhetorical strategies from across the political spectrum to maximize the fear of infiltration.... It does not strive for consistency, for its incoherence is part of its power”*.
- I believe that the present UK government has realised Butlers fears through its actions and its support of organisations who I argue, have used selective evidence, ignored expert advice, spread misinformation by misrepresenting research, used misdiagnoses, created unnecessary fears by ignoring protections for women that already exist, and by rubbishing or ridiculing views and personal integrities those who disagree with them,
- In June 2022 the UK government had intended to host an international conference on these issues. Given its present record, that would have been a cause for concern¹⁷⁴

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



IMPACTS

- The promotion of any theory which presents transgender people as potential predators, and dangers to women's identities, not just by disregarding, but also with the active rubbishing of the approaches of the professional institutions and other groups who disagree, and who present the opposite view of transgender people as allies and fellow travellers in the fight for women's rights, must not be accepted in any circumstances.
- The obscuration and fears created by the EHRC documentation and by gender-critical feminist groups, including the refusal of the EHRC to identify the meaning of transgender in any way which is now recognised in medical science, together with the creation of unsubstantiated fears of hordes of abusive males being granted unrestricted access to women's spaces, creates unwarranted concerns. It heightens the very real fears of sexual attacks, together with the coercions and the abuses which all women face. It is I believe, irresponsible, and it creates alarm in the way that Butler describes.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



IMPACTS

- There are enormous advances in cognitive and neural development from the moment of birth however children do not become socially aware until about three years. For gender-critical groups who define gender identity purely as social constructs the influences of any prior developments, including the core gender identity, must be denied. Gender identity is alleged to be formed by the gender role alone. The partisan use of science, the disregard of the scientific consensus agreed by the professional institutions, using a dogma that no other credible solution exists, fundamentally denies any objective or scientific approach.
- Gender-critical groups identify transgender conditions as personality disruptions with underlying sexual motives, the professional institutions and world authorities define them as personality variations where the drive is for identity. Motives and methods of management are almost opposite to each other. The gender critical advice denies responsibility, for great harm can be done when the wrong methods are applied.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



IMPACTS

- Enormous, changes and advances in the understanding, acceptability and nature of gender and sexually variant conditions have taken place from the 1960's onwards when all forms of gender and sexually variant behaviour was subject to severe social and legal sanctions, often with catastrophic results, to today's acceptance of all loving and responsible gender and sexually variant behaviour, resulting in the endorsement of same-sex marriages in many parts of the world
- Treating male homosexuality as a personality variation allows all of the scientific and experiential advances in this understanding since the 1960's of gender and sexual variation to be accepted. Treating transsexuality as a perversion or a personality disruption, not only misdiagnoses transsexuality; it means that all these advances gained since the 1960's, together with the massive amount of existing evidence which condemns this approach is denied. Unchecked, it leads to the creation of false realities and to the scapegoating of transgender people by society, and by the Church, with horrific results.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



FAILURES

- I believe that the failures I have outlined in the approach of the United Kingdom Equality and Human Rights commission do not just betray transgender people, they are the failures of the very body whose remit is to provide Equality and Human Rights protection for all of us, no matter what the issues that concern us may be.
- It is an absolute duty of the EHRC to produce totally impartial documents. I can find little evidence that it has taken heed of anything other than gender-critical views.
- I also believe it is evident that government intervention has caused the EHRC to produce a report which is intended to satisfy the government's own political and social agendas in regard to conversion therapy and transgender people. That I consider is a betrayal by this government at the highest level. It is also a betrayal of the international obligations which this country is expected to respect.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



TRANSGENDER DISPUTES, CONVERSION THERAPY AND GOVERNMENT ACTIONS

SUSAN GILCHRIST

PART 5: RELIGIOUS INTERACTIONS AND IMPACTS

[Top](#)

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CHRISTIAN APPROACHES

- In this examination I have paid particular attention to the Christian Churches and other religious organisations to gender and sexually variant people, since these impose more barriers of theology and divine providence on any objective approach
- In Part 2, it is shown that a moral duality was encountered in First Century Judaism, whereby people who engage in transgender and same-sex relationships which are given in love and conform to the highest moral standards of society would be highly regarded. However, those who seek to break these rules through inappropriate sexual activity and immoral behaviour were very strongly censured for these acts.
- Also, in Part 2 we traced the development of Christianity from its Jewish roots to present day life. We saw that a paradigm shift has occurred around the end of the first millennium where the condemnation of gender and sexually variant behaviour, which condemned the abuses of honour, power, and sex, turned the condemnation of all sexual acts

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CHRISTIAN ATTITUDES

- In common with gender-critical feminist groups, this paradigm shift has led many Christian groups to misdiagnose all forms of gender and sexually variant behaviour as perversions or disruptions from what is seen as the original divinely ordained course
- We have also seen in Part 7, that attempts to suppress or deny this often catastrophically fail, since there is nothing to replace this identity, and that leaves a vacuum inside. The more this is fought the stronger it becomes. That is also why methods of management appropriate to personality variations and not disruptions must be applied
- It is also why approaches such as “*Conversion Therapy*” or “*Reparative Therapy*” are so disastrous, for they simply reinforce what people, often for many years, have been trying to do for themselves, without success. The guilt felt when that fails can be enormous, not least because of the misdiagnosis that for centuries has been applied

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CRIMINALISATION AND SUPPRESSION

- The denial of experiential evidence by centuries of criminalisation and condemnation meant that this teaching could not be challenged. That only changed in the 1960's with the legalisation of homosexuality. From that time people could see for themselves the full range of behaviour. In Parts 1-5 we saw the transformations that have occurred.
- For many religious groups religious dogmas often take precedence over science and experience. The effect of the paradigm shift means that the current traditional church doctrine is the doctrine of a mediaeval Church. Pope Francis shows great empathy to transgender people, but his continuing misdiagnoses means that his American Bishops use this misdiagnosis to erase transgender identities... and demand they repent.
- Many Christian groups and Churches advocate conversion therapy for all gender and sexually variant people in the genuine and sincere belief that this approach is correct.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CURRENT CONDEMNATIONS

- A large number of Christian groups, churches and countries today accept this traditional Church teaching, which condemns, without exception all gender and sexually variant behaviour, regardless of purpose, as intrinsically disordered, acts of grave depravity and a falling from grace, which pursues inappropriate sex and unacceptable acts.
- Paragraph 6 in the EHRC submission on conversion therapy states: *“Encouraging people to comply with religious doctrine that requires refraining from certain types of sexual activity should not fall within the definition of conversion therapy either”*¹⁷⁵ and Paragraph 28 states: *“This offence should not capture communication such as casual conversations, exchanges of views or private prayer”*¹⁷⁶.
- The EHRC submission states that all of these practices should be excepted from any prohibition under the banner of *“informed consent”*.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



EFFECTIVENESS OF THE CONVERSION THERAPY BILL

- Under the 2010 Equality Act it is not necessary for discrimination to be intentional to be unlawful. The problem with these exclusions is that the practice of conversion therapy is usually carried out in a religious context with genuine intent where private prayer, which focuses on *“getting rid of this evil”*, is often used as the primary means of attack.
- Obtaining *“informed consent”* is going to be very difficult when people are already conditioned by Christian doctrine to believe that these activities are fearfully sinful, and unlikely to be easily convinced that conversion therapies are harmful acts
- Adopting any EHRC recommendations which argue for total exclusion of these elements in any legislation, would give a carte blanche for the same conversion therapy practices to continue, and greatly damage the effectiveness of the act.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



FAILURE AND AVOIDANCE

- In the last 70 years there have been many advances in the understanding of how gender and sexual identities develop. I consider that the failure to take full note of these advances are major evasions of responsibility by the Christian Church
- I also believe that the Church of England's attempts to resolve these differences through its policy of "*good disagreement*" has become a way of avoiding these impacts of science and the severe consequences that misdiagnosing these conditions create.
- That avoidance is illustrated in part 6, where I discuss the Church of England Living in Love and Faith Programme. The brief set by the archbishops, demanded that it only considered theology: "*as the Church of England has received it*". The 2017 report of the Church England "*Bishop's Reflection Group on Sexuality*" confined any change to that of: "*Interpreting the existing law and guidance to permit maximum freedom within it, without changes to the law, or the doctrine of the Church*"¹⁷⁷.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CONSEQUENCES OF AVOIDANCE

- This brief prohibits the essential re-examination of theology! The outcomes from the Living in Love and Faith Programme are a book and a set of resources which very fully reflect the latest understandings of gender and sexuality. These include stories and study material, which very completely emphasise the strength and stability of these relationships and need for the full inclusion of LGBTI people in the Christian Church.
- Yet set against this in the resource material is a theology which in essence reflects the theology as developed by the medieval church. As I describe in part six of these presentations, the inadequate use of history and sociology in the LLF programme, the brief that was set, and the hurt and the serious concerns of those LGBTI people who actually took part in its production, do not suggest the creation of an objective or impartial approach. The same misdiagnosis of transgender conditions, which rely on an identical theology, are expressed by Pope Francis in the Roman Catholic Church.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CHURCH APOLOGIES

- In the LLF book, the Archbishops of Canterbury and York said: *“As soon as we begin to consider questions of sexual identity and behaviour, we need to acknowledge the huge damage and hurt that has been caused where talk of truth, holiness and discipleship has been wielded harshly and not ministered as a healing balm... We have caused, and continue to cause, hurt and unnecessary suffering. For such acts, each of us, and the Church collectively, should be deeply ashamed and repentant. As archbishops, we are personally very sorry where we have contributed to this”*
- Sadly, the Archbishops are entirely correct about the hurt that has been caused by these toxic disputes. Until the middle of the last century the development of gender identity was attributed exclusively to the gender role. From the 1960’s onwards it was realised that an underlying core gender identity was first created. This gave a sense of belonging alone. Expected behaviour, motives and management methods are almost opposite to each other. Apologies are insufficient. This demands a rethink of Church doctrines and roles.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CHALLENGES FROM GHANA

- In part 7 of these presentations, we noted that in 2021 the Ghanaian parliament put forward a bill which claims to promote “*proper family values*”. It seeks to increase jail terms to up to a decade and force some to undergo “*conversion therapy*”, where attempts are made to change people's sexuality. It also makes cross-dressing and public displays of same-sex affection punishable by fines or detention, and it makes the distribution of material deemed pro-LGBT by news organisations or websites illegal.
- In the light of his welcome to LGBT people, and his frankly worded apology in the foreword to the LLF book, what can the Archbishop of Canterbury meaningfully say to the Anglican Bishops in Ghana who support this bill, or to the Global Anglican Futures Movement (GAFCON)¹⁷⁸, when the Church of England itself refuses to consider any changes to a doctrine which GAFCON supports, and upon which the traditional Christian condemnations of all gender and sexually variant people are based?

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



SCAPEGOATING

- People challenge gender for many reasons. For transgender people, it is the search for identity and the rejection of what is wrong. Some Christian Churches and those who reject transgender identities interpret this instead as desire driven sexually motivated behaviour where dangers of predation, perversion, and power over others are presumed.
- As in Ghana, this second identification has led the Christian Church to collude with, and often to lead, the secular scapegoating of gender and sexually variant people in society.
- From the end of the first millennium, driven by the Inquisition, extreme penalties have been applied. I have described some of these in parts 4 and 6 of these presentations. How serious these can become is seen when Patriarch Kirill of Moscow and all Russia, head of the Russian Orthodox Church, blames the Ukraine war in part on pressure to accept gay pride parades. Putin condemns “*gender freedoms*” in the same way¹⁷⁹.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



THE CHURCH OF ENGLAND AND THE ROMAN CATHOLIC CHURCH

- There have many reports on gender and sexuality prepared by the Church of England. All of them are based on theology “*as the Church of England has received it*”, which is broadly in harmony with that of the Roman Catholic Church
- None of them have succeed in creating a satisfactory outcome. Sadly, all of the efforts that have been put into the LLF programme are unlikely to succeed, because exactly the same constraint: “*as the Church of England has received it*” was put into its brief.
- At a meeting held on 24 March 2022, the Church of England House of Bishops “*reviewed attempts to explore questions of gender identity and transition and agreed to seek and commission an appropriate group to take this work forward.*”¹⁸⁰
- There will be no resolution before both Churches reconsider the doctrines they teach.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



ACTIONS

- Today many Christian Churches and feminist groups proclaim that they fully welcome transgender people and that they support full inclusion in their organisation or group.
- However, there cannot be any true inclusion, when that acclaim is considered alongside their refusals to reconsider their Christian doctrines or their gender theories, when these identify all gender and sexually variant people, in the case of the Christian churches... or for gender-critical movements, transgender people only, as potential predators driven by sexual motives, and which attack family values. Approaches which, Pope Francis¹⁸¹ (and Vladimir Putin¹⁸²) asserts, identify transgender people as engaging in actions that create threats which are equated to a nuclear attack.
- There can be little hope of resolution when tactics such as the defiance of science, the hurling of abuse, and the discrediting of experiences are used to promote these views.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



PART 3: STRANGE BEDFELLOWS

- Both gender-critical movements and the traditional teaching of the Christian Church, criticise or condemn transgender people in the same way.
- Both consider all forms of gender variant behaviour to be personality disruptions that are driven by potentially sublimated sexually based motives of behaviour and desire. Although these groups may recognise that actual abuses may only be carried out by a small minority, they place all male to female transgender people in the same category as all males, who are counted as potential predators, intent on sexual abuse.
- Both groups use science to try to justify their positions. As with gender-critical movements, religious campaigns also often descend into personal attacks and to the discrediting or rubbishing of all other views, as is observed in the reactions to the Church of England's Living in Love and Faith Programme, and elsewhere¹⁸³

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



IMPACT AND FALSE REALITY

- Clearly correctly diagnosing transgender conditions, (and gender and sexually variant conditions more generally) is far more important than just matters of gender or sex.
- Gender-critical groups very strongly assert that they are not transphobic and that they fully accept all transgender people, (under their own terms), into their ranks. Debbie Hayton is a very strong advocate for this point of view
- However, if these groups are to succeed in maintaining that position, they must be able to justify it. I have examined the arguments they put forward as completely and as objectively as I can. I find the disregard of key evidence, the use of a discredited theory, the ridiculing of the approaches of professional institutions, clinicians and world authorities are all primed to create “*false realities*” which fall far below the standards of any professional approach.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



TRANSFORMATIONS

- The first “*false reality*” does not need to be created because it is already present in the traditional teaching of the Christian Church. We saw this came from the paradigm shift in Christian teaching near the end of the first millennium, because of the adoption of a traditional Church teaching that condemns all forms of gender and sexually variant behaviour, regardless of motive, as acts of grave depravity driven by desires of sex.
- It is easy to create other “*false realities*”. For most people the normal expectation is that gender identity should follow biological sex. However, for transgender people the discord between the core gender identity and what biology expects leads to inescapable conflicts. In people whose core gender identity conforms to what biology expects the only evidence for the core gender identity lies in the security of gender that every person possesses. This sense of certainty makes it hard for others to understand the trauma that transgender people face.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CONSEQUENCES

- This lack of awareness means that gender-critical groups only need to discredit or deny the advances in understanding since the 1960's about how gender identities develop, and to launch campaigns to discredit or dismiss the experiential evidence that now exists. I believe that further false realities have been created by gender-critical groups.
- The first of these is the misrepresentation of proposals to reform the 2004 Gender recognition act to persuade the general public that all protection of women's rights will disappear and that women will face massive increases in abusive attacks.
- The second is the disregard of the views of the professional institutions, together with the adoption of a discredited theory, to convince the same public that transgender conditions are personality perversions or disruptions driven by underlying sexual motives, with the increased fears of predation that this creates.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



FALSE REALITIES

- The third is the attempts to use existing scientific papers to prove that male to female transsexuals pose the same or a greater threat to women's safety as would every rampant male, despite contrary evidence and the objections of authors concerned.
- The fourth is created by the abuse and personal attacks associated with the statements that the gender-critical approach is the only credible approach
- This is a conflict where the professional institutions regard gender and sexually variant conditions as *“naturally expected variations of the human condition, intrinsic to the personality created, arising very early in development and cannot be changed either by the individual concerned or by the predations of others in subsequent life”*. while gender-critical groups consider them to be *“personality disruptions driven by sexual motives which attack women's identities, and where threats of predation occur”*.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CONSEQUENCES

- Diagnosing transgender conditions as personality variations in line with the professional institutions, means recognising an inwardly focussed search for identity and the rejection of what is wrong, it poses no threat to anyone, and it is not about behaviour or sex.
- Gender-critical feminist groups, who pursue diagnoses of personality variations identify the driving forces behind them with behaviour, attacks on women's identities and sexual desires. The fears this creates among women of predation, abuse, and immoral sex, with the vilification and scapegoating that transgender people already face, are greatly increased by strong gender-critical attacks.
- The methods of management are almost opposite to each other. Great harm can be done when the wrong one is used. The current EHRC advice allows people to discriminate against transgender people on a populist vote. Expertise and science are denied.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



GOVERNMENT REVIEW

- In April 2022 the United Kingdom Government Minister for Health announced an urgent enquiry into the provision of treatment of transgender children¹⁸⁴.
- He told MPs that services in this area were too affirmative and narrow, and *"bordering on ideological"*. He compared some approaches to that of the sexual *"Child grooming in Rotherham"* and further stated that the *"overly affirmative approach where people just accept what a child says, almost automatically, and then start talking about things like puberty blockers - that's not in the interest of the child at all"*
- Whatever their point of view, nobody should tolerate such an allegation. The Minister is echoing allegations made by gender-critical groups. The motives and methods of management are almost opposite to each other, that is why making the correct diagnosis is so important, and any review must take a totally objective and independent approach

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



DISREGARD OF EVIDENCE

- We have seen that the worldwide scientific consensus and the professional institutions all identify transgender conditions as personality variations driven by the search for identity and the rejection of what is wrong.
- We have also seen that the gender-critical groups are determined to identify transgender conditions as personality disruptions, driven by maybe sublimated sexual motives of behaviour and desire. It is clear that the UK Government agrees with this approach.
- Instead of conducting an impartial analysis the gender-critical groups reject the clinical, scientific and research evidence by condemning it as the work of “*transgender activists*” and present their own view as “*the only credible approach*”. The Government says it needs more evidence... Instead of making incorrect allegations and denying it, the UK Government should look objectively and impartially at the evidence that already exists

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CRITICISMS

- Perhaps the most serious and significant criticism of the gender-critical movements comes from Professor Judith Butler who, in her 1990's book, provided much of the initial inspiration for the gender-critical approach¹⁸⁵.
- In her 2021 Guardian article, Judith Butler argues: *"It is not easy to fully reconstruct the arguments used by the anti-gender ideology movement because they do not hold themselves to standards of consistency or coherence. They assemble and launch incendiary claims to defeat what they see as "gender ideology" or "gender studies" by any rhetorical means necessary. For instance, they object to "gender" because it putatively denies biological sex or because it undermines the natural or divine character of the heteronormative family.*

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



DISCREDITING

- Butler also argues: *“The anti-gender movement is not a conservative position with a clear set of principles. No, as a fascist trend, it mobilizes a range of rhetorical strategies from across the political spectrum to maximize the fear of infiltration and destruction that comes from a diverse set of economic and social forces. It does not strive for consistency, for its incoherence is part of its power”*.
- This ridiculing, manipulation, and disregard of the approaches, adopted by clinicians and the professional institutions, I believe is seen in this United Kingdom gender-critical approach. Sadly, I find its consequences are reflected in the EHRC submissions
- While transgender people are well received in sections of society others are subjected to severe abuse. The Stonewall reports on this abuse are replicated in almost all other studies, and there is no justification for its vilification by gender-critical groups^{186 187}.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



OBJECTIVES

- Therefore, it is necessary to ask what are the underlying reasons for the adoption of this gender-critical approach? And the attempts of its supporters to persuade the general public that this is the only credible one, so for that reason it must be correct?
- A fundamental tenet of radical feminism is that gender identity is socially constructed collective experience, although different feminists (first, second and third generation) express this in different ways. Many think that male to female transsexuals, (maybe unconsciously) seek to exert power over women, though others disagree. Therefore, no one who has ever lived as a man can become a true feminist because they have never encountered the oppression that women face for the whole of their lives¹⁸⁸.
- From some, including the gender-critical groups, all biological males must be treated as potential sexual predators. Only surgical conversion makes women safe from attack.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



ENTITLEMENT

- At the heart of this dispute are these feminist dogmas and the disagreement over the origins and nature of gender identity. The gender-critical groups argue that it is a social construct and deny that any deep-seated gender identity exists.
- We have seen that the Professional Institutions, World Authorities, and the scientific and clinical consensus argue that the core or basic elements lie at the heart of the personality that is created and is one of the first elements of personality to be formed.
- Using this professional gender entitlement, it is possible for someone who is male to identify with women from the moment of birth, have a sense of identity and an outlook, behaviour and lifestyle which is in harmony with women, who respects women, and who fights throughout life as assiduously and strongly as any woman for the protection and security of her safety and gender-based rights.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



OPPOSITION

- Applying the same gender entitlement to the second explanation of autogynephilic transsexuality, where sexuality and sexual orientation is still treated as a personality variation but transsexuality which is treated either as a paraphilia, perversion, disruption, or sublimation, turns the same transsexual with precisely the same outlook, from an ally into an opponent, who is then perceived to be erasing women's identities and attacking their hard-won sex-based rights.
- We have seen that there is a fundamental contradiction inherent to gender critical theory. If it is accepted in line with professional studies, that an elementary core gender identity arises very early in life and that this is effectively fixed by the age of three years, then the gender-critical feminist approach is invalidated. If instead the gender-critical approach is taken to be correct, transgender conditions must then be diagnosed as perversions, paraphilias, or disruptions. So, the motives of transgender people are misrepresented, and the depth of transgender identities is denied.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



DENIALS OF SCIENCE

- For many centuries gender identity has presumed to be divinely decided by biology or entirely created through social interactions and the social expectations of the role.
- Largely as a result of the work with transgender children in the 1960' and 1970's it was discovered that a prior sense of belonging, called the core gender identity, had already been created. Therefore, the identification with the gender role, or the gender role identity is an overlay on what had already been formed.
- Since that time an enormous amount of research has been carried out into the sexuality/gender identity complex at pre-natal and immediately post-natal levels as any handbook on sexuality, neurology, and psychiatry can demonstrate¹⁸⁹.
- In the current EHRC advice, all of this knowledge is shunned, denied, or ignored.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



VICTIMS OR AGGRESSORS

- Many transgender people feel very angry about the ways they are being misrepresented by gender critical and other radical feminist groups. There have been many protests and campaigns mounted against those who support their views, these include holding rallies and denying permission to host meetings in various venues.
- However, for most people in society it seems natural to presume that gender identity should follow biological sex. This can instil a false perception that transgender people are the aggressors in these disputes through seeking power over women and that they attack women's identities, when the reverse is the case.
- Promoting or inciting provocations plays entirely into the hands of gender-critical feminist groups because it seems to promote the rightness of their cause. Protests must be carefully managed by transgender people to ensure that this does not occur.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



BUTLER'S COMMENTS

- Judith Butler argued that behavioural manifestations are present prior to the existence of gender identity and a sexed body, (rather than the other way round). However, she questioned the pre-existence of any group of gender-based characteristics prior to the enforcement of a gender role¹⁹⁰. For Butler then, gender identity is ephermal and a socially learned performative act. It is clear that she is describing the gender role¹⁹¹
- However, Butler treats transgender conditions as personality variations, not as disruptions, and the presence of earlier non-gendered behavioural manifestations, which may lead onwards to the creation of the core gender identity, or gender core, and then on to the gender role, are provided for, and not denied¹⁹².
- The strength and seriousness of Butler's condemnations of gender-critical ideologies in her Guardian article measures how much these movements misrepresent her views¹⁹³.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CURRENT ISSUES

- Today a moral duality is encountered whereby people who engage in transgender and same-sex relationships which are given in love and conform to the highest moral standards of society should be highly regarded. However, those who seek to break these rules through immoral behaviour should be very strongly censured for their acts
- Accepting the existence of the core gender identity can considerably strengthen feminist arguments. for it enables transgender people and all women to argue feminist points of view from a stronger base, with no need to conform to a gender role
- The motives and management methods for each diagnosis are in total opposition. This creates fierce disputes: for what one side sees as coercion and enforcement, must almost by definition, be interpreted as compassion and understanding by the other. Therefore, it is essential for the correct diagnosis to be made.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



OVERVIEWS: GENDER IDENTITY AS A CORE ELEMENT OF PERSONALITY

- At the heart of this dispute is the argument about gender identity and how it is created.
- The professional institutions identify gender identity as a core element of personality: it is one of the first to be created and it forms very early in life. However, it requires interaction with others, so it cannot form before birth. Although on average pre- and post-natal male and female physiologies, such as neural maturation rates, endocrines, and aggression profiles can differ significantly, considerable overlap occurs. Therefore, the core gender identity will usually, but not always follow biological sex^{194 195}.
- It is also shown to be a strongly pro-active process and neural transformations lock this in place by the age of three years. It forms the foundation on which all future development occurs. This means that gender identity, not biological sex, becomes the primary marker to use for all social interactions that take place.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



GENDER IDENTITY AS A SOCIAL CONSTRUCT

- Gender-critical groups argue that gender identity is purely a social construct created, through relationships with others: it may be seen as an illusory indefinable concept, and it is determined entirely through association with the gender role. These groups identify biological sex as the primary marker for social interactions. All of the earlier processes identified by the professional institutions, and examined in this study, are ignored.
- These disputes have profound effects on the management methods that are required. The professional institutions identify the core gender identity as a personality variation which is fixed very early in life. Therefore, giving all children scope to explore their gender identity gives them the opportunities to find it, not to choose it. The same processes apply to everyone. After exploration the great majority do find a secure gender identity which is in line with their biological sex, but some do not, and the stress and attrition created by this gender incongruence can destroy transgender lives¹⁹⁶.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



TRANSGENDER CHILDREN

- It is hardly surprising that these disagreements come to a head when children's development is considered.
- We have seen that gender identity is made up from two components, the core gender identity which describes an often-hidden deep seated sense of belonging and is the first to be formed. This must be treated as a personality variation, and it becomes fixed very early in life. The second is the gender role identity where disturbances must be treated as personality disruptions. This acts like an overlay on what has already been formed.
- Transgender children often report having discomfort with their gender identities from their earliest memories. Much distress is often created for transgender children by gender-critical groups who only recognise the gender role, since the existence and impact of the core gender identity; together with required access to early treatment is denied.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



“GENDER IDEOLOGY”

- Gender-critical groups, Christian Churches, and others, who identify transgender conditions as personality disruptions incorrectly assert that professional institutions and *“transgender activists”* teach a *“gender ideology”* which also states that *“gender identity is a choice”*¹⁹⁷. In place of identifying these conditions as the search for identity and the rejection of what is wrong, the underlying driving forces are instead associated with behaviour, power, and sexual desire, which create runaway drives with dreadful results.
- Butler condemns some of these allegations as incendiary claims made to defeat what these groups see as *“gender ideology”* or *“gender studies”* by any rhetorical means necessary. They object to *“gender”* because it putatively denies biological sex or because it undermines the natural or divine character of the heteronormative family, and they mobilize a range of rhetorical strategies from across the political spectrum to maximize the fear of infiltration and destruction by transgender people’s attacks.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



POPE FRANCIS

- Pope Francis was no less voluble in his own comments. In August 2016 he stated: *“Its ‘terrible’ children taught they can choose gender”*¹⁹⁸. He also said there were powerful institutions which funded the *spread of “gender theory”* in schools. He told Polish bishops: *“Today, children are taught this at school: that everyone can choose their own sex. And why do they teach this? Because the books come from those people and institutions who give money”*. Pope Francis has also been quoted in a book, saying that *“gender theory”*, like nuclear weapons, is a danger to humanity ^{199 200}.
- Paradoxically Pope Francis is totally right to condemn *“gender ideology”*: It has nothing to do with the professional institutions and world authorities. It has everything to do with the misdiagnoses of transgender conditions as personality disruptions, and its incorrect definition and its indiscriminate use contributes greatly to the harm that is caused.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



AFFIRMATIVE APPROACHES

- The different approaches to managing personality variations and personality disruptions are well known. With transgender conditions the same techniques as those applied to any personality variation should be used.
- Fighting or suppressing this deep-seated sense of identity leads to the imposition of trauma, guilt, and the desperation which destroys many lives. Taking an affirmative approach enables people to discover self-identity, self-respect, and self-esteem: to develop strategies needed to deal with them, and to make informed and considered decisions about how to live their lives²⁰¹
- Today, affirmative approaches are the only ones recommended by the world authorities and professional institutions. We have also seen the enormous damage by the imposed denials which conversion therapy creates. It is also needed to combat the vitriol, guilt, and misdiagnoses imposed by these Christian, social and gender critical attacks.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



RELIGIOUS CONTRADICTIONS

- Attitudes to gender and sexually variant people have been totally transformed in societies where gender equality is espoused, and when people can see for themselves how gender and sexually variant people live their lives.
- Pope Francis is, I believe, very genuine and sincere in the pastoral care and welcome which he offers to all gender and sexually variant people, yet he and the Vatican still affirm traditional Church teaching which identifies these as personality disruptions, choices, falling from grace, and expression in same-sex marriages a sinful activity²⁰².
- Despite the profundity of the apology by the archbishops and their stated desire to create a radical new inclusion in the Church of England, the brief for the LLF process, which prevents consideration of any change to the traditional teaching “*as the CoE has received it*”, repeats the same attacks, and eliminates the value of much sincere work.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



GENDER CONTRADICTIONS

- The same contradictions are also found amongst numbers of radical feminist groups
- In announcing a government sponsored conference (now cancelled) the Minister for Equalities Liz Truss, said: *“The Government is committed to ensuring that LGBT people can be safe and free to live their lives as they wish, here at home and supporting them around the world. These events will be the next important step to ensuring we build a world where it is truly “Safe to Be Me””*.^{203 204}
- Yet the current EHRC advice, whose board is appointed by Liz Truss, refuses to define transgender identities, ignores non-binary people, identifies gender identity only by the gender role, claims more evidence is needed, ignores that which already exists, and states that all transgender people, including those who have a Gender Recognition Certificate can be excluded from any single-sex space by a popular vote.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



SCAPEGOATING OF TRANSGENDER PEOPLE

- There is absolutely no doubt that the equality, safety and security and the protection of all women against sexual and other abuse must always be an overwhelming priority.
- In earlier presentations we saw a moral duality existed in first century Judaism and in Christianity for much of the first millennium where loving same-sex relationships were accepted, while those involving sexual or other abuses were severely condemned. That moral duality was lost near the end of the first millennium when all forms of same-sex relationships became condemned as progenitors of abusive or disordered sexual acts.
- The consequence was the collusion of the Church in the secular scapegoating of all gender and sexually variant people. The current EHRC advice gives a charter for the secular scapegoating to continue, and the intensities of the present attacks on LGBT people on the grounds of alleged abuses shows that this must be a serious concern

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



RESOLUTION

- There can be no hope of resolution unless these prevarications and avoidances are immediately addressed.
- For the Christian churches I argue that this requires a radical re-examination of their own theologies, which considers changes during the first millennium, and continuity from Jewish tradition, instead of using theologies developed for a medieval Church.
- For governments and other organisations that means taking objective views of all of the science available to the best of their ability, and not by following any group who may be promoting partisan views. In this respect any possible government or ministerial intervention which affects the views of any organisation appointed to be a watchdog for Equalities and Human Rights must be of particular concern, for that does not just affect transgender people, it affects the liberties of us all.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



INTRANSIGENCE

- When the motives, methods of management and consequences of personality disruptions are directly opposed to each other it should be easy to decide from experimental evidence the one that is correct.
- We have seen that there is a fundamental contradiction inherent to gender critical theory. If it is accepted in line with professional studies, that an elementary core gender identity arises very early in life and that this is effectively fixed by the age of three years, then the gender-critical feminist approach is invalidated. If instead the gender-critical approach is taken to be correct, transgender conditions must then be diagnosed as perversions, paraphilias, or disruptions. So, the motives of transgender people are misrepresented, and the depth of transgender identities is denied.
- It is difficult to avoid the conclusion that the integrity and reality of transgender conditions are being compromised to keep the traditional feminist approaches intact.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



TRANSFORMATIONS

- The transformation in outlook since the 1960's from a time when homosexuality and gender and sexually variant behaviour was criminalised and condemned as sexually depraved and disordered behaviour, to the present-day acceptance of same-sex marriages and gender equality marks revolution in understanding these conditions
- All gender and sexually variant people have been on the same journey, from condemnations of behaviour as sexually motivated perversions and disruptions to the celebrations of identity instead.
- Re-introducing attempts to enforce a diagnosis of perversion or disruption on transgender conditions, instead of treating them expressions of identity sets the clock right back. No analysis which defies, ignores, or seeks to ridicule any of the available evidence can be considered valid, and when this is enforced, these advances in understanding are ignored.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



PARLIAMENTARY STATEMENTS

- When Penny Mordaunt; then the United Kingdom Equalities Minister launched the consultation on reforming the 2004 Gender Recognition Act in 2018, she declared that *“Trans Women are Women. That is the starting point of the consultation”*. In a United Kingdom Parliamentary debate on the 1 March 2021, she again remarked that *“Trans men are men and trans women are women”*²⁰⁵.
- That was at a time when the UK Conservative Government, then led by Teresa May, strongly supported the reform of the Gender Recognition act and the scientific consensus which identified transgender conditions as *“as naturally expected variations of the human condition, which are intrinsic to the personality created, that arise very early in development and cannot be changed either by the individual concerned or by the predations of others in subsequent life”*, which involve the search for identity and the rejection of what is wrong, they are internally focussed, they do not attack others, and are about being yourself.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



ARE TRANS WOMEN, WOMEN?

- That was also at a time when the definition of “*Women*” was not confined to those people who have a clitoris and excluded all others. It included those people, including male to female transsexuals who fitted seamlessly into society in that role in life.
- That situation changed in when the new Minister of Women and Equalities, Liz Truss blocked the changes recommended in the consultation on the Reform of the 2004 Gender Recognition act²⁰⁶
- Since taking office the present United Kingdom Government has disbanded key consultative groups which could advise them on transgender and LGBT issues. A standoff is presently being encountered between the present United Kingdom Conservative government and the United Kingdom Women and Equalities Parliamentary Select Committee. Government ministers have failed to liaise with it. Instead, the present Government has sought to pursue a gender-critical approach.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



POLICIES

- Following the resignation as Party Leader by Boris Johnson, the UK Prime Minister there has been a spat over transgender rights between the five leadership contenders. The boundary lines are drawn between those who support a gender-critical viewpoint, which sees male to female transsexuals as potential threats to women's identities, and those who have taken the viewpoint of the professional institutions and see them as supporters and allies in the feminist cause. This causes significant concern since the methods of management oppose each other, and pursuing the wrong one can cause considerable harm
- Of course, any government has a right to pursue its own policies, provided that is done in a legal and appropriate way. What it should not do, and never should do is to interfere with the activities of any authority which is set up as a watchdog to protect people from human rights abuses by any person or organisation, including governments which are perpetrating any abuse.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



INTERFERENCE

- In this examination I come to the view that the UK Equalities and Human Rights Commission has lost its independence and become a mouthpiece for government motivated gender-critical views. By this one of the most fundamental safeguards to our safety and our democracy is lost.
- That raises even more concerns because one of the two final candidates for the leadership of the UK Conservative Party, and ultimately United Kingdom Prime Minister from September, and the favourite to win is Elizabeth Truss.
- Current safeguards through international legislation are expected to be lost though the adoption of the United Kingdom bill of rights, in which the United Kingdom will legislate to depart at least in part, from the protection of the European Convention on Human Rights, major decisions will be at the Government's discretion, and that raises additional concerns for us all.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CONCERNS ABOUT THE UNITED KINGDOM BILL OF RIGHTS

Susan Gilchrist

25 June 2022

<http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/037B-UKBillOfRightsConcerns.pdf>

- On Wednesday 22 June 2022 the Government introduced its UK Bill of Rights claiming it will strengthen freedom of speech and curb bogus human rights claims. Among other things the act provides a basis in law for UK courts to disregard judgments of and interim rulings by the European Court of Human Rights and the body that supervises compliance with its judgments. It introduces new procedural hurdles for people seeking to assert rights in court It seeks to reduce public bodies' human rights obligations, especially for the rights of women, girls, older people, and marginalized people. When the Government is also intending to tear up its international treaty obligations under the Northern Ireland Protocol, and proposing to be able to breach other international treaties, when it believes it needs to, these must be matters of major concern.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CONCERNS ABOUT THE UNITED KINGDOM BILL OF RIGHTS

- When it also aims to distinguish people deserving of their human rights protections from those who the Government thinks do not deserve them, and make it a Government decision, it is important to consider the Governments own actions, as in this article, on the protection of human rights
- Recently there have been considerable disputes over the nature of transgender conditions
- If the bill is passed, Parliament will be given *“the greatest possible weight”* in court decisions and will have the power to dictate how courts should interpret human rights. Section 15 of the bill says that people will have to get permission from the court before they can bring proceedings against a public authority. The court will grant permission only if it thinks the person has suffered a significant disadvantage.

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CONCERNS ABOUT THE UNITED KINGDOM BILL OF RIGHTS

- Giving Parliament “*the greatest possible weight*” in court decisions means parliament and the government will have the power to dictate how courts should interpret human rights²⁰⁷. Thus, the ability to prevent such government misuses will be destroyed
- The United Kingdom Equality and Human Rights Commission is an independent statutory body with the responsibility to encourage equality and diversity, eliminate unlawful discrimination, and protect and promote the human rights of everyone in Britain. It enforces equality legislation on age, disability, gender reassignment, marriage and civil partnership, pregnancy and maternity, race, religion or belief, sex, and sexual orientation
- As an independent statutory body, it has a duty to hold the Government into account. However, the Government also appoints members to its board. Hence the question of ensuring independence and impartiality of the board arises

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CONCERNS ABOUT THE UNITED KINGDOM BILL OF RIGHTS

- We have seen that the EHRC has also become involved in a toxic dispute over the protection of transgender people. On one side the professional institutions and world medical authorities define these as personality variations, which are established very early in life, and are not amenable to later change. They concern the search for identity and the rejection of what is wrong. Gender-critical groups identify these conditions instead as sexually motivated personality disruptions driven by behaviour and desire. The motives and methods of management are almost opposite to each other. Therefore, as an independent body the EHRC should take account of both approaches
- In my view, that is not happened, I find no evidence that the EHRC has taken any meaningful account of the viewpoints of the professional institutions. This leads me to believe that it has produced advice and guidance that exclusively supports the present Government agenda which pursues a gender critical approach

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CONCERNS ABOUT THE UNITED KINGDOM BILL OF RIGHTS

- That also raises the question of politically motivated government appointments to the board of any statutory body, and if the present government is intent on forcing its UK bill of Rights through Parliament as quickly as possible, and with minimum scrutiny, that must give us particular concern.
- The comments and slides in these presentations contain my own critique of the current EHRC approach and the present controversy. They are extracted from an extended course of ten presentations. You can find the full set at
- Gilchrist, S. (2022): “*Christian Communities, Transgender People and Christian Traditions*” (Draft): <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/037B-PresDoctrinesDisputesTransPeople.pdf>

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



CONCERNS ABOUT THE UNITED KINGDOM BILL OF RIGHTS

- The following papers may also be relevant
- Gilchrist, S. (2021a): “*Gender Identity, Feminism, and Transgender People*”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/250P-GenderIdentityAndTrans.pdf>
- Gilchrist, S. (2020f): “*Managing Transgender Conditions Correctly: A Commentary on the Bell v Tavistock Case*”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/249P-JudgmentResponse.pdf>
- Gilchrist, S. (2022): “*No Blacks, No Irish, No Homosexuals, No Transgender People*”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/252P-NoBlacks.pdf>
- A full bibliography is available at: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/articles/bibliography.htm>

© Susan Gilchrist 2022

[Top](#)

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



Please note. These notes are still in draft form

¹ This document is available at: Gilchrist, S. (2022): *“Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government actions”*
<http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/254p-PresTransDisputesAndGovActions.pdf>

² It is not just this research that should be considered. When Penny Mordaunt; then the United Kingdom Equalities Minister launched the consultation on reforming the 2004 Gender Recognition Act she declared that “Trans Women are Women. That is the starting point of the consultation”. If gender identity is the primary marker for social interaction her statement that “Trans Women are Women” is quite correct . However, Penny Mordant was doing more than this. Not only was she saying that for legal purposes trans women must be regarded as women for the starting point of the consultation, she was affirming not only the experiences of many transgender people and results of this research, but also the conclusions of the professional medical institutions, the scientific consensus, the memorandum of understanding , and the mass of experiential evidence which shows that trans women relate as themselves and to others in society in the same way that any woman who was forced to live as a man might expect.

³ Bettcher, Talia, "Feminist Perspectives on Trans Issues", *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Fall 2020 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), URL = <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2020/entries/feminism-trans/>

⁴ Autogynephilia was defined by an American psychologist, Dr Ray Blanchard, as “a male’s propensity to be sexually aroused by the thought of himself as a female”. (Auto = self, gyne = woman, philia = love.) According to Blanchard and Lawrence “The increasing prevalence of male-to-female (Male to female) transsexualism in Western countries is largely due to the growing number of Male to female transsexuals who have a history of sexual arousal with cross-dressing or cross-gender fantasy. Ray Blanchard proposed that these transsexuals have a paraphilia he called autogynephilia, which is the propensity to be sexually aroused by the thought or image of oneself as female. Autogynephilia defines a transsexual typology and provides a theory of transsexual motivation, in that Blanchard proposed that

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



male to female transsexuals are either sexually attracted exclusively to men (homosexual) or are sexually attracted primarily to the thought or image of themselves as female (autogynephilic), and that autogynephilic transsexuals seek sex reassignment to actualize their autogynephilic desires. Despite growing professional acceptance, Blanchard's formulation is rejected by some male to female transsexuals as inconsistent with their experience. This rejection, I (Lawrence) argue, results largely from the misconception that autogynephilia is a purely erotic phenomenon. Autogynephilia can more accurately be conceptualized as a type of sexual orientation and as a variety of romantic love, involving both erotic and affectional or attachment-based elements". According to Lawrence: "This broader conception of autogynephilia addresses many of the objections to Blanchard's theory and is consistent with a variety of clinical observations concerning autogynephilic Male to female transsexualism". Becoming what we love: Lawrence, A. A. (2007): "Autogynephilic transsexualism conceptualized as an expression of romantic love"; *Perspect Biol Med.* Autumn 2007;50(4):506-20. doi: 10.1353/pbm.2007.0050.

⁵ The words have essentially the same meaning. The word paraphilia is used to remove the negative connotation that the word perversion has acquired

⁶ For more analysis see: Gilchrist, S. (2018c): "The Safeguarding of Transgender Children": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/241P-SafeguardingTransgenderChildrenDoc.pdf> also Gilchrist, S. (2017j): "Religious and Secular Scapegoating of Transgender People: and its impact on the Christian Church": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/238P-SecularScapegoating.pdf>

⁷ The Royal College of Psychiatrists have produced a separate statement which takes an equally strongly expressed view.

⁸ Gilchrist, S. (2018c): "The Safeguarding of Transgender Children": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/241P-SafeguardingTransgenderChildrenDoc.pdf>

⁹ Gilchrist, S. (2017). "No, Pope Francis: "Gender Identity is not a Choice: It need not follow biological sex": This paper is available online at: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/227P-No-PopeFrancis.pdf>

¹⁰ See for example: Kozłowska, K., et al. G. (2021). Australian children and adolescents with gender dysphoria: Clinical presentations and challenges experienced by a multidisciplinary team and gender service. *Human Systems: Therapy, Culture, and Attachments*, 0(0). doi:10.1177/26344041211010777.

¹¹ Theory of Mind

¹² It is difficult to pin down exactly what "gender ideology" means. For gender critical feminist groups Allegations that "male to female transsexuals believe that they somehow change biological sex", are foisted on transgender people. For Pope Francis "gender Ideology"

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions



Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022

means a belief that people are able to choose their gender identity In August 2016 Pope Francis stated: *“Its ‘terrible’ children taught they can choose gender”*. He also said there were powerful institutions which funded the spread of *“gender theory”* in schools. He told Polish bishops: *“Today, children are taught this at school: that everyone can choose their own sex. And why do they teach this? Because the books come from those people and institutions who give money”*. Pope Francis has also been quoted in a book, saying that *“gender theory”*, like nuclear weapons, is a danger to humanity. Pope Benedict had previously addressed transgender issues by cautioning Catholics about *“destroying the very essence of the human creature through manipulating their God-given gender to suit their sexual choice”*.

¹³ Chapter in “this is my body

¹⁴ Mitchell Book

¹⁵ See for example: Gilchrist, S. (2019b): *“The Development of Transgender Behaviour and Identities in Early Life”*: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/243P-BehaviourSelfIdentity.pdf>

¹⁶ “the foremost challenge to be explained is not about how learning develops but about but how this process can controlled and inhibited for constructive effect”

¹⁷ Neural Development Studies

¹⁸ Measured via synaptic density

¹⁹ Section B:7:2:1: Neural Development in Gilchrist, S. (2021): *“Responsibility in Transgender Disputes”*:

<http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/248P-Responsibility.pdf>: (I am presently withholding part of this document because I wish to update it in the light of the Tavistock v Bell court ruling. However key sections continue to be available). *“One area of major importance during this time is the massive development of neural capabilities which occurs in the first three to four years. At birth, the part of the brain most responsible for thinking and reasoning (the pre-frontal cortex) is very primitive in nature but, within the first three years an enormous growth in neural interconnections, and the corresponding capabilities takes place. However, that development does not take place uniformly. It is also marked by periods of intense activity where very rapid neural advancement occurs. These intense periods occur in different areas of the brain at different times. Before and after these periods much reduced neural development is found. Around the age of one and a half to two years a rapid and wide-ranging transformation in neural and reasoning capabilities takes place. It has been described by various investigators as the time when the brain “lights up”. Neural activity, which was previously localised in nature rapidly spreads, distant areas of the brain become connected, and networks between the two hemispheres develop. There is an explosion in*

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions



Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022

language abilities and cognitive capacity. Up to this time, the pre-frontal cortex of the brain had been in a relatively undeveloped state; but that rapidly changes: Significantly, for the first time, the pre-frontal cortex of the brain can start to function in a more effective way as a single co-ordinating unit. The existence of a close correlation between the development of language capabilities and a child's first awareness of what gender means has been noted by various investigators. This identification might best be described as an unconscious sense of belonging, which is without behavioural implications. The term core gender identity has been used to describe this concept. It is different from the gender role identity. That is created by the experiences of socialisation. In contrast to the core gender identity, this gender role identification only begins to become apparent about one year later, when children begin to form strongly defined gender stereotypes, this is from around the age of three years: I prefer to use the term "gender allegiance" for the gender role identification instead. Significantly this means that identification precedes socialisation during these first stages. That is the reverse of what is understood to happen when the theories based on sexual motivation and social learning are used. However, in later years the pressures of socialisation may be expected to drive identification instead".

²⁰ Cite my research on transition regret

²¹ Cite my transgender management document

²² Rippon, Gina. (2019); *"The Gendered Brain: The new Neuroscience that shatters the myth of the female brain"*: Penguin Random House, London 2019: ISBN 9781847924759

²³ For my full analysis of Rippon's work, see sections B:5, C:4:1, C:5 in Gilchrist, S. (2020b): *"Responsibility in Transgender Disputes"*: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/248P-Responsibility.pdf>

²⁴ Fine, Cordelia: (2010): *"Delusions of Gender: The real science behind sex differences"* Ikon Books 2010: ISBN 978-184831-220-3

²⁵ Baron Cohen, Simon (2003): *"The Essential Difference: Men Women and the Extreme Male Brain"* ISBN-13 978-0-241-96135-3

²⁶ For a full discussion on this and "Quorum sensing mechanisms" see Section 5:1 "Neurology and Learning": Gilchrist, S. (2013d): *"Personality Development and LGB&T People: A New Approach"*: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/201P-PersonalityDevelopmentAndLGBTPeople.pdf>

²⁷ Management methods must also take account of the bipolar nature of these conflicts

²⁸ Gilchrist, S. (2022): *"Christian Communities, Transgender People and Christian Traditions"* (Draft): <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/037B-PresDoctrinesDisputesTransPeople.pdf>

²⁹ Testosterone book reference

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



³⁰ Butler's comments on the anti-gender movement and trans-exclusionary radical feminism:.. Butler said in 2020 that trans-exclusionary radical feminism is "a fringe movement that is seeking to speak in the name of the mainstream, and that our responsibility is to refuse to let that happen." In 2021 they described the anti-gender movements as fascist trends and cautioned self-declared feminists from allying with such movements in targeting trans, non-binary, and genderqueer people. Butler also explored the issue in a 2019 paper in which they argued that "the confusion of discourses is part of what constitutes the fascist structure and appeal of at least some of these [anti-gender] movements. One can oppose gender as a cultural import from the North at the same time that one can see that very opposition as a social movement against further colonization of the South. The result is not a turn to the Left, but an embrace of ethno-nationalism." The Guardian interview,, On September 7, 2021, The Guardian published an interview[of Butler by Jules Gleeson that included Butler's critique of trans-exclusionary feminists ("gender critical feminists" or "TERFs"). Butler stated that "The anti-gender ideology is one of the dominant strains of fascism in our times." [99] Within a few hours of publication, three paragraphs including this statement were removed, with a note explaining "This article was edited on 7 September 2021 to reflect developments which occurred after the interview took place." The Guardian was then accused of censoring Judith Butler for having compared TERFs to fascists. British writer Roz Kaveney called it "a truly shocking moment of bigoted dishonesty", while British transgender activist and writer Juno Dawson, among others, observed that The Guardian had inadvertently triggered the Streisand effect, in which an attempt to censor yields the unintended consequence of increasing awareness of a topic. The next day, The Guardian acknowledged "a failure in our editorial standards". Wikipedia: https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Judith_Butler

³¹ For more detailed consideration see: Gilchrist, S. (2021a): "*Gender Identity, Feminism, and Transgender People*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/250P-GenderIdentityAndTrans.pdf>

³² It is difficult to pin down exactly what "*gender ideology*" means. For gender critical feminist groups Allegations that "*male to female transsexuals believe that they somehow change biological sex*", are foisted on transgender people. For Pope Francis "*gender Ideology*" means a belief that people are able to choose their gender identity In August 2016 Pope Francis stated: "*Its 'terrible' children taught they can choose gender*". He also said there were powerful institutions which funded the spread of "*gender theory*" in schools. He told Polish bishops: "Today, children are taught this at school: that everyone can choose their own sex. And why do they teach this? Because the books come from those people and institutions who give money". Pope Francis has also been quoted in a book, saying that "*gender theory*", like nuclear weapons, is a danger to humanity. Pope Benedict had previously addressed transgender issues by cautioning

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions



Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022

Catholics about “destroying the very essence of the human creature through manipulating their God-given gender to suit their sexual choice”.

³³ Section 8:0 Gender Identity feminism and trans

³⁴ Butler, J., 1990, “*Performative Acts and Gender Constitution*”, in *Performing Feminisms*, S-E. Case (ed.), Baltimore: John Hopkins University.

³⁵ See for example Butler 1990s book

³⁶ Compare Rippon’s book with others and give references

³⁷ “*While sex (male/ female) is an immutable biological reality, gender (masculinity/ femininity) is understood as a social construct which changes through history and according to societal norms. Conversely, the American Psychiatric Association (APA) who produce the guidance upon which NHS practice is based, describes gender identity as: ‘a category of social identity (that) refers to an individuals’ classification as male, female or occasionally some category other than male or female. It’s one’s deeply held sense of being male or female, some of both or neither, and does not always correspond to biological sex’ As such the APA & NHS gender identity is unverifiable and yet considered to exist independent of both gendered socialisation and biological sex. There is no scientific basis for the idea of innate deeply-held sense of gender*”. <https://www.transgendertrend.com/current-evidence/> See also “*The Pink and Blue Brain Myth*”: <https://www.transgendertrend.com/brain-research/> [All accessed 2020]

³⁸ Transgender Trend: <https://www.transgendertrend.com/>

³⁹ Gendered Intelligence: <http://genderedintelligence.co.uk/>

⁴⁰ GIRES: <https://www.gires.org.uk/>

⁴¹ Allsorts Youth Project: <https://www.allsortsyouth.org.uk/>

⁴² Section 8:0 Gender Identity feminism and trans

⁴³ Autogynephilia was defined by an American psychologist, Dr Ray Blanchard, as “*a male’s propensity to be sexually aroused by the thought of himself as a female*”. (Auto = self, gyne = woman, philia = love.) According to Blanchard and Lawrence “*The increasing prevalence of male-to-female (Male to female) transsexualism in Western countries is largely due to the growing number of Male to female transsexuals who have a history of sexual arousal with cross-dressing or cross-gender fantasy. Ray Blanchard proposed that these transsexuals have a paraphilia he called autogynephilia, which is the propensity to be sexually aroused by the thought or image of oneself as female. Autogynephilia defines a transsexual typology and provides a theory of transsexual motivation, in that Blanchard proposed that*

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions



Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022

male to female transsexuals are either sexually attracted exclusively to men (homosexual) or are sexually attracted primarily to the thought or image of themselves as female (autogynephilic), and that autogynephilic transsexuals seek sex reassignment to actualize their autogynephilic desires. Despite growing professional acceptance, Blanchard's formulation is rejected by some male to female transsexuals as inconsistent with their experience. This rejection, I (Lawrence) argue, results largely from the misconception that autogynephilia is a purely erotic phenomenon. Autogynephilia can more accurately be conceptualized as a type of sexual orientation and as a variety of romantic love, involving both erotic and affectional or attachment-based elements". According to Lawrence: "This broader conception of autogynephilia addresses many of the objections to Blanchard's theory and is consistent with a variety of clinical observations concerning autogynephilic Male to female transsexualism". Becoming what we love: Lawrence, A. A. (2007): "Autogynephilic transsexualism conceptualized as an expression of romantic love"; *Perspect Biol Med.* Autumn 2007;50(4):506-20. doi: 10.1353/pbm.2007.0050.

⁴⁴ The words have essentially the same meaning. The word paraphilia is used to remove the negative connotation that the word perversion has acquired

⁴⁵ For those who argue that gender identity is purely a socially learned construct, the issue is one of male domination and power over women. From this perspective, those male-to-female transsexuals who identify as women are understood to erase women's identities and attack women's sex-based rights: their argument is that social conditioning creates boundaries that cannot be crossed. This gives strong reasons for adopting autogynephilic explanations for transsexuality, where homosexuality is regarded as a personality variation and is a fundamental and clearly defined element of identity, while male-to-female transsexuality is regarded as a sublimated sexually motivated paraphilia or disruption of homosexuality instead.

⁴⁶ Refer to Rippon's book

⁴⁷ Testosterone book reference

⁴⁸ WPATH

⁴⁹ Memorandum of Understanding

⁵⁰ Stonewall

⁵¹ GIRES

⁵² Section 8 of feminism paper

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



⁵³ Joel, Daphna; Berman, Zohar; Tavor, Ido; Nadav, Wexler; Gaber, Olga; Stein, Yaniv; Shefi, Nisan; Pool, Jared; Urchs, Sebastian; Margulies, Daniel S.; Liem, Franziskus; Hänggi, Jürgen; Jäncke, Lutz; Assaf, Yaniv: (2015): “Sex beyond the genitalia: The human brain mosaic” CrossMark: Elsevier PNAS Vol 112 No 50 Published 15 Dec 2015 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1073/PNAS.1509654112>

⁵⁴ Joel, D., Garcia-Falgueras, A., Swaab, D.; (2020) “The Complex Relationships between Sex and the Brain” *The Neuroscientist* 2020, Vol. 26(2) 156–169 DOI: 10.1177/1073858419867298. In their 2015 paper Joel et al did not say that there were no sex differences. Instead of this, they described the brain as a mosaic of male and female features. Within that mosaic, various workers have since identified divergent male, transgender, and female phenotypes. In a 2020 paper Joel et al summarised the present situation by saying: “It is impossible to determine whether the differences between the groups reflect the different life experiences of individuals with different identities or preceded these experiences. It is also impossible to determine whether differences in specific brain structures are responsible for the different identities. These questions of cause and effect are further complicated by the observation that brain functions are generally not localized in one particular brain structure but distributed over circuits of large numbers of interacting brain areas”. There is also supporting evidence from other neurological studies to show that, while male and female neural differentiations on average fall into these two categories, there is such a large spread in the distribution of these identifications that large overlaps occur. Mitchell for example gives a comprehensive account of this in his book. This means that it is Joel et al themselves, who discredit the interpretation which these gender critical feminist groups place on their work. Also: rather than looking at neural activity, examining neural interconnectivity may be a more appropriate approach. Standard handbooks such as that on: “Sex Differences in Neurology and Psychiatry” show the complex interactions that exist between sex and gender, even before and soon after birth. This contradicts the arguments presented by those groups who claim the gender identity is determined by social conditioning alone. It also has major consequences for those feminist movements whose gender politics are based entirely on the premise that gender is wholly socially constructed. As the feminist accounts of gender identities and transgender people show, this presumption is unquestioned in their own histories, cultures, and research.

⁵⁵ Mitchell, Kevin J. (2018): “*Innate: How the Wiring of our Brain Shapes Who We Are*”: Princeton University Press; ISBN 978-0-691-17388-7.

⁵⁶ I also discuss this extensively in Responsibility in Transgender Disputes: Gilchrist, S. (2021): “*Responsibility in Transgender Disputes*”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/248P-Responsibility.pdf>: (I am presently withholding part of this document because I wish to update it in the light of the *Tavistock v Bell* court ruling. However key sections continue to be available).

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions



Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022

⁵⁷ See for example Lanzenberger, R.; Kranz, G.S.; Savic, I.: (Eds) (2020): "Sex Differences in Neurology and Psychiatry" Handbook of Clinical Neurology Volume 175, 2020

⁵⁸ See section 2:0 and Bettcher, Talia, (2014): "*Feminist Perspectives on Trans Issues*", The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy (Fall 2020 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), URL = <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2020/entries/feminism-trans/> . Mikkola, Mari, (2019) "*Feminist Perspectives on Sex and Gender*", The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy (Fall 2019 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), URL = <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2019/entries/feminism-gender/> .

⁵⁹ Dhejne C, Lichtenstein P, Boman M, Johansson ALV, Långström N, Landén M (2011): "*Long-Term Follow-Up of Transsexual Persons Undergoing Sex Reassignment Surgery: Cohort Study in Sweden*". PLoS ONE 6(2): e16885. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0016885>
Conclusion "*This study found substantially higher rates of overall mortality, death from cardiovascular disease and suicide, suicide attempts, and psychiatric hospitalisations in sex-reassigned transsexual individuals compared to a healthy control population. This highlights that post-surgical transsexuals are a risk group that need long-term psychiatric and somatic follow-up. Even though surgery and hormonal therapy alleviates gender dysphoria, it is apparently not sufficient to remedy the high rates of morbidity and mortality found among transsexual persons. Improved care for the transsexual group after the sex reassignment should therefore be considered.*"

⁶⁰ The statement on the Transgender Trend website that "there is no evidence that transition is a 'cure' is based on this Swedish study," which is taken to mean that transgender conditions arise because of the internal traumas that people must deal with . That is not replicated in other literature, where the high rates of morbidity are instead considered due to the external attacks and discrimination that transgender people face. Transition does not remove this external discrimination in any way and the misrepresentation this outlook presents increases the strength of such attacks. It is of note that the lead author of the Swedish paper referred to above (Dhejne), specifically and strongly rejects the interpretations which have been attributed to this paper by various gender-critical feminist groups .
Section D:5: Sources of Trauma, in :Gilchrist, S. (2021): "*Responsibility in Transgender Disputes*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/248P-Responsibility.pdf>: (I am presently withholding part of this document because I wish to update it in the light of the Tavistock v Bell court ruling. However key sections continue to be available).

⁶¹ Section D:4: Suicides and Attempted Suicides, in :Gilchrist, S. (2021): "*Responsibility in Transgender Disputes*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/248P-Responsibility.pdf>: (I am presently withholding part of this document because I wish to update it in the light of this court ruling. However key sections continue to be available).

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



⁶² Williams, Cristan (2015): “A 2011 Swedish study proves that trans people are more suicidal due to transition, are likely rapists and that trans women exhibit male socialization. Or does it?” *Trans Advocate* 2 November 2015: https://www.transadvocate.com/fact-check-study-shows-transition-makes-trans-people-suicidal_n_15483.htm

⁶³ Statistical Interpretations

⁶⁴ Stonewall (2018): “LGBT in Britain - Trans Report” and the Stonewall “LGBT in Britain - Trans Report” of 2018. These were commissioned from Cambridge University and You Gov respectively. On their website the LGB Alliance state that all opposing groups are: “Mainly peopled by activists linked to a plethora of LGBTQ+ lobby groups such as Stonewall that have grown bloated on huge funding, much of it from the taxpayer, and who use their undue influence to misinterpret both the spirit and the letter of the existing law”. The analyses presented in these reports are interpreted in ways which tend to make transgender people appear as agents of their own misfortunes rather than victims of the external discrimination and abuse” <https://www.stonewall.org.uk/lgbt-britain-trans-report> also Stonewall/Cambridge University (2017): “School Report (2017)”: <http://www.stonewall.org.uk/school-report-2017>

⁶⁵ Butler, J., 1990, “*Performative Acts and Gender Constitution*”, in *Performing Feminisms*, S-E. Case (ed.), Baltimore: John Hopkins University.

⁶⁶ Butler, Judith, (2021): “Why is the idea of ‘gender’ provoking backlash the world over?” the Guardian 23 October 2021: <https://www.theguardian.com/us-news/commentisfree/2021/oct/23/judith-butler-gender-ideology-backlash?fbclid=IwAR0rB1GFwR8N88U-cPMYXrpCQ2FQLzqe5IUfNISuckXkhNzVEarOg66uh0s>

⁶⁷ Refer to clinical evidence

⁶⁸ Refer to regret rates in section 8 of feminism re regret

⁶⁹ Explain Theory of Mind

⁷⁰ CNN (2021) This record-breaking year for anti-transgender legislation would affect minors the most By Priya Krishnakumar, CNN April 15, 2021 <https://edition.cnn.com/2021/04/15/politics/anti-transgender-legislation-2021/index.html>

⁷¹ For one example see: NY Times (2022) “Texas Investigates Parents Over Care for Transgender Youth, Suit Says” NY Times 1 March 2022: <https://www.nytimes.com/2022/03/01/us/texas-child-abuse-trans-youth.html>

⁷² In the United States, the legalisation of same-sex marriage by the Federal Government has resulted in a rash of mainly Southern states seeking to scapegoat transsexual people by legally enforcing them only to use toilets and bathroom facilities which correspond to the

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



genitalia they were born with. This is irrespective of their gender identities and the transformations that they make. That position was supported by Cardinal Robert Sarah, Archbishop emeritus of Conakry (Guinea) and Prefect of the Congregation of Divine Worship and the Discipline of the Sacraments in the Catholic Church, during the address he gave to the 12th Annual National Catholic Prayer Breakfast held on Tuesday, May 17th, 2016 at the Marriott Marquis Hotel in Washington DC. The Cardinal's address can be seen on the link provided. Not only did the Cardinal support the movement to impose the bathroom ban, he also declared that gender identity and sexual orientation are defined by the biology of sex. [Accessed 14 June 2016]: <https://catholicprayerbreakfast.com/2016-video/>

⁷³ Gilchrist, S. (2021a): "Gender Identity, Feminism, and Transgender People": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/250P-GenderIdentityAndTrans.pdf>

⁷⁴ Gilchrist, S. (2017e): "Gender and Sexual Malpractice and Abuse in the Christian Church": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/236P-Malpractice.pdf>

⁷⁵ Restosterone book

⁷⁶ Transgender issues and women's concerns

⁷⁷ Joel, Daphna; Berman, Zohar; Tavor, Ido; Nadav, Wexler; Gaber, Olga; Stein, Yaniv; Shefi, Nisan; Pool, Jared; Urchs, Sebastian; Margulies, Daniel S.; Liem, Franziskus; Hänggi, Jürgen; Jäncke, Lutz; Assaf, Yaniv: (2015): "Sex beyond the genitalia: The human brain mosaic" *CrossMark: Elsevier PNAS* Vol 112 No 50 Published 15 Dec 2015 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1073/PNAS.1509654112>

⁷⁸ Dhejne C, Lichtenstein P, Boman M, Johansson ALV, Långström N, Landén M (2011): "Long-Term Follow-Up of Transsexual Persons Undergoing Sex Reassignment Surgery: Cohort Study in Sweden". *PLoS ONE* 6(2): e16885. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0016885>
Conclusion "This study found substantially higher rates of overall mortality, death from cardiovascular disease and suicide, suicide attempts, and psychiatric hospitalisations in sex-reassigned transsexual individuals compared to a healthy control population. This highlights that post-surgical transsexuals are a risk group that need long-term psychiatric and somatic follow-up. Even though surgery and hormonal therapy alleviates gender dysphoria, it is apparently not sufficient to remedy the high rates of morbidity and mortality found among transsexual persons. Improved care for the transsexual group after the sex reassignment should therefore be considered."

⁷⁹ The statement on the Transgender Trend website that "there is no evidence that transition is a 'cure' is based on this Swedish study," which is taken to mean that transgender conditions arise because of the internal traumas that people must deal with. That allegation is not supported in this paper and is not supported in other literature, where the high rates of morbidity are instead considered due to the external attacks and discrimination that transgender people face. Transition does not remove this external discrimination in any way and the

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



misrepresentation this outlook presents increases the strength of such attacks. It is of note that the lead author of the Swedish paper referred to above (Dhejne), specifically and strongly rejects the interpretations which have been attributed to this paper by various gender-critical feminist groups . Section D:5: Sources of Trauma, in :Gilchrist, S. (2021): “*Responsibility in Transgender Disputes*”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/248P-Responsibility.pdf>: (I am presently withholding part of this document because I wish to update it in the light of the Tavistock v Bell court ruling. However key sections continue to be available).

⁸⁰ Section D:4: Suicides and Attempted Suicides, in :Gilchrist, S. (2021): “*Responsibility in Transgender Disputes*”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/248P-Responsibility.pdf>: (I am presently withholding part of this document because I wish to update it in the light of this court ruling. However key sections continue to be available).

⁸¹ Williams, Cristan (2015): “A 2011 Swedish study proves that trans people are more suicidal due to transition, are likely rapists and that trans women exhibit male socialization. Or does it?” *Trans Advocate* 2 November 2015: https://www.transadvocate.com/fact-check-study-shows-transition-makes-trans-people-suicidal_n_15483.htm

⁸²Joel, D., Garcia-Falgueras, A., Swaab, D.; (2020) “The Complex Relationships between Sex and the Brain” *The Neuroscientist* 2020, Vol. 26(2) 156–169 DOI: 10.1177/1073858419867298. In their 2015 paper Joel et al did not say that there were no sex differences. Instead of this, they described the brain as a mosaic of male and female features. Within that mosaic, various workers have since identified divergent male, transgender, and female phenotypes. In a 2020 paper Joel et al summarised the present situation by saying: “It is impossible to determine whether the differences between the groups reflect the different life experiences of individuals with different identities or preceded these experiences. It is also impossible to determine whether differences in specific brain structures are responsible for the different identities. These questions of cause and effect are further complicated by the observation that brain functions are generally not localized in one particular brain structure but distributed over circuits of large numbers of interacting brain areas”. There is also supporting evidence from other neurological studies to show that, while male and female neural differentiations on average fall into these two categories, there is such a large spread in the distribution of these identifications that large overlaps occur. Mitchell for example gives a comprehensive account of this in his book. This means that it is Joel et al themselves, who discredit the interpretation which these gender critical feminist groups place on their work. Also: rather than looking at neural activity, examining neural interconnectivity may be a more appropriate approach. Standard handbooks such as that on: “Sex Differences in Neurology and Psychiatry” show the complex interactions that exist between sex and gender, even before and soon after birth. This contradicts the arguments presented by those groups who claim the gender identity is determined by social conditioning alone. It also has major consequences for those feminist

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



movements whose gender politics are based entirely on the premise that gender is wholly socially constructed. As the feminist accounts of gender identities and transgender people show, this presumption is unquestioned in their own histories, cultures, and research.

⁸³ Mitchell, Kevin J. (2018): *"Innate: How the Wiring of our Brain Shapes Who We Are"*: Princeton University Press; ISBN 978-0-691-17388-7.

⁸⁴ I also discuss this extensively in Responsibility in Transgender Disputes: Gilchrist, S. (2021): *"Responsibility in Transgender Disputes"*: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/248P-Responsibility.pdf>: (I am presently withholding part of this document because I wish to update it in the light of the Tavistock v Bell court ruling. However key sections continue to be available).

⁸⁵ See for example Lanzenberger, R.; Kranz, G.S.; Savic, I.: (Eds) (2020): *Sex Differences in Neurology and Psychiatry* Handbook of Clinical Neurology Volume 175, 2020

⁸⁶ See section 2:0 and Bettcher, Talia, (2014): *"Feminist Perspectives on Trans Issues"*, The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy (Fall 2020 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), URL = <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2020/entries/feminism-trans/> . Mikkola, Mari, (2019) *"Feminist Perspectives on Sex and Gender"*, The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy (Fall 2019 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), URL = <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/fall2019/entries/feminism-gender/> .

⁸⁷ My article on Reform of the Gender Recognition act

⁸⁸ How men and women integrate Acceptance

⁸⁹ It is difficult to pin down exactly what *"gender ideology"* means. For gender critical feminist groups Allegations that *"male to female transsexuals believe that they somehow change biological sex"*, are foisted on transgender people. For Pope Francis *"gender Ideology"* means a belief that people are able to choose their gender identity In August 2016 Pope Francis stated: *"Its 'terrible' children taught they can choose gender"*. He also said there were powerful institutions which funded the spread of *"gender theory"* in schools. He told Polish bishops: "Today, children are taught this at school: that everyone can choose their own sex. And why do they teach this? Because the books come from those people and institutions who give money". Pope Francis has also been quoted in a book, saying that *"gender theory"*, like nuclear weapons, is a danger to humanity. Pope Benedict had previously addressed transgender issues by cautioning Catholics about *"destroying the very essence of the human creature through manipulating their God-given gender to suit their sexual choice"*.

⁹⁰ UK Parliament (2021): "Gender recognition process urgently in need of reform, say MPs" United Kingdom Parliament Select Committee Reports: 21 December 2021 <https://committees.parliament.uk/committee/328/women-and-equalities-committee/news/160020/gender->

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions



Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022

[recognition-process-urgently-in-need-of-reform-say-mps/](https://www.theguardian.com/society/2021/dec/21/uk-governments-approach-to-trans-rights-has-caused-real-distress-mps-say?fbclid=IwAR0bMjaV96W8JmR27WHN2L5VVH0uqBOGY2kz0JQvAo9Cfy7aZGm2YechJbo) Maya Wolfe-Robinson, Maya (2021): “UK government’s approach to trans rights has ‘caused real distress’, MPs say”: The Guardian 21 Dec 2021 <https://www.theguardian.com/society/2021/dec/21/uk-governments-approach-to-trans-rights-has-caused-real-distress-mps-say?fbclid=IwAR0bMjaV96W8JmR27WHN2L5VVH0uqBOGY2kz0JQvAo9Cfy7aZGm2YechJbo>

[say?fbclid=IwAR0bMjaV96W8JmR27WHN2L5VVH0uqBOGY2kz0JQvAo9Cfy7aZGm2YechJbo](https://www.theguardian.com/society/2021/dec/21/uk-governments-approach-to-trans-rights-has-caused-real-distress-mps-say?fbclid=IwAR0bMjaV96W8JmR27WHN2L5VVH0uqBOGY2kz0JQvAo9Cfy7aZGm2YechJbo)

⁹¹ Noakes, Caroline (2021): “Why am I being abused for trying to improve the gender recognition process?”: The Guardian 23 December 2021 https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2021/dec/23/why-am-i-being-abused-for-trying-to-improve-gender-recognition-process?fbclid=IwAR3Nt8FcrAykIFsnyTIRC0cAWXSY7QYSohcsWsV_NP-9gYOPsniAh6SPNhg

https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2021/dec/23/why-am-i-being-abused-for-trying-to-improve-gender-recognition-process?fbclid=IwAR3Nt8FcrAykIFsnyTIRC0cAWXSY7QYSohcsWsV_NP-9gYOPsniAh6SPNhg

⁹² Gilchrist, S. (2020): “A Comparison Of Changes To The House Of Commons Briefing Paper On “Gender Recognition And The Rights Of Transgender People” Made On The 16th July 2020”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/SuM0720a-BriefingComparisonDocument.pdf>

⁹³ Initial GRA Consultation and reform of the act

https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/721725/GRA-Consultation-document.pdf

⁹⁴ <https://commonslibrary.parliament.uk/research-briefings/cbp-9079/>

⁹⁵ <https://www.pinknews.co.uk/2020/09/22/gender-recognition-act-reform-liz-truss-announcement-self-id-trans-healthcare/>

⁹⁶ In: United Kingdom Parliament: (2021) “Conversion Therapy”: The Parliamentary Office of Science and Technology, Westminster, London SW1A 0AA 02072192840 post@parliament.uk parliament.uk/post @POST_UK Number 658 December 2021

<https://researchbriefings.files.parliament.uk/documents/POST-PN-0658/POST-PN-0658.pdf>

⁹⁷ Letter from the Minister of Equalities to the Chair of the Women and Equalities Committees, 14 July 2021.

⁹⁸ The role of the EHRC is to interpret human rights law. The advice it gives does not have legal force and is subject to the advice given in the 3010 Equality Act.

⁹⁹ Morgan, H., Lamprinakou, C., Fuller, F., Albakri, M.: (2020): “Attitudes to Transgender People August 2020”: Equality and Human Rights Commission”: Published August 2020 ISBN: 978-1-84206-830-4:

https://www.equalityhumanrights.com/sites/default/files/attitudes_to_transgender_people.pdf

¹⁰⁰ Equality and Human Rights Commission (2022): “Response submitted to UK Government consultation: Banning conversion therapy”:

26 January 2022 <https://www.equalityhumanrights.com/sites/default/files/consultation-response-banning-conversion-therapy-26-january-2022.docx>

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



¹⁰¹ EHRC (2022): Protecting people from sex and gender reassignment discrimination” EHRC 4 April 2022

<https://www.equalityhumanrights.com/en/our-work/news/protecting-people-sex-and-gender-reassignment-discrimination>

¹⁰² EHRC (2022): “Response submitted to UK Government consultation Banning conversion therapy” Equality and Human Rights Commission,

January 2022 <https://www.equalityhumanrights.com/sites/default/files/consultation-response-banning-conversion-therapy-26-january-2022.docx>

¹⁰³ <https://www.gov.scot/publications/gender-recognition-reform-scotland-bill-analysis-responses-public-consultation-exercise/> <https://sp-bpr-en-prod-cdnep.azureedge.net/published/EHRCJ/2022/1/25/8c18e05c-08ab-4c7d-992b-4b0467541d70/EHRCJS062022R1.pdf>

¹⁰⁴ <https://www.equalityhumanrights.com/sites/default/files/consultation-response-gender-recognition-act-18-october-2018.pdf>
https://www.equalityhumanrights.com/sites/default/files/gender_recognition_act.pdf

¹⁰⁵ Moore, Mallory; Links, Meryl; Clarke Sarah. (2022): “EHRC asserts protections for religious and trans conversion therapy, calls for pausing GRA reform” Transsafety Network: Thu Jan 27, 2022 (updated: 12:21) · https://transsafety.network/posts/ehrc-defends-ct-pauses-gra-reform/?fbclid=IwAR1ncCNfAYGbk5msmJ_CMh1j8ga6noc_LW1eIIZRYBH-GzRkc9rLUKeaIYQ

¹⁰⁶ Description of evidence against conversion therapy for transgender people

¹⁰⁷ Stonewall (2018): “LGBT in Britain - Trans Report”: <https://www.stonewall.org.uk/lgbt-britain-trans-report> also Stonewall/Cambridge University (2017): “School Report (2017)”: <http://www.stonewall.org.uk/school-report-2017>

¹⁰⁸ Balarajan, M., Gray, M., & Mitchell, M. (2011), Monitoring equality: Developing a gender identity question. London: National Centre for Social Research. [Accessed 16 July 2020]

¹⁰⁹ Paragraph 40 of the Equality and Human Rights Commission (2022): “Response submitted to UK Government consultation: Banning conversion therapy”: 26 January 2022

¹¹⁰ This is in part due to the legal definitions involved. In the Equality Act 2010, the protected characteristic of sex protects people from being discriminated against because of being a man or a woman (Equality Act 2010, Section 11) – defined as a male or female of any age (Equality Act 2010, Section 212 (1)). Therefore, according to this legislation, biology exclusively determines what a man or woman is. However, most people identify men and women through the ways in which people integrate into society. Many people now see that male to female transsexuals integrate seamlessly into society as women and have a proud history of fighting for women’s rights. The current Equality Act states that Protected characteristics include sex as being a man or a woman (not male or female) and gender reassignment,

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



as being an individual who is 'proposing to undergo, is undergoing or has undergone a process or part of a process to reassign their sex'. There is no requirement for a trans person to have any kind of medical supervision or intervention in order to be protected from this gender reassignment discrimination. Nor does a person need a Gender Recognition Certificate to be protected under this characteristic of gender reassignment. A trans person is protected from the moment he or she makes that declaration. That is harmful for many transgender people fight never-ending battles between their loyalty to the identity they sense inside, and their loyalty to the love and commitments they have made. In order to maintain these relationships, the first requirement is to create self-acceptance and create self-esteem so that conflicts do not explode, and catastrophic collapse occurs. This is the type of affirmative approach adopted by the professional medical institutions. As it stands the current equality act requires trans people to lie in order to gain that protection. The legislation also fails because it considers sex and gender only in binary terms

¹¹¹ UK Government (2010): Equality Act <https://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/2010/15/contents>

¹¹² See sections 3:0 to 11:00 of Gilchrist, S. (2019a): *"Divisions: Self-Declaration and Gender Variant People"*: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/243P-DivisionsSelfDeclaration.pdf>

¹¹³ UK Government (2010) Equality Act Notes <https://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/2010/15/notes>

¹¹⁴ Intersex people (the term used to describe a variety of conditions in which a person is born with a reproductive or sexual anatomy that doesn't fit the typical definitions of female or male) are not explicitly protected from discrimination by the Equality Act, but you must not be discriminated against because of your sex or perceived sex. For example:

if a woman with an intersex condition is refused entry to a women-only swimming pool because the attendants think her to be a man, this could be sex discrimination or disability discrimination Equalities and Human Rights Commission; (2021): *"Gender reassignment discrimination. Advice and guidance"*: Last updated 22 Dec 2021 <https://www.equalityhumanrights.com/en/advice-and-guidance/gender-reassignment-discrimination>

¹¹⁵ UK Government (2010) Equality Act Notes <https://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/2010/15/notes>

¹¹⁶ For those who argue that gender identity is purely a socially learned construct, the issue is one of male domination and power over women. From this perspective, those male-to-female transsexuals who identify as women are understood to erase women's identities and attack women's sex-based rights: their argument is that social conditioning creates boundaries that cannot be crossed. This gives strong reasons for adopting autogynephilic explanations for transsexuality, where homosexuality is regarded as a personality variation and is a

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



fundamental and clearly defined element of identity, while male-to-female transsexuality is regarded as a sublimated sexually motivated paraphilia or disruption of homosexuality instead.

¹¹⁷ Additional comments include: This (treatment) should include support to reduce distress and reconcile a person to their biological sex where clinically indicated, including for children and young people aged under 18 if this is in their best interests (para 7). Proposals to restrict the promotion of conversion therapy could curtail freedom of expression. However, given the evidence that conversion therapy is statistically associated with negative health outcomes... a provider of what might be considered conversion therapy should supply the individual with information about the likely effectiveness of this treatment (para 20). This offence should not capture communication such as casual conversations, exchanges of views or private prayer, with the distinction defined clearly in the legislation (para 28). Encouraging people to comply with religious doctrine that requires refraining from certain types of sexual activity should not fall within the definition of conversion therapy either. However, faith and community leaders should be made aware of the ban on conversion therapy in order that they understand the importance of compliance (para 6): Equality and Human Rights Commission (2022): “Response submitted to UK Government consultation: Banning conversion therapy”: 26 January 2022

¹¹⁸ The role of the EHRC is to interpret human rights law. The advice it gives does not have legal force and is subject to the advice given in the 3010 Equality Act.

¹¹⁹ It is alleged that the EHRC held several private meetings and exchanged correspondence with gender-critical groups <https://www.pinknews.co.uk/2022/02/02/ehrc-equalities-watchdog-trans-lgb-alliance-fair-play-women/>
<https://www.pinknews.co.uk/2022/02/02/ehrc-equalities-watchdog-trans-lgb-alliance-fair-play-women/>

¹²⁰ The Independent (2002) “Liz Truss faces criticism for failing to set up new LGBT+ advisory panel nine months after scrapping old one”. The Independent 9 January 2022 <https://www.independent.co.uk/news/uk/politics/liz-truss-lgbt-panel-government-b1988136.html>

¹²¹ The role of the EHRC is to interpret human rights law. The advice it gives does not have legal force and is subject to the advice given in the 3010 Equality Act.

¹²² The role of the EHRC is to interpret human rights law. The advice it gives does not have legal force and is subject to the advice given in the 3010 Equality Act.

¹²³ See Paragraphs 3, 4, 7, 31 of the EHRC response document: Equality and Human Rights Commission (2022): “Response submitted to UK Government consultation: Banning conversion therapy”: 26 January 2022

¹²⁴ Gov UK (2019) National LGBT Survey and Action Plan” <https://www.gov.uk/government/collections/national-lgbt-survey-2017>

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



¹²⁵ Gov UK (2021): “The prevalence of Conversion Therapy in the UK” 29 October 2021 <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/the-prevalence-of-conversion-therapy-in-the-uk/the-prevalence-of-conversion-therapy-in-the-uk>

¹²⁶ Paragraph 2 of the Equality and Human Rights Commission (2022): “Response submitted to UK Government consultation: Banning conversion therapy”: 26 January 2022

¹²⁷ Gov UK: (2021) “Conversion Therapy: an Evidence Assessment and Quantitative Study” 29 October 2021: <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/conversion-therapy-an-evidence-assessment-and-qualitative-study/conversion-therapy-an-evidence-assessment-and-qualitative-study#what-are-the-outcomes-of-conversion-therapy-1>

¹²⁸ Paragraph 4

¹²⁹ Royal College of Psychiatry (2018) Supporting transgender and gender-diverse people March 2018 PS02/18 https://www.rcpsych.ac.uk/pdf/PS02_18.pdf

¹³⁰ MoU2 Conversion therapy is the term for therapy that assumes certain sexual orientations or gender identities are inferior to others and seeks to change or suppress them on that basis. The 2017 Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) makes it clear that conversion therapy in relation to gender identity and sexual orientation (including asexuality) is unethical, potentially harmful and is not supported by evidence. It updates the 2015 version released at the Department of Health, which focused exclusively on sexual orientation. <https://www.bacp.co.uk/events-and-resources/ethics-and-standards/mou/>

¹³¹ APA (2018): Position Statement on Conversion Therapy: American Psychiatric Association <https://www.psychiatry.org/File%20Library/About-APA/Organization-Documents-Policies/Policies/Position-Conversion-Therapy.pdf>

¹³² World Professional Association for Transgender Health. (2012). *Standards of Care for the Health of Transsexual, Transgender, and Gender Nonconforming People* [7th Version]. <https://www.wpath.org/publications/soc>

¹³³ TGEU (2018): “World Health Organisation moves to end classifying trans identities as mental illness” Posted on 18. June 2018 <https://tgeu.org/world-health-organisation-moves-to-end-classifying-trans-identities-as-mental-illness/> WHO, (2018): “WHO releases new *International Classification of Diseases (ICD-11)*” [http://www.who.int/news-room/detail/17-06-2018-who-releases-new-international-classification-of-diseases-\(icd-11\)](http://www.who.int/news-room/detail/17-06-2018-who-releases-new-international-classification-of-diseases-(icd-11))

¹³⁴ UNHCR (2020): Report on conversion therapy: The United Nations Committee on Human Rights <https://www.ohchr.org/EN/Issues/SexualOrientationGender/Pages/ReportOnConversiontherapy.aspx>

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



-
- ¹³⁵ Ashley, Florence. (2108): “List of professional organisations opposing conversion or reparative therapy targeting transgender and gender non-conforming individuals” The Medium October 5 2018 <https://medium.com/@florence.ashley/list-of-professional-organisations-opposing-conversion-or-reparative-therapy-targeting-transgender-f700b4e02c4e>
- ¹³⁶ GOV UK (2021): “An assessment of the evidence on conversion therapy for sexual orientation and gender identity” 29 October 2021 <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/an-assessment-of-the-evidence-on-conversion-therapy-for-sexual-orientation-and-gender-identity/an-assessment-of-the-evidence-on-conversion-therapy-for-sexual-orientation-and-gender-identity>
- ¹³⁷ The main findings from the studies were that: *There is no robust evidence that conversion therapy can achieve its stated therapeutic aim of changing sexual orientation or gender identity. The types of practices tend to be similar for conversion therapy for sexual orientation and for gender identity – for example, talking therapies delivered by faith groups or mental health professionals. Conversion therapies were associated with self-reported harms among research participants who had experienced conversion therapy for sexual orientation and for gender identity – for example, negative mental health effects like depression and feeling suicidal. There is indicative evidence from surveys that transgender respondents were as likely or more likely to be offered and receive conversion therapy than non-transgender lesbian, gay or bisexual (LGB) respondents*. Gov UK: (2021) “Conversion Therapy: an Evidence Assessment and Quantitative Study” 29 October 2021: <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/conversion-therapy-an-evidence-assessment-and-qualitative-study/conversion-therapy-an-evidence-assessment-and-qualitative-study#what-are-the-outcomes-of-conversion-therapy-1>
- ¹³⁸ Gilchrist, S. (2021a): “Gender Identity, Feminism, and Transgender People”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/250P-GenderIdentityAndTrans.pdf> also Gilchrist, S. (2019): “Interpreting Science and Challenges to Gender Identity Research” <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/243P-InterpretationsSelfDeclaration.pdf>
- ¹³⁹ Gilchrist, S. (2020b): “Responsibility in Transgender Disputes”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/248P-Responsibiity.pdf>
- ¹⁴⁰ Farley, H. (2021) “Gay conversion therapy: Hundreds of religious leaders call for ban”: BBC News: 16 December 2021: <https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-55326461> Greenhalgh, H. (2020) *Hundreds of global faith leaders call for ban on LGBT+ conversion therapy*: Reuters 16 December 2021: <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-religion-lgbt-rights-trfn-idUSKBN28Q00U>
- ¹⁴¹ Global Interfaith Commission Principles: These were announced at 630pm on Tuesday 22 March 2022 after an Act of Commitment led by the Dean of St Paul's. <https://www.globalinterfaith.lgbt/safeguarding/>
- ¹⁴² This is the initiative of the new [Global Interfaith Commission on LGBT+ Lives](#), overseen by partners the [Ozanne Foundation](#). They said today:

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



"We recognise that certain religious teachings have, throughout the ages, been misused to cause deep pain and offense to those who are lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, queer and intersex. This must change. That is why we have launched the Global Interfaith Commission on LGBT+ Lives, which aims to provide a strong and authoritative voice from religious leaders across the global faith community who wish to affirm and celebrate the dignity of all, independent of a person's sexuality, gender expression and gender identity". More than 370 religious leaders from over 35 countries have already signed the declaration including Dr Mary Macaleese, former President of the Republic of Ireland and Archbishop Desmond Tutu from South Africa. The initial list of signatories includes nine Archbishops, 51 Bishops and 16 Deans from across the Anglican Communion, 65 rabbis and various religious leaders from the Sikh, Muslim, Buddhist and Hindu religions. <https://opentable.lgbt/our-news/2020/12/16/otn-patrons-sign-global-interfaith-declaration-on-the-sanctity-of-life-and-the-dignity-of-all>

¹⁴³ Gallagher S and Parry J (2022) "Conversion therapy: Ban to go ahead but not cover trans people" BBC News 2 April 2022 <https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-60947028>

¹⁴⁴ Cooper, J. (2021) "Recommendations On Effectively Legislating for A Ban On Conversion Practices By The Ban 'Conversion Therapy' Legal Forum" Cooper Report https://www.ozanne.foundation/cooper_report/

¹⁴⁵ HRC Foundation: (ND): "The Lies and Dangers of Efforts to Change Sexual Orientation or Gender Identity" <https://www.hrc.org/resources/the-lies-and-dangers-of-reparative-therapy>

¹⁴⁶ See also McCay, Layla (2021): "Conversion therapy survey findings" Findings from the Health and Care LGBTQ+ Network and the Mental Health Network's survey asking for members' views on the conversion ban consultation. 7 December 2021 <https://www.nhsconfed.org/articles/conversion-therapy-survey-findings>

¹⁴⁷ Beardsley, C., O'Brien, M. (2016): "This Is my body: Hearing the theology of transgender Christians": Paperback: 240 pages Publisher: Darton Longman & Todd (26 May 2016) ISBN-10: 0232532060 ISBN-13: 978-0232532067: Dowd ,C., Beardsley, C., and Tanis, J., (2018) "Transfaith: 'a transgender pastoral resource'" Paperback 224 pages Publisher: Darton Longman and Todd ISBN 978 0 232 53311 8 Beardsley, C., Dowd, C.: (2020): "Trans Affirming Churches: How to Celebrate Gender-Variant People and Their Loved Ones 19 Mar. 2020 Paperback: 176 pages: Publisher: Jessica Kingsley Publishers (19 Mar. 2020) ISBN-10: 1785925326 ISBN-13: 978-1785925320

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



¹⁴⁸ Burns, Christine (editor) (2018). “Trans Britain: Our Journey from the Shadows” Unbound: ISBN-10: 1783524715 ISBN-13 : 978-1783524716 and by Chevasutt, Chrissie (2021): “*Heaven Come Down: The story of a transgender disciple*” Darton, Longman & Todd Ltd ISBN-10: 1913657205 ISBN-13 : 978-1913657208

¹⁴⁹ Transgender Books Bibliography. See for example <https://www.theguardian.com/books/2015/oct/21/top-10-transgender-books>
<https://www.penguinrandomhouse.com/the-read-down/books-by-trans-non-binary-and-gender-non-conforming-authors/>

¹⁵⁰ <https://www.transgendertrend.com/>

¹⁵¹ <https://womansplaceuk.org/>

¹⁵² <https://lgballiance.org.uk/>

¹⁵³ https://ec.europa.eu/info/policies/justice-and-fundamental-rights/combating-discrimination/lesbian-gay-bi-trans-and-intersex-equality/studies-and-research-lgbti-equality_en

¹⁵⁴ PACE (2022): “*Rights of LGBTI people: advances achieved are under threat, PACE says*” Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe: 25 January 2022 <https://pace.coe.int/en/news/8582/rights-of-lgbti-people-advances-achieved-are-under-threat-pace-says>;

Council of Europe (2021) “*LGBTI Persons’ Rights*”: September 2022

<https://rm.coe.int/thematic-factsheet-lgbti-eng/1680a3b2d7> “Adopting a resolution based on a report by Fourat Ben Chikha (Belgium, SOC), the Assembly strongly condemned “the extensive and often virulent attacks on the rights of LGBTI people for several years” notably in Hungary, Poland, the Russian Federation, Turkey and the United Kingdom, stressing that the significant advances achieved in recent years were today under threat. During the debate, in which intervened the European Commissioner for Equality Helena Dalli, the parliamentarians deplored anti-gender narratives, which reduce the fight for the equality and rights of LGBTI people to what some conservative movements deliberately mis-characterise as “gender ideology” or “LGBTI ideology”. For a gender-critical viewpoint see:

Hayton Debbie (2022) “*Stop saying the UK is transphobic*” Blog: 3 February 2022

<https://debbiehayton.com/tag/parliamentary-assembly/>

¹⁵⁵ <https://www.gov.uk/government/consultations/banning-conversion-therapy>

¹⁵⁶ <https://publications.parliament.uk/pa/cm5802/cmselect/cmwomeq/977/summary.html>

¹⁵⁷ As equalities minister, Truss has the power to appoint new commissioners to the board of the Equality and Human Rights Commission (EHRC), an ostensibly independent body that “promotes and upholds” equality law across England, Scotland, and Wales. She has used this power to make two appointments that sparked worry in the trans community. In November 2020, Baroness Kishwer Falkner was

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



named chair of the EHRC, and promptly said that her watchdog would protect “freedom of belief”, including “gender critical” beliefs, and that it is “entirely reasonable” to question trans people’s gender identity. In December 2021, Truss appointed the barrister Akua Reindorf to the board of the Equality and Human Rights Commission. Reindorf is known in the community for her review of the “de-platforming” of two anti-trans speakers at the University of Essex, which was highly critical of Stonewall’s trans inclusion advice. Appointments to the EHRC are likely to outlast Truss’ role overseeing equalities, and paints a troubling picture for the rights of trans and non-binary people.

¹⁵⁸ Adams, Richard (2021): “Sussex professor resigns after transgender rights row” BBC News 28 October 2021

<https://www.theguardian.com/world/2021/oct/28/sussex-professor-kathleen-stock-resigns-after-transgender-rights-row>

¹⁵⁹ See Section 12 of Gilchrist, S. (2021a): “*Gender Identity, Feminism, and Transgender People*”:

<http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/250P-GenderIdentityAndTrans.pdf> Stock, K., (2018): “*Why self-identification should not legally make you a woman*” “The Conversation” October 1, 2018 <https://theconversation.com/why-self-identification-should-not-legally-make-you-a-woman-103372>

Also sections D and E in Gilchrist, S. (2020b): “*Responsibility in Transgender Disputes*”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/248P-Responsibility.pdf>

¹⁶⁰ Stock, K (2020): “Written evidence from Professor Kathleen Stock (FOE0029) to the UK Government consultation on reform of the Gender Recognition Act:

13 November 2020 <https://committees.parliament.uk/writtenevidence/16374/pdf/>

¹⁶¹ Parsons, V: (2020) “A ‘gender-critical’ academic awarded an OBE in the New Year Honours list has branded LGBT+ charity Stonewall “a threat to freedom of speech” in a diatribe about “gender identity ideology”. Pink News December 31, 2020

<https://www.pinknews.co.uk/2020/12/31/kathleen-stock-obe-stonewall-twitter-trans-gender-critical-new-year-honours/>

¹⁶² Parsons, Vic. (2021): “*Outraged academics condemn government for handing anti-trans professor Kathleen Stock an OBE*” Pink News 6 January 2021 <https://www.pinknews.co.uk/2021/01/06/kathleen-stock-obe-transphobia-open-letter/>

¹⁶³ It should be noted that I have known Debbie well as a friend and I hope I still do. We have worked together on those transgender issues we agree with and agreed to disagree in areas where we do not. While I greatly regret the views she now expresses, I no longer know how to doubt her personal integrity and the sincerity of her belief in holding these gender critical views. I believe that it is important to call out views I disagree with, but in no way should this be considered a personal attack. For more on this you may wish to look at: Gilchrist, S. (2018b): “*Transgender People and Women’s Concerns*”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/243P-TransgenderSocialIssues.pdf> and

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



Gilchrist, S. (2019a): “Divisions: Self-Declaration and Gender Variant People”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/243P-DivisionsSelfDeclaration.pdf>

¹⁶⁴ Hayton, Debbie (2021): “Stonewall’s annus horribilis”. The Spectator 28 December 2021 <https://www.spectator.co.uk/article/stonewall-s-annus-horribilis>

¹⁶⁵ Hayton, Debbie; (2020): “Gender identity is bollocks” Spectator Australia, 4 April 20 <https://www.spectator.com.au/2020/04/gender-identity-is-bollocks/20> See some of Debbie Hayton’s papers: <https://www.spectator.co.uk/writer/debbie-hayton>

¹⁶⁶ Brown, David (2021): “A philosopher who resigned from her university post after criticism of her views on trans issues ridiculed an academic conference which questions if the UK is a “rainy fascism island”. The Times December 20th. 2021 <https://www.thetimes.co.uk/article/professor-kathleen-stock-academic-in-trans-row-mocks-sex-conference-09mt3fmxq>

Hayton, Debbie (2022): “Stop saying the UK is transphobic”: Unherd 3 February 2022: <https://debbiehayton.com/tag/parliamentary-assembly/>

¹⁶⁷ See section 2:0: “Feminism and Transgender Issues” of Gilchrist, S. (2021a): “Gender Identity, Feminism, and Transgender People”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/250P-GenderIdentityAndTrans.pdf>

¹⁶⁸ See for example Abeni, C. (2015) “Feminist Germaine Greer Goes on Anti-Trans Rant Over Caitlyn Jenner” The Advocate, October 26th. 2015. <https://www.advocate.com/caitlyn-jenner/2015/10/26/feminist-germaine-greer-goes-anti-trans-rant-over-caitlyn-jenner> This is more thoroughly elaborated in Janice Raymond’s Book: (Raymond, Janice, (1979) “The transsexual empire: The making of the she-male”, Boston: Beacon Press).

¹⁶⁹ EHRC(2022): Protecting people from sex and gender reassignment discrimination” EHRC 4 April 2022 <https://www.equalityhumanrights.com/en/our-work/news/protecting-people-sex-and-gender-reassignment-discrimination>

¹⁷⁰ Syal, Rajeev (2022): “Trans people can be excluded from single-sex services if ‘justifiable’, says EHRC” Guardian 4 April 2022 <https://www.theguardian.com/society/2022/apr/04/trans-people-can-be-excluded-single-sex-services-if-justifiable-says-ehrc>

¹⁷¹ Additional comments include: This (treatment) should include support to reduce distress and reconcile a person to their biological sex where clinically indicated, including for children and young people aged under 18 if this is in their best interests (para 7). Proposals to restrict the promotion of conversion therapy could curtail freedom of expression. However, given the evidence that conversion therapy is statistically associated with negative health outcomes... a provider of what might be considered conversion therapy should supply the individual with information about the likely effectiveness of this treatment (para 20). This offence should not capture communication such

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions



Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022

as casual conversations, exchanges of views or private prayer, with the distinction defined clearly in the legislation (para 28). Encouraging people to comply with religious doctrine that requires refraining from certain types of sexual activity should not fall within the definition of conversion therapy either. However, faith and community leaders should be made aware of the ban on conversion therapy in order that they understand the importance of compliance (para 6): Equality and Human Rights Commission (2022): "Response submitted to UK Government consultation: Banning conversion therapy": 26 January 2022

¹⁷² Stewart H., and Elgot, J. (2022): "Gay and trans rights issues divide both Tories and Labour" The Guardian Fri 1 Apr 2022

<https://www.theguardian.com/politics/2022/apr/01/gay-and-trans-rights-issues-divide-both-tories-and-labour>. At a back-slapping dinner for Conservative MPs, Boris Johnson greeted his colleagues with a typical joke, aimed at exploiting Labour's discomfort over the sensitive issue of gender: "Good evening, ladies and gentlemen. Or, as Keir Starmer would put it, people who are assigned female or male at birth," he quipped. From this starting point of ridiculing and misrepresenting transgender people, in the House of Commons he later praised Jamie Wallis for his courage in coming out as transgender. Johnson also tweeted "Sharing this very intimate story would have taken an immense amount of courage. Thank you @JamieWallisMP, for your bravery, which will undoubtedly support others. The Conservative Party I lead will always give you, and everyone else, the love and support you need to be yourself. Nicholson, K. (2022) "Boris Johnson Joked About Trans People Hours Before Conservative MP Came Out" Huffington Post 30 march 2022

https://www.huffingtonpost.co.uk/entry/boris-johnson-trans-people-jamie-wallis_uk_624415b4e4b0d8266aa56c44

¹⁷³ Intersex people (the term used to describe a variety of conditions in which a person is born with a reproductive or sexual anatomy that doesn't fit the typical definitions of female or male) are not explicitly protected from discrimination by the Equality Act, but you must not be discriminated against because of your sex or perceived sex. For example:

if a woman with an intersex condition is refused entry to a women-only swimming pool because the attendants think her to be a man, this could be sex discrimination or disability discrimination Equalities and Human Rights Commission; (2021): "Gender reassignment discrimination. Advice and guidance": Last updated 22 Dec 2021 <https://www.equalityhumanrights.com/en/advice-and-guidance/gender-reassignment-discrimination>

¹⁷⁴ Parry, J and Moss, L (2022) "'Safe To Be Me' LGBT conference cancelled after boycott" BBC News 5 April 2022

<https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-61002448>

¹⁷⁵ .Practices should not be banned that enable individuals to explore, reflect on or understand their sexual orientation or being transgender. Nor should LGBT people be prevented from seeking spiritual support from their faith leader in the exploration of their sexual

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions



Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022

orientation or being transgender, including within their families, schools and communities. Encouraging people to comply with religious doctrine that requires refraining from certain types of sexual activity should not fall within the definition of conversion therapy either. However, faith and community leaders should be made aware of the ban on conversion therapy in order that they understand the importance of compliance.

¹⁷⁶ This offence should not capture communication such as casual conversations, exchanges of views or private prayer, with the distinction defined clearly in the legislation.

¹⁷⁷ Church of England (2017): *“Marriage and Same Sex Relationships after the Shared Conversations. A Report from the House of Bishops”*: General Synod Document 2055 <https://www.churchofengland.org/media/3863472/gs-2055-marriage-and-same-sexrelationships-after-the-shared-conversations-report-from-the-house-of-bishops.pdf>: See also: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/229PGS2055.pdf>

¹⁷⁸ the Global Anglican Futures Movement <https://www.gafcon.org/about/global-movement>

¹⁷⁹ As translated from the Russian by Jacob Lassin, Postdoctoral Fellow at the Melikian Center for Russian, Eurasian, and East European Studies. : *“Eight years ago there were attempts to destroy what existed in Donbass. And in Donbass there is an aversion, a fundamental rejection of the so-called values offered by those who claim worldly power. Today there is a loyalty test for for this power, a kind of permit to that 'happy world,' the world of excess consumption, the world of visible 'freedom.' Today there is such a loyalty test, And you know what that test is? The test is very simple and at the same time horrible—it is a gay parade. Demands to many to hold gay parades are a loyalty test for that most mighty world; and we know that if people or countries refuse these demands than they will not be part of that world, they will become foreign to it.* Also, Putin’s comments on J.K. Rowling and: Stewart, W. Newman, J. (2022):*“Vladimir Putin slams 'monstrous' West for teaching children they can change their gender, saying it is 'close to a crime against humanity”*”: Mail Online 21 October 2021 <https://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-10117735/Vladimir-Putin-slams-monstrous-West-teaching-children-change-gender.html> . Putin’s comments closely follow those of Pope Francis.

¹⁸⁰ Church of England House of Bishops (2022); Meeting Report: Thursday March 24 2022: <https://www.churchofengland.org/media-and-news/press-releases/house-bishops-thursday-march-24>

¹⁸¹ McElwee, Joshua. (2015): “Francis strongly criticizes gender theory, comparing it to nuclear arms”: National Catholic Reporter (US) Feb. 13, 2015 <https://www.ncronline.org/news/vatican/francis-strongly-criticizes-gender-theory-comparing-nuclear-arms>

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



¹⁸² Stewart, W. Newman, J. (2022): “Vladimir Putin slams ‘monstrous’ West for teaching children they can change their gender, saying it is ‘close to a crime against humanity’”: Mail Online 21 October 2021 <https://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-10117735/Vladimir-Putin-slams-monstrous-West-teaching-children-change-gender.html> . Putin’s comments closely follow those of Pope Francis.

¹⁸³ Cite personal Malpractice article

¹⁸⁴ Soteriou, Emma (2022) “Sajid Javid ‘to launch inquiry into gender treatment’ as system is ‘failing children’”. LBC News 23 April 2022 <https://www.lbc.co.uk/news/sajid-javid-review-child-gender-treatment-system/>

¹⁸⁵ Butler, Judith (1999): “Gender Trouble: Feminism and The Subversion of Identity”: Routledge New York And London: <http://eng296.digitalwcu.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/09/butler-gender-trouble-chapter-1-w-RC-selections.pdf>
[http://www.kyoolee.net/GENDER_TROUBLE - Preface - Butler.pdf](http://www.kyoolee.net/GENDER_TROUBLE_-_Preface_-_Butler.pdf)

¹⁸⁶ Hayton article on Stonewall and Kathleen stock condemnations

¹⁸⁷ Hayton, Debbie (2021): “Stonewall’s annus horribilis”. The Spectator 28 December 2021 <https://www.spectator.co.uk/article/stonewall-s-annus-horribilis>

¹⁸⁸ For more detailed discussion see section 2:0 of Gilchrist, S. (2021a): “Gender Identity, Feminism, and Transgender People”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/250P-GenderIdentityAndTrans.pdf>

¹⁸⁹ See for example: Lanzenberger, R.; Kranz, G.S.; Savic, I.: (Eds) (2020): *Sex Differences in Neurology and Psychiatry*” Handbook of Clinical Neurology Volume 175, 2020 also section D of Gilchrist, S. (2020b): “Responsibility in Transgender Disputes”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/248P-Responsibility.pdf>

¹⁹⁰ In her book “Gender Trouble”, first published in 1990¹⁴, Judith Butler argued that behavioural manifestations are present prior to the existence of gender identity and a sexed body¹⁵ (rather than the other way around), However, in this book she called into question the pre-existence of any group of gender-based characteristics prior to the enforcement of a gender role. She followed Freud in seeing the ego as formed largely through a process of complex identifications. Under Freud, the cognitive abilities needed to transform these behavioural manifestations into personal identifications are not considered to be present until about the age of three years. For Butler therefore gender identity becomes a socially learned performative act¹⁷ and all understandings of the driving forces in gender identity in these feminist narratives become associated with power and sex, masculinity and femininity, social learning, and the gender role^{18 19}. Freudian approaches with sexually motivated psychodynamic theories, and by implication Butler in her 1990 book, and in her

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions



Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022

other publications of the time, considered that before the age of three little in the way of structure is understood to be created. Section 2:0 Feminism and Transgender Issues Gilchrist, S. (2021a): “*Gender Identity, Feminism, and Transgender People*”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/250P-GenderIdentityAndTrans.pdf>

¹⁹¹ Butler, J., 1990, “*Performative Acts and Gender Constitution*”, in *Performing Feminisms*, S-E. Case (ed.), Baltimore: John Hopkins University.

¹⁹² To understand the attitude that Judith Butler takes today to transgender issues, the You Tube video: “*Feminist icon Judith Butler on JK Rowling, trans rights, feminism and intersectionality*” should be viewed See Butler’s YouTube video <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=tXJb2eLNJZE>

¹⁹³ Butler, Judith, (2021): “Why is the idea of ‘gender’ provoking backlash the world over?” the Guardian 23 October 2021: <https://www.theguardian.com/us-news/commentisfree/2021/oct/23/judith-butler-gender-ideology-backlash?fbclid=IwAR0rB1GFwR8N88U-cPMYXrpCQ2FQLzge5IUfNISuckXkhNzVEarOg66uh0s>

¹⁹⁴ Mitchell Book

¹⁹⁵ See for example: Gilchrist, S. (2019b): “*The Development of Transgender Behaviour and Identities in Early Life*”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/243P-BehaviourSelfIdentity.pdf>

¹⁹⁶ Give reference to safeguarding transgender children

¹⁹⁷ It is difficult to pin down exactly what “*gender ideology*” means. For gender critical feminist groups Allegations that “*male to female transsexuals believe that they somehow change biological sex*”, are foisted on transgender people. For Pope Francis “*gender Ideology*” means a belief that people are able to choose their gender identity In August 2016 Pope Francis stated: “*Its ‘terrible’ children taught they can choose gender*”. He also said there were powerful institutions which funded the spread of “*gender theory*” in schools. He told Polish bishops: “Today, children are taught this at school: that everyone can choose their own sex. And why do they teach this? Because the books come from those people and institutions who give money”. Pope Francis has also been quoted in a book, saying that “*gender theory*”, like nuclear weapons, is a danger to humanity. Pope Benedict had previously addressed transgender issues by cautioning Catholics about “*destroying the very essence of the human creature through manipulating their God-given gender to suit their sexual choice*”.

¹⁹⁸ Pope Francis (2016): “It’s ‘terrible’ children taught they can choose gender” Catholic Herald 3 August 2016 <http://catholicherald.co.uk/news/2016/08/03/pope-francis-its-terrible-children-taught-they-can-choose-gender/>

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



¹⁹⁹ For more detailed discussion see Gilchrist, S. (2017a): "No, Pope Francis: Gender Identity is not a Choice". <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/227P-No-PopeFrancis.pdf>

²⁰⁰ McElwee, Joshua. (2015): "Francis strongly criticizes gender theory, comparing it to nuclear arms": National Catholic Reporter (US) Feb. 13, 2015 <https://www.ncronline.org/news/vatican/francis-strongly-criticizes-gender-theory-comparing-nuclear-arms>

²⁰¹ In that paper, I note that: "Gender and sexuality go their different ways. Many transsexuals marry in their imposed gender role for all the right reasons and love they possess. However, as age increases the drive gets stronger and if no way is found to manage these dynamics the outcome can be a total, sudden, and catastrophic collapse. This can have devastating results. When gender and sexuality are in conflict it is usually sexuality that is suppressed. There is the destruction of relationships and commitments through the failure to cope, even when love is as strong as ever. There is the blame for letting oneself down, the hurt to other people that has been caused and the guilt for the inability to conform to the edicts of others and one's own expectations. Crippling harm can be created by the attitudes of some religious groups who heap guilt on transsexuals who cannot follow the path they prescribe. The trauma that this creates can be enormous and further attempts to fight the conflict only accelerate the demand. Much of one's self-identity is built on a foundation that is wrong and a different approach is required. This must calm the dynamics and provide a firm base".

²⁰² It is "impossible" for God to "bless sin", the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith (CDF) BBC (2021): "Catholic Church 'cannot bless same-sex unions'" BBC News:Published 15 March 2021 <https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-56402096>

²⁰³ For background info see Chaplain, Chloe (2021): "Government 'has no interest' in banning trans people from single-sex toilets, Liz Truss tells equalities tsar" I news: February 21, 2022 <https://inews.co.uk/news/politics/government-no-interest-banning-trans-people-single-sex-toilets-liz-truss-tells-equalities-tsar-1474413>

²⁰⁴ Safe To Be Me: A Global Equality Conference on LGBT Rights Statement made to the UK House of Commons on 17 May 2021

²⁰⁵ It is not just this research that should be considered. When Penny Mordaunt; then the United Kingdom Equalities Minister launched the consultation on reforming the 2004 Gender Recognition Act she declared that "Trans Women are Women. That is the starting point of the consultation". If gender identity is the primary marker for social interaction her statement that "Trans Women are Women" is quite correct. However, Penny Mordant was doing more than this. Not only was she saying that for legal purposes trans women must be regarded as women for the starting point of the consultation, she was affirming not only the experiences of many transgender people and results of this research, but also the conclusions of the professional medical institutions, the scientific consensus, the memorandum of understanding,

Transgender Disputes, Conversion Therapy and Government Actions

Susan Gilchrist

21 July 2022



and the mass of experiential evidence which shows that trans women relate as themselves and to others in society in the same way that any woman who was forced to live as a man might expect.

²⁰⁶ In September 2020, the UK government published the results of the public consultation which showed wide support for all aspects of reform, including 64% in favour of removing the requirement for a diagnosis of gender dysphoria and 80% in favour of removing the requirement for a medical report. However, the UK government decided not to change the current law, which was described as "a missed opportunity" by the Equality and Human Rights Commission.

²⁰⁷ This may also be enforced through a separate "Interpretation Act"