

What does it mean to be Transgender?

Susan Gilchrist

242P

25 September 2017 Updated 8 February 2018

To access this document online type the web address: www.tgdr.co.uk into your browser and follow the "Selected Papers" or the "Bibliography" tab

This document can be directly accessed online at: Gilchrist, S. (2017): "What does it mean to be Transgender?" <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/242P-TransgenderIdentities.pdf>

What does it mean to be Transgender?

Susan Gilchrist¹

SuK0208d²

25 September 2017: Updated 8 February 2018

Summary

For over one hundred years Freudian psychodynamics, and the theories derived from it have been recognised as gold standards in the fields of psychology and psychiatry. Freud himself recognised the need for a driving force which could propel development with the intensity that his theory demanded. He chose the sexual impulse. However sexually differentiated behaviour does not become apparent until around the age of three years. Freud recognised the period up to the age of three years to be a time of seething feelings, however because of the lack of cognitive abilities at this time it was considered that only limited development took place. During the nineteen fifties and sixties René Girard put forward an alternative driving mechanism based on his studies of young babies. This relies on strong, contagious and innately driven demands for possession, rivalry and imitation, which are present from birth. From the latter part of the last century, neurophysiologically

¹ Personal Biography <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/SusanBiographyPapers.pdf>

² Gilchrist, S. (2017): "What does it mean to be Transgender?": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/242P-TransgenderIdentities.pdf>

Gilchrist, S. (2017): "What Does it mean to be Transgender?" 242P

First Issued: 25 December 2017. Last update: 8 February 2018.

Draft: Printed: 11/02/2018 17:35

Access via: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/articles/index.htm>

spap4144@gmail.com

1

based research work pioneered by Gallese, Dawkins and others have provided the scientific foundations which affirm and justify the developmental driving mechanisms that Girard had observed. However a failing of Girard's work was his assumption, like Freud's, that the processes of cognitive development had sufficient strength to guide development at all times of life. That still applies, and in much of present day understanding the crucial contributions to the development of personality and identity during the first three years of life are unobserved.

That omission is challenged in this investigation where the advances in neuroscience are used to examine how development takes place. It is demonstrated that the physiological, neurological and psychological aspects of brain development act together to form a finely tuned system in which the maximum amount of individuality, possessiveness, intelligence and inquisitiveness, together with a continuity of identity and the minimum degree of energy expenditure is created. It is further shown that the extreme contagion of the internally generated self-reinforcing and fragmented physiological development processes provides the driving forces behind them. Although pre-natal influences are often thought to affect the direction that is taken, from a statistical point of view it can also be shown that a proportion of people with gender or sexually variant identities will be created without being driven by any external cause. This also means that for everyone the development of their own identity and allegiance, atypical or not, proceeds in the same way. A consequence of this is that gender and sexually variant people develop an identity and allegiance which is contrary to their biological sex: but this is at least as firmly held as those for whom their identity and allegiance follow a normal path, indeed it could be even stronger because it has had to be fought for along the way.

These conclusions challenge the traditional approaches to psychology and psychiatry. They also contradict the traditional Christian doctrines which presume that these elements of personality and identity arise from cognitive processes whose outcomes are based on the search for reward. The results of this research and the present scientific consensus show that they are founded on a search for identity instead. The methods of managing each of these conditions are almost opposite to one another and a misdiagnosis occurs. This document describes what it means to manage these demands. A new approach to self-identity and personality development is also presented.

This document can be directly accessed online at: Gilchrist, S. (2017): "What does it mean to be Transgender?" <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/242P-TransgenderIdentities.pdf>

© Susan Gilchrist 2017 and 2018

What does it mean to be Transgender?

Susan Gilchrist³

SuK0208d⁴

25 September 2017: Updated 8 February 2018

1:0: Introduction

People may ask a transgender person, if a man, why does that person want to become a woman, and vice versa? Given the intensity of the drive and the way it is pursued, it is understandable that this viewpoint is expressed.

However, that is the wrong question, the question that really should be asked is: why should these people attempt to live as strangers to their own identities, or should they belong to it instead? Instead of being driven by desire to be a man or a woman, it is the rejection of the enforced role which drives the demand. Living as a stranger can be like keeping a lid on a boiling kettle. However strongly the lid is held down, it can sometimes blow off, and the pressures inside the kettle cause an eruption to take place. Many transsexuals⁵ never want to be men or women: instead it is the deep seated and the often hidden conviction that they ought to be men or women, which enforces the battles they face. Large numbers fight this conviction with all the willpower they can muster. Often there never is, or ever was, any desire to conform to masculine or feminine stereotypes or to seek the rewards of being associated with a particular gender. For many, gender transition is considered to be a means of correcting an anomaly that has been present from birth. This is therefore a conflict of identity, where the personality that has been created through the love and commitments that have been made during daily life are in conflict with the sense of identity that is hidden deep inside. The goal that people seek is to be truly themselves. For most this may be seen as a battle between conscious willpower and the unconscious mind. Calming it is essential, for people have sacrificed many things they cherish in life, not because they want to, but because the drive is so strong.

From their earliest years a proportion of transgender people seek to associate in every way with the gender which they know they belong to. Others attempt to overcompensate by trying to obey the gender which society expects. Increasing numbers are refusing to entirely conform to either gender. A large number of transgender people sense a discomfort with the gender identity assigned to them from the age of four years. For some this awareness comes at a later time of life. Since these battles are driven by rejection rather than desire, the conflict may not be evident when the lid is firmly held down, but when the pressures cause the kettle to boil over, the result can be a catastrophic collapse. For others it is the constancy and lifelong attrition of the conflict which makes the demand to transition become impossible to resist. Rejection becomes desire when capitulation occurs. Strong polarities are encountered and often the severity of the trauma does not compare

³ Personal Biography <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/SusanBiographyPapers.pdf>

⁴ First issued 25 December 2017. This document is available online at: Gilchrist, S. (2017): "What does it mean to be Transgender?": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/242P-TransgenderIdentities.pdf>

⁵ People describe these in different ways and have different preferred terms: The terms Transgender and Transsexual are used in this account because they are in the most common use. Transgender people are people whose gender identity does not fully correspond to that expected by their biological sex. This is an umbrella term which can be expressed in different ways. Transsexuals can be regarded as transgender people who completely identify with the gender which is opposite to that which is expected by their biological sex. Gender reassignment is often urgently sought. However it should be noted that gender reassignment is not considered to be change in gender identity: instead it is regarded as an action required to correct a biological mistake. As it is a search for identity, no other behavioural implications are involved.

with the modesty of the demands. After transition, gender identity frequently ceases to be of any concern, and many merge invisibly into society, living normal and unremarkable lives that are true to their own selves.

Being transgender is not an indication of sexual orientation. As wide a range of sexual orientations are found amongst transgender people as those which are found in society at large⁶. Many transgender people marry in their imposed gender role, and do so for all the right reasons and the love they possess. The question of how marriages can or may survive when one partner transitions is a crucial concern, and the adjustments which are demanded of spouses are at least as great if not greater than those on the transgender partner. That challenge is greater because gender identity and sexual orientation act independently of each other. As age increases the drive to transition gets stronger and if no way is found to manage these dynamics the outcome can be a total, sudden and catastrophic collapse. This can have devastating results. When gender and sexuality are in conflict, sexuality is usually suppressed. There is the destruction of relationships and commitments through the failure to cope, even when love is as strong as ever. There is the blame for letting oneself down, the hurt to other people that has been caused and the guilt for the inability to conform to the edicts of others and one's own expectations. It is therefore essential that the correct counselling and management methods are employed⁷.

2:0: Being Transgender

2:1: Science

This assessment makes use of new research by the author into the development of personality and self-identity in early life. The advances in neuroscience, including the contributions of mirror neurons, contagion, empathy and possessive imitation are used to examine how early development takes place⁸. At birth the part of the brain responsible for perception and interpretation is in very primitive state and this study matches the advances in brain physiology to the increases in neural capability as the transition occurs. It also demonstrates how a continuity of personality is created. Particular emphasis is placed on examining how the contagious, innate and internally created driving forces; which dominate early development and are present from birth, come to be held in check by the restraining forces of cognitive development which can only later come into effect. The timing and nature of this transition is crucial. It is argued from this study that it is the rapid development of cognitive abilities during the neural transformation period around a median age of two years which enables the core elements of personality and identity, including gender identity and sexual identity to coalescence.

It is also demonstrated that the physiological, neurological and psychological aspects of brain development act together to form a finely tuned system in which the maximum amount of individuality, possessiveness, intelligence and inquisitiveness and continuity of identity, together with the minimum degree of energy expenditure is created. It is further shown that the extreme contagion of the internally generated self-reinforcing and fragmented physiological development processes provides the driving forces behind them. Although pre-natal influences are often thought

⁶ Gender and sexually variant people are fellow travellers in their interaction with societies, and the same conflict dynamics occur. However being transgender is not an indication of sexual orientation. As wide a range of sexual orientations are found amongst transgender people as those which are found in society at large.

⁷ Gilchrist, S. (2017): "Marriage, Sex and Gender": Article: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/030B-MarriageAndGenderArticle.pdf> For the associated presentation see: Gilchrist, Susan. (2017): "One Church, One Faith, One Lord: Marriage, Sex and Gender" Sibyls Hilfield Weekend 22-24 September 2017: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/SuH0922a-MarriageAndGenderSlides.pdf>

⁸ Gilchrist, S. (2016): "Science and Belief. A New Approach to Identity and Personality Formation in Early Life": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/218P-PaperPersonality.pdf>: Gilchrist, S. (2016): "A New Approach to Identity and Personality Formation in Early Life": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/218P-InfluencesPersonality.pdf>: Gilchrist, S. (2013): "Personality Development and LGB&T People: A New Approach": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/201P-PersonalityDevelopmentAndLGBTPeople.pdf>

to affect the direction that is taken, from a statistical point of view alone it can be expected that a proportion of people with gender or sexually variant identities will be created without being driven by any external cause⁹. This also means that for everyone the development of their own identity and allegiance, atypical or not, proceeds in the same way¹⁰. A consequence of this is that gender and sexually variant people develop an identity and allegiance which is contrary to their biological sex: but this is at least as firmly held as those for whom their identity and allegiance follow a normal path, indeed it may be argued that it should be even stronger because it has had to be fought for along the way.

The timings of these are crucial. It is demonstrated that brain plasticity (which is the ability of the brain to physically reshape itself), acts from birth to maximise the amount of information that can be collected before an explosive advance in neural capabilities takes place. This transformation occurs at around a median age of two years. At this time the number of neural linkages rapidly increase, distant parts of the brain become connected and the brain begins to function in a much more co-ordinated way¹¹. Cognitive abilities also swiftly develop and it is argued that core elements of personality and identity rapidly coalesce during or just before this transformation period occurs¹². Between the age of two and three years the third phase occurs, when the brain becomes tuned to the inputs it has received¹³. Connections in the pre-frontal cortex of the brain which are more used grow stronger and those which are not die back¹⁴. By the age of three years the core elements of personality and identity have become permanently and physically locked in place¹⁵ and frameworks of personality are formed¹⁶. It is generally agreed that children do not establish an effective "Theory of Mind" until the age of about four years¹⁷. Before their Theory of Mind" is sufficiently established, children are unable to question any idiosyncrasies about their own development. This age of four years is also the age when transgender people begin to feel discomfort with the gender they are assigned to. By that time it is too late to alter what has already occurred, and ways of managing the discomfort must be looked for instead.

Two different types of characteristics and conflicts are created. Those which arise during or before the neural transformation period are defined here as identity driven. The lack of overall neural co-ordination at the time of their formation means there is no direct association of desire with reward.

⁹ Many people argue that a reason for atypical gender identities developing is caused through the action of hormones in the unborn baby about twelve weeks after gestation. This analysis does not require that input but it does not deny it. These issues are examined in separate work by the author. A significant, but limited correlation is found: Gilchrist, S. (2016): "*Science and Belief. A New Approach to Identity and Personality Formation in Early Life*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/218P-PaperPersonality.pdf> ; Gilchrist, S. (2016): "*A New Approach to Identity and Personality Formation in Early Life*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/218P-InfluencesPersonality.pdf> ; Gilchrist, S. (2013): "*Personality Development and LGB&T People: A New Approach*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/201P-PersonalityDevelopmentAndLGBTPeople.pdf>

¹⁰ Gilchrist, S. (2017): "*No, Pope Francis: Gender Identity is not a Choice*". <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/227P-No-PopeFrancis.pdf>

¹¹ See: Gilchrist, S. (2013): "*Personality Development and LGB&T People: A New Approach*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/201P-PersonalityDevelopmentAndLGBTPeople.pdf>

¹² Due to the action of Quorum Sensing mechanisms: The easiest explanation to give is to imagine a cloud of little elementary concepts which are randomly milling around. Once some particular focus can be sensed many of the little concepts rush to that scene. The trigger happens when the pathways of the brain link sufficiently together. These elementary core concepts, such as the core gender identity, are then able to form because of the coalescence that has occurred. See: Gilchrist, S. (2013): "*Personality Development and LGB&T People: A New Approach*". Access via: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/articles/index.htm>

¹³ Hood, Bruce: (2014): "*The Domesticated Brain: A Pelican Introduction*": ISBN-10:0141974869 ISBN-13: 978-0141974866

¹⁴ This is called Synaptic pruning

¹⁵ See section 5 of: Gilchrist, S. (2013): "*Personality Development and LGB&T People: A New Approach*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/201P-PersonalityDevelopmentAndLGBTPeople.pdf>

¹⁶ It is argued in this investigation that transgender experiences should not be treated in isolation; and that the core gender identity is just one of the many such elements that are formed. It is through the action of all of these elements that the base for a constancy of personality is created. The permanence of this is such that only a stroke, tumour, dementia or other physical brain damage can cause the personality to change. The stability given by brain domestication is considered to set the direction for the continued development of neural capabilities and for the flowering and development of personality and identity which later occurs. See: Gilchrist, S. (2016): "*Science and Belief. A New Approach to Identity and Personality Formation in Early Life*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/218P-PaperPersonality.pdf>

¹⁷ Children who can do this are described as having a "Theory of Mind". This involves the ability to attribute mental states: beliefs, desires, intentions, pretending, knowledge, etc. to oneself and others and to understand that others have beliefs, desires, intentions, and perspectives that are different from one's own.

They are driven by rejection instead. Their identity driven nature is in contrast to reward driven characteristics and conflicts where behavioural motives are involved¹⁸. In reward driven conflicts the disturbances occur at a later stage. Identity driven characteristics and conflicts can be linked to personality variations and disorders while reward driven characteristics and conflicts are associated with desires and disruptions instead. There are major differences between the two conflict types¹⁹. In identity driven conflicts the features which drive them are determined before any cognitive analysis can take effect. In reward driven conflicts the sense of identity comes after the cognitive experiences have already occurred. These reversed patterns of formation have other major consequences since the medical methods for managing identity driven and reward driven conflicts and characteristics are almost opposite to each other. Great harm can be caused when medical misdiagnoses are made²⁰.

Much of current practice in psychology and psychiatry continues to rely on these traditionally based theories without taking into account the major advances in neuroscience that have occurred. The novel approach which is adopted in this analysis highlights the limitations of the traditional social learning and psychodynamic theories by relating them to the innate contagious neurophysiologically driven forces that dominate early development. The common feature of these traditional theories is their assumption that the processes of cognitive development have sufficient strength to guide development at all times of life. However it is the innate neurophysiological forces which dictate the direction of development in earlier years. Therefore crucial contributions to the development of personality and identity during the first three years of life remain unobserved. By addressing these issues in this study a new understanding is provided on how of personality and identity develops during these first three years of life²¹. A further major deficiency has been the inability to provide an adequate link between the earlier and later developing processes. That omission is dealt with in this investigation. The development of atypical gender identities and interactions with Christian theology are used as case studies to provide the links that are required²².

The current worldwide scientific consensus which exists on these matters is also confirmed by this research. This consensus regards both gender and sexually variant identities and behaviour as naturally expected variations of the human condition, which are intrinsic to the personality created, that arise very early in development and cannot be changed either by the individual concerned or by the predations of others in subsequent life. That is the position taken for example by the British Royal College of Psychiatrists, the British Psychological Society and parallel United Kingdom

¹⁸ Reward driven conflicts rely on cognitive abilities to associate the desire for a goal with the pleasure of the reward. The acknowledgement of distinctions between these reward driven and identity driven types of conflict is not new and in other conditions which require medical intervention, clear distinctions are currently made in the treatment and management methods that are applied. This is discussed more fully later in the paper

¹⁹ Freud himself defined the distinction between identity driven and reward driven conflicts in terms of inversion and perversion, and he drew from history to show how many of the leading figures in antiquity were themselves inverts in the way he describes.

²⁰ Gilchrist, S. (2013): "Management Techniques for Gender Dysphoria with Particular Reference to Transsexuality": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/205P-ManagementTechniquesInGenderDysphoria.pdf>

²¹ Freud, Piaget and others attempted to describe early development by creating social constructs such as the ego, super-ego and id. However the relationships between these are always described in cognitive terms. That demands a level of brain organisation which is capable of handling these relationships. Its absence in turn leads to the assumption that the traditional theories largely act on a blank canvas, and that has been the foundation of much research. The limitation therefore lies in the theories themselves. Therefore the existence and influence of the innate physiological development processes before and up to the time of the neurophysiological transition period is also denied. This is expanded on in: Gilchrist, S. (2017): "No, Pope Francis: Gender Identity is not a Choice". <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/227P-No-PopeFrancis.pdf>. That is also why it is essential to examine the development of gender identity in transgender children, as well as those for whom development takes the expected path: for when gender identity develops in a way which is congruent with biological sex, no evidence for these early conflicts is found. See: Gilchrist, S. (2017): "What Science and History Says about the Traditional Teaching on Gender and Sexual Variation in the Christian Church": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/239P-WhatScienceAndHistorySays.pdf>

²² For full details of this research, see: Gilchrist, S. (2013): "Personality Development and LGB&T People: A New Approach": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/201P-PersonalityDevelopmentAndLGBTPeople.pdf> ; Gilchrist, S. (2015): "Personality Development and Gender: Why We Should Re-think the Process": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/209P-RethinkPaperFull.pdf> ; Gilchrist, S. (2016): "Science and Belief. A New Approach to Identity and Personality Formation in Early Life": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/218P-PaperPersonality.pdf>

organisations. Each of the major medical organizations across the UK has signed a memorandum of understanding which very strongly condemns any attempt to try to 'cure' gender and sexually variant people. Corresponding positions are taken by the American Psychiatric Association and the American Psychological Association who have released statements which are equally as strong. Other international mental health organizations, including the World Health Organization have followed. All of these organisations are signatories to the World Professional Association for Transgender Health standards, which provides the consensus view²³.

2:2: Theology and Contradiction

Despite this medical evidence, many churches in the Christian tradition today ignore these development processes and instead determine that gender identity is a God-given feature which is fixed exclusively from birth by biological sex. Great emphasis is placed on pastoral care; however any behaviour which departs from this psychological edict is seen as an attack on the God given order of creation, a falling from Grace and is condemned by the Church. The traditional Christian doctrines consider the expression of all gender and sexually variant identities and the subsequent self-identification, to be a consequence of intrinsically disordered behaviour of grave depravity which invariably pursues inappropriate rewards and sexual desires. That reward driven characteristic contradicts the experiential evidence and the scientific results.

Because the gender and sexually variant conditions are driven by the search for identity and not reward, as wide a range of moral attitudes and behaviour must be encountered within the gender and sexually variant communities, as in the population at large²⁴. Therefore that those gender and sexually variant people who live true to their own identities in ways that conform to the highest standards of their own societies should be highly regarded, while those who do the reverse may be severely condemned for their acts²⁵. In his own correspondence Freud also affirms that view²⁶.

²³It is noted that all of the major medical organizations across the UK have very strongly condemned any attempt to try to 'cure' gender and sexually variant people. In 2015 a "Memorandum of Understanding on Conversion Therapy in the UK" was issued by these health organisations. It said: "We the undersigned UK organisations wish to state that the practice of conversion therapy has no place in the modern world. It is unethical and harmful and not supported by evidence....Sexual orientations and gender identities are not mental health disorders, although exclusion, stigma and prejudice may precipitate mental health issues for any person subjected to these abuses. Anyone accessing therapeutic help should be able to do so without fear of judgement or the threat of being pressured to change a fundamental aspect of who they are" The signatories are: UK Council for Psychotherapy, British Association for Counselling and Psychotherapy, British Psychoanalytic Council, British Association for Behavioural and Cognitive Psychotherapies, The British Psychological Society, College of Sexual and Relationship Therapists, The Association of LGBT Doctors and Dentists, The National Counselling Society, NHS Scotland, Pink Therapy, Royal College of General Practitioners, the Scottish Government and Stonewall. Available at: <https://www.psychotherapy.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2016/09/Memorandum-of-understanding-on-conversion-therapy.pdf> : See also: Royal College of Psychiatrists' statement on sexual orientation http://www.rcpsych.ac.uk/pdf/ps02_2014.pdf : British Psychological Society and other organisations: Conversion Therapy: Consensus Statement. http://www.bps.org.uk/system/files/Public%20files/conversion_therapy_final_version.pdf : APA Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity Statement: <http://www.apa.org/helpcenter/sexual-orientation.aspx> : APA Policy Statements on LGBT Concerns <http://www.apa.org/pi/lgbt/resources/policy/>

²⁴For a background see Stanford Encyclopaedia of Philosophy. (2015): "Homosexuality"; First published Tue Aug 6, 2002; substantive revision Sun Jul 5, 2015 <https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/homosexuality/>

²⁵ The relationship between transgender people and religion varies widely around the world. Religions range from condemning any gender-variant behaviour, to honouring transgender people as religious leaders. Views within a single religion can vary considerably. Buddhist scripture does not distinguish same-sex sexual activity from heterosexual activity. In Thai Buddhism, being katoey (an umbrella term that roughly maps to a range of identities from male to female transsexuality to male homosexuality) is seen as being part of one's karma. In Shinto, Shirabyōshi, female or transgendered kami are associated with same-sex love or gender variance. They are linked to Shinto priests of the same name, who are usually female (or occasionally transgender) and perform ritual dances in traditional men's clothing. In African religious beliefs the Akan people of Ghana for example, have a pantheon of gods that includes personifications of androgynous or transgender deities. The indigenous population of Australia have a shamanic religion, which includes a pantheon of gods, and the rainbow serpent god Ungud has been described as androgynous or transgendered. Third gender, or gender variant, spiritual intermediaries are found in many pacific island cultures. The pre-Christian Philippines had a polytheistic religion, which included the transgender or hermaphroditic gods Bathala and Malyari, whose names means "Man and Woman in One" and "Powerful One" respectively. Two-Spirit People is an umbrella term that is now sometimes used what were previously known as berdaches. These are indigenous North Americans who fulfil one of many mixed gender roles found traditionally among many Native Americans and Canadian First Nations communities. Two-spirit people were both respected and feared in many tribes. They frequently became practitioners of tribal medicine. Although success could bring high status they could be likely to be suspected of witchcraft in cases of failed harvest, or the death of a tribal member

Kertbeny, Bentham and others also recognised it²⁷, however social and religious pressures of their times, and the deficiencies of the early theories meant that these issues could not be properly addressed²⁸. A fundamental conflict between science and theology therefore exists. Since the legalisation of homosexuality and the implementation of gender equality legislation, people today can see for themselves that the full range of moral expression is present within these gender and sexually variant groups. In secular societies where gender equality is practiced, the refusal of certain churches to consider any possibility of change to their traditional doctrines is attacking the credibility of Christianity and the present day Church.

Traditional psychiatry and psychology also considers that gender and sexual identities develop through reward driven cognitive activities. This is because of their failure to take account of the innate neurophysiological processes which control development in early life. Although the identity driven nature of these gender and sexually variant conditions has been known for many years, the experiential evidence on which it is based has not been backed up by other proof, and it is generally recognised that the origin of these conditions are not well understood. Instead of taking the strength and universality of the worldwide consensus at its face value, people who oppose it dismiss it as the work of transgender activists and lobbyists instead²⁹. As a consequence these traditional approaches are often used to support the traditional teaching of the Church.

This investigation challenges both the conclusions of traditional psychology and the doctrines of the Church. The nature of the contradiction between science and theology and its consequences are also recognised in this study, where the reward driven motives ascribed by Christian doctrine to gender and sexually variant behaviour are contradicted by the scientific results, which regards them as identity driven instead³⁰. This has major consequences, since the medical methods for managing identity driven and reward driven conflicts and characteristics are almost opposite to each other³¹. Great harm can be caused by the medical misdiagnoses that are made.

2:3: Misunderstanding and Misdiagnoses

The refusal of Christian organisations to consider even the possibility of change denies the complete moral range which is fundamental to gender and sexually variant behaviour. The guilt which is created can be enormous. Religious euphoria may provide some form of escape but “Gay

²⁶ Freud, S (1935): Letter sent in 1935 anonymously to Alfred Charles Kinsey. Also published as Historical Notes: A Letter from Freud in: *The American Journal of Psychiatry*, April, 1951, 107, No. 10, pp. 786 and 787.

[https://en.wikisource.org/wiki/A_Letter_from_Freud_\(to_a_mother_of_a_homosexual\)](https://en.wikisource.org/wiki/A_Letter_from_Freud_(to_a_mother_of_a_homosexual))

²⁷ first appearance of the word homosexual in a printed document is found in an 1869 German pamphlet by the Austrian-born novelist Karl-Maria Kertbeny, which was published anonymously. In 1879, Gustav Jäger used Kertbeny's description in his book, *Discovery of the Soul* (1880). However “homosexuality” as originally defined by Kertbeny simply meant a sexual drive directed toward persons of the same sex. This orientation was defined in identity terms. In 1886, Richard von Krafft-Ebing used the terms and distinguished between homosexual and heterosexual in his book *Psychopathia Sexualis* (1886). Krafft-Ebing's book was so popular among both layman and doctors that the terms “heterosexual” and “homosexual” became the most widely accepted terms for sexual orientation. Krafft-Ebing considered procreation the purpose of sexual desire and that any form of recreational sex was a perversion of the sexual drive. He presented four categories of what he called “cerebral neuroses” in *Psychopathia Sexualis*. The consequence of this was to expand the definition of homosexuality in popular perception from a term which originally was used to describe identity only, to one which included the desire for and the practice of sexual relationships between two people of the same sex. Contrary to Freud and Kertbeny, its identification as immoral reward driven sexual behaviour is prevalent in the present day. In many countries severe criminal penalties are applied. The transfer of definition from identity and orientation to the condemnation of relationships is clearly evident in the Catechism of the Roman Catholic Church

²⁸ Gilchrist, S. (2017): “*What Science and History Says about the Traditional Teaching on Gender and Sexual Variation in the Christian Church*”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/239P-WhatScienceAndHistorySays.pdf>

²⁹ Gilchrist, S. (2017): “*Gender and Sexual Malpractice and Abuse in the Christian Church*”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/236P-Malpractice.pdf>

³⁰ Reward driven conflicts rely on cognitive abilities to associate the desire for a goal with the pleasure of the reward. The acknowledgement of distinctions between these reward driven and identity driven types of conflict is not new and in other conditions which require medical intervention, clear distinctions are currently made in the treatment and management methods that are applied.

³¹ Gilchrist, S. (2013): “*Management Techniques for Gender Dysphoria with Particular Reference to Transsexuality*”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/205P-ManagementTechniquesInGenderDysphoria.pdf>

Cure” approaches also fail since the gender and sexual identities they wish to reinstate have never existed, and what is created is a vacuum instead^{32 33}. Attempts to treat transgender identities and homosexuality as though they were the results of reward driven desires or lifestyle choices can therefore prove disastrous. However, because there is a bipolar element to them and because these conditions are driven by rejection rather than desire, some relief can be gained for a time by creating a sense of euphoria which transcends their demands³⁴. This is the approach taken by some religious groups who claim that a “Cure” has been found, but that only lasts for as long as the euphoria can be sustained. After it is lost it is not something that willpower can regain: for attempts to fight their conflicts simply reinforce the demand. The problem with many such groups is that anyone who does not conform to their rules of behaviour may be ejected from membership. These people may be told that God still loves them but to be practicing or non-practicing is not the real issue. These acts of rejection become a personal attack of the self-identity of that individual and not of their practice. It is also extremely destructive since their attempts to fight or suppress the conflict drives people deeper into distress. Whatever opportunity there might once have been to re-join the Church or group, or to keep personal control of their conflict, is either diminished or destroyed. The hurt, guilt and self-loathing caused by this can be enormous. This is why making the correct medical diagnosis is so important. The management methods that are most likely to succeed are those in which the correct medical diagnosis is employed.

A second reason for this misdiagnosis comes from the limitations in the social learning and psychodynamic theories that have traditionally been used. Compared with the “bottom up” neurophysiologically based analysis which is presented this investigation these theories adopt a “top down” approach. They begin by considering mature brain functioning, from which constructs are created that seek to explain the relationships between the conscious and unconscious mind.

³² See section 11:1: Present Day Issues in Gilchrist, S. (2013): “*Personality Development and LGB&T People: A New Approach*”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/201P-PersonalityDevelopmentAndLGBTPEople.pdf>

³³ A straightforward literature search revealed large numbers of papers describing the many peer reviewed studies on “Conversion Therapy” which have been carried out. A useful overview is given in the following article: Columbia Law School: (2017): “*What does the scholarly research say about whether conversion therapy can alter sexual orientation without causing harm?*” <http://whatweknow.law.columbia.edu/topics/lgbt-equality/what-does-the-scholarly-research-say-about-whether-conversion-therapy-can-alter-sexual-orientation-without-causing-harm/>. A printer-friendly PDF of the overview report is available at: <https://whatweknowblog.files.wordpress.com/2014/11/pdf-conversion-therapy5.pdf>. This study identified 47 peer-reviewed studies that met the investigator’s criteria for adding to knowledge about whether conversion therapy (CT) can alter sexual orientation without causing harm. Thirteen of those studies included primary research. Of those, 12 concluded that CT is ineffective and/or harmful, finding links to depression, suicidality, anxiety, social isolation and decreased capacity for intimacy. Only one study concluded that sexual orientation change efforts could succeed—although only in a minority of its participants, and the study has several limitations: its entire sample self-identified as religious and it is based on self-reports, which can be biased and unreliable. The remaining 34 studies do not make an empirical determination about whether CT can alter sexual orientation but may offer useful observations to help guide practitioners who treat LGB patients. The research on conversion therapy is limited by the difficulty of empirically assessing a person’s sexual orientation. All of the studies identified rely on self-reports, and those who wish to change their sexual orientation enough to seek therapeutic intervention may be inclined toward a bias in assessing or reporting their own attractions. Most of the studies lacked control groups, and none used nationally representative probability samples. Many researchers sympathetic to conversion therapy do not actually assess changes in sexual orientation or arousal patterns, but in behaviour, which is not a true gauge of orientation. Some subjects who claimed movement from gay to straight are actually more accurately described as bisexual, but were not initially coded as such. Many of these studies sample exclusively religious populations, and so their conclusions generally reflect more about religious self-identifications than any indication that sexual orientation can genuinely change. Some researchers found success in depressing same-sex arousal, often with the use of severe techniques, but often that did not translate into increased heterosexual arousal or ability to sustain a satisfying opposite-sex sexual relationship. Such limitations do not mean there is no useful research on conversion therapy. For instance, among the research we include here under “of interest to practitioners” are several ethical discussions of how to approach therapy with patients reporting dissatisfaction with their sexual orientation. Additionally, a direct examination of the research may help visitors to this site assess for themselves how persuasive claims are that sexual orientation can be changed. However, after reviewing the research, we concluded that there is no credible evidence that sexual orientation can be changed through therapeutic intervention. Most accounts of such change are akin to instances of “faith healing.” There is also powerful evidence that trying to change a person’s sexual orientation can be extremely harmful. Taken together, the overwhelming consensus among psychologists and psychiatrists who have studied conversion therapy or treated patients who are struggling with their sexual orientation is that therapeutic intervention cannot change sexual orientation, a position echoed by all major professional organizations in the field, including the American Psychological Association whose substantial 2009 report is available at: <https://www.apa.org/pi/lgbt/resources/therapeutic-response.pdf>.

³³ Gilchrist, S. (2013): “*Management Techniques for Gender Dysphoria with Particular Reference to Transsexuality*”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/205P-ManagementTechniquesInGenderDysphoria.pdf>

³⁴ Gilchrist, S. (2015): “*Personality Development and Gender: Why We Should Re-think the Process*”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/209P-RethinkPaperFull.pdf>

Although constructs such as the ego and id are created, the interactions between them are still described in cognitive terms. A sufficient level of cognitive ability must therefore be present for the psychodynamic theories to come into effect, and the social learning theories require them to be present at all times. The existence of identity driven characteristics and conflicts is therefore denied and no account is taken of the innate neurophysiological forces which dominate early life. It is therefore presumed that meaningful development starts from about the age of three years on a blank and malleable canvas.

These limitations mean that traditional theories can only act as overlays on what has already been created. By defining the development of gender and sexually variant identities exclusively as reward driven activities, the contributions of the earlier neurophysiologically driven processes are also denied. The standard explanations of the creation of gender identity presume that this identity develops only gradually and exclusively through children's own interpretation of the experiences which they encounter, and that these are determined entirely through their cognitive understanding of gender role³⁵. This conclusion is reversed in the research on transgender children, where it is shown that the core gender identity has become unalterably fixed at the latest by the age of three years³⁶. This unconscious identification with a gender is expressed in terms of identity alone, it is about being who one is, and it sets the direction of travel for the future developments that take place. When gender identity develops in a way which is congruent with biological sex, no evidence for these early conflicts is found. That is why it is essential to examine the development of gender identity in transgender children, as well as those for whom development takes the expected path. By ignoring earlier development, traditional psychiatry and psychoanalysis can therefore be seen to support the traditional teaching of the Church, and the contradiction between science and theology has only become apparent in the light of experiential evidence and the advances in scientific research.

It is important to note that this analysis does not diminish the value of the traditional psychodynamic and social learning theories: When it is recognised that they act as overlays on what has already been created, it enhances them instead. This author with others has made extensive use of Girard's cognitively based analyses in separate reconciliation work. Christian doctrine does not condemn anyone for having any feelings or desires to engage in gender or sexually behaviour. However it condemns any form of expression of these feelings as being disordered acts of grave depravity which are invariably presumed to be in pursuit of inappropriate sex. Since the gender and sexually variant conditions are driven by the search for identity and not desire, as wide a range of moral attitudes and behaviour must be encountered within the gender and sexually variant communities, as in the population at large. Therefore those people who live true to their own identities in ways that conform to the highest standards of their own societies should be highly regarded, while those who

³⁵ The standard and conventionally accepted gender studies believe that the initial concepts about gender are quite flexible. They note that children do not begin to notice and to adopt gender-stereotyped behaviour until the age of two or three. A few years later, their concept of gender becomes quite rigid. Before the age of five, children do not seem to think that gender has any permanence. A pre-school child might ask his female teacher whether she was a boy or girl when she was little, or a little boy might say that he wants to grow up to be a mummy. Toddlers think that changing clothes will also change gender. It is not until children understand that boys have penises and girls have vaginas that they know that changing clothes does not change gender. Research suggests that children's concept of gender develops gradually between the ages of three and five. Once children begin to think about gender as a stable trait, they also start to incorporate gender into their own identity. From around that time they become motivated to relate to other members of their group, and to seek out gender-related information, often becoming very strict about adhering to gender stereotypes. When they are between seven and ten years of age children become more relaxed about maintaining these gender stereotypes. This is therefore a process of self-discovery and self-awareness. These require cognitive abilities to be present. These traditional development theories presume that these processes act on a blank canvas and that gender identity is entirely created through the behaviour predicted by the social learning and psychodynamic development theories. This analysis shows that the elementary core gender identities are created by pre-cognitive processes and that the conscious allegiance to a gender identity is the result of a struggle between these unconscious and conscious conflicting demands. This unconscious identification with a gender is expressed in terms of identity alone. It is about being who one is. Crucially this unconscious identification with a gender becomes unchangeably fixed before any exploration of what belonging to that, or to any what gender may mean, can take place.

³⁶ Gilchrist, S. (2013d): "*Personality Development and LGB&T People: A New Approach*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/201P-PersonalityDevelopmentAndLGBTPeople.pdf>

do the reverse may be severely condemned for their acts. Traditional approaches to psychiatry and psychology do not address these issues. A problem for those who are trying to maintain the traditional teaching of the Church is that they have to rely on this increasingly outmoded and outdated research³⁷.

2:4: Social Consequences

Social influences play an important role. A major feature of gender complementarity comes from the way it separates the male from the female roles. Any form of gender and sexually variant behaviour which departs from the normal expectations of that society, for any purpose, challenges this distinction. The need to seek respectability and acceptance in Roman society was considered essential if Christianity was to continue to survive and bring its Gospel message to the world. However the compromises which this demanded swapped the most radical teaching of Jesus on gender and sexuality for the respectability of the Church³⁸. It is shown that these transformations have brought the Church to collude with the secular demands of society rather than to challenge them³⁹. Not only has this collusion reinforced the secular prejudices of such discriminatory societies; it gave and it still gives religious legitimacy to them: one only needs to look today at the behaviour of Daesh and Boko Haram to see how extreme this can become. The persecution and slaughter of gender and sexually variant people, not just in Christianity but in Islam, Judaism and all other religions, states and cultures which have drawn their teachings from it has been enormous. In many African countries extreme penalties against homosexual behaviour are being advocated or applied⁴⁰. There is no doubt that there was a great deal of sexual abuse in first century society, where the blatant abuses of power gave permission for extreme abuses of sex. However to condemn all gender and sexually variant behaviour for the abuses of some, is akin to saying today that all members of a minority community are terrorists because some engage in terrorist acts. In the United States at the present time, senior members of the Catholic Church have been using its traditional teaching to collude with the conservative Christian right when they deny the legitimacy of transgender people's identities, and condemn them as being in pursuit of illicit or depraved sex^{41 42}. This is not just a repudiation of the legitimacy of these people's own identities; it is an attack on their moral integrities. No amount of pastoral care can compensate for the condemnations these actions create. In the United States, the legalisation of same-sex marriage by the Federal Government has resulted in a rash of mainly Southern states seeking to scapegoat transsexual people by legally

³⁷ Gilchrist, S. (2017): "Gender and Sexual Malpractice and Abuse in the Christian Church": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/236P-Malpractice.pdf>

³⁸ See: Gilchrist, S. (2016): "Influences of Gender and Sexual Variation in the History and Traditions of the Christian Church": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/220P-InfluencesChurch.pdf>

³⁹ See for example: Gilchrist, S. (2017): "A House Built on Sand? Attitudes to Gender and Sexual Variant Identities and Behaviour in Christianity and the Christian Church": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/231P-HouseUponSand.pdf>

⁴⁰ This is not just a theological point of view. In all of today's interpretations little account is taken of contrast between the privileges of power exerted in dominant societies and the oppression of submission in conquered ones: both in terms of the cultural differences that are established, and in the use and abuse of sex. Evidence of the high degree of trauma and distress that these power conflicts create is present today: it is seen with the Taliban, Islamic State and Boko Haram. In history it extends from the Christian practice of slavery in the Americas to the Empires of the ancient world. No examination of Christian theology and its attitudes to all forms of gender and sexually variant behaviour can be complete without taking full account of the relationships between power and sex. Sadly, and in part because of this absence, many in Christianity, Judaism and Islam have colluded with the discrimination that has occurred.

⁴¹ In the United States, the legalisation of same-sex marriage by the Federal Government has resulted in a rash of mainly Southern states seeking to scapegoat transsexual people by legally enforcing them only to use toilets and bathroom facilities which correspond to the genitalia they were born with. This is irrespective of their gender identities and the transformations that they make. That position was supported by Cardinal Robert Sarah, Archbishop emeritus of Conakry (Guinea) and Prefect of the Congregation of Divine Worship and the Discipline of the Sacraments in the Catholic Church, during the address he gave to the, 12th Annual National Catholic Prayer Breakfast held on Tuesday, May 17th, 2016 at the Marriott Marquis Hotel in Washington DC. The Cardinal's address can be seen on the link provided. Not only did the Cardinal support the movement to impose the bathroom ban, he also declared that gender identity and sexual orientation are defined by the biology of sex. [Accessed 14 June 2016]: <https://catholicprayerbreakfast.com/2016-video/>

⁴² In 2014, the Southern Baptist Convention approved a resolution at its annual meeting stating that "God's design was the creation of two distinct and complementary sexes, male and female" and that "gender identity is determined by biological sex, not by one's self-perception." Furthermore, the resolution opposes hormone therapy, transition-related procedures, and anything else that would "alter one's bodily identity," as well as opposing government efforts to validate transgender identity. <http://www.sbc.net/resolutions/2250/on-transgender-identity>

enforcing them only to use toilets and bathroom facilities which correspond to the genitalia they were born with. This is irrespective of their gender identities and the transformations that they make. These concerns are compounded by the political changes that have recently taken place. For both social and theological reasons there is now an urgent need to reconsider the traditional teaching of the Church.

For as long as the Christian Church was able to dominate the social structures and the moral values of society, the traditional doctrines could not be challenged. The changes in present day society mean that this control has now been broken. The de-criminalisation of homosexuality in the 1960s and the subsequent anti-discrimination legislation on a world-wide basis means that for the first time in at least 1000 years people are able to see the full range of experience in gender and sexually variant behaviour and assess, for themselves, that the full range of moralities exist. The awareness of this moral duality would also be present in societies where same-sex relationships were encountered. That was true of societies in the first century world. In Judaism it was found in the first century Jewish Rabbinic and Chavruta partnerships, which Jesus and the disciples would have understood⁴³.

Despite its own acknowledgement that the origins of these conditions has not historically been well understood, despite the mass of experiential evidence that is now available: despite the results of this research and despite the everyday experience of many people, who can now see for themselves the genuineness and intensity of love and commitment that can be fulfilled in same-sex partnerships, it is this continued refusal of the Church of England, the Anglican Communion and the Catholic Church in particular to consider even the possibility of any change in their traditional doctrines on gender and sexually variant behaviour, which is destroying the credibility of Christianity and the Church in the present day world⁴⁴. An outcome of this self-imposed blindness is that transgender people, and all other gender and sexually variant people, are believed by many to threaten the moral values and stability of society and collusion with the persecution results. In many countries these condemnations are written into the laws of secular society: not just to sections of Christianity and other religious groups. The comments made by Pope Francis reinforce this point⁴⁵. In secular societies where gender equality and freedom of expression are realities, the observed gender discrimination, and the disapproval of gender and sexual variant behaviour by the Christian Churches is condemned. In societies where gender differentiation exists the traditional teaching of the Church on gender and sexual variant behaviour still has considerable force. Today these differences are leading towards major schisms in Christianity and the Christian Church.

⁴³ See section 3:0 of: Gilchrist, S. (2017): "A House Built on Sand? Attitudes to Gender and Sexual Variant Identities and Behaviour in Christianity and the Christian Church": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/231P-HouseUponSand.pdf> For example In the Avot de-Rabbi Hathan it is recommended that a Chavruta partner should be someone with whom one can "eat and drink, read and study, sleep, and share secrets of the Torah and personal secrets" together. (As reported in Maimonide's commentary on the Mishnah: Avot 1:6 aseh lekha rav). See section 3:2:3 of Gilchrist, S. (2013): "An Unfinished Reformation": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/016B-UnfinishedReformationArticle.pdf>. The special nature of the love expressed between Jesus and John in the Gospel of John would have been unremarkable for a Chavruta partnership of the time: Judaism is also littered with a history of close rabbinic partnerships in which today's definition of heterosexuality and homosexuality cannot be applied. Full arguments are also presented in Gilchrist, S. (2011) "Issues on the Sanctity of Same Sex Relationships": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/014B-IssuesOnTheSanctityOfSame-SexRelationships.pdf>. However Greenberg, Steven; (2004) "Wrestling with God and Men: Homosexuality in the Jewish Tradition" The University of Wisconsin Press, ISBN 10: 0-299-19094-3 gives a very complete account. Liturgies for ceremonies of Adelphopoiesis or "Brother Making" can still be accessed. These services have existed in Christianity from a very early date. A detailed description of these is given in section 3:2:5 of Gilchrist, S. (2013): "An Unfinished Reformation": In section 4:5:2 of Gilchrist, S. (2016): "Influences of Gender and Sexual Variation in the History and Traditions of the Christian Church": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/220P-InfluencesChurch.pdf> a comparison is made between these Christian relationships and those expected in the first century Jewish rabbinic partnerships. The close correspondence suggests that these represent relationships which have been carried over into the Christian Church.

⁴⁴ Gilchrist, S. (2017): "Religious and Secular Scapegoating of Transgender People: and its impact on the Christian Church": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/238P-SecularScapegoating.pdf>

⁴⁵ See sections 10 and 11 in Gilchrist, S. (2017): "No, Pope Francis: Gender Identity is not a Choice". <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/227P-No-PopeFrancis.pdf>.

2:5: Moralities and Outlook

A major concern for any religion is that the teaching of its founder might be shown to be incorrect. A substantive historical, theological and social analysis has been conducted by the author, which shows that the present day contradiction between science and theology arises because of changes in the theology of the Church⁴⁶. When that is taken into account the contradiction between science and theology disappears. By removing the theological presumptions on gender and sexuality, which dominated both Church and society for the last two thousand years, new insights are gained into biblical texts⁴⁷. It is shown that the teaching of Jesus on gender equality and gender and sexual variance supports the present day understanding, and that all transgender, transsexual lesbian, gay, heterosexual and bisexual people who attempt to live their lives in ways that fulfil the love of Christ, and who seek to express their own identities in roles that are true to themselves; must all be totally accepted in the Christian Church⁴⁸.

Instead of colluding with the secular scapegoating in discriminatory societies this teaching identifies the way of light for all gender and sexually variant people who seek to live their lives in ways that are true to their own identities in the Love of Christ. That light will shine most strongly in places where there are discriminatory societies around it. Conservative groups, such as GAFCON, who attempt to enforce the traditional teaching of the Church on homosexuality and gender and sexual variation, without taking account of the historical and theological changes can only restore a Christianity that met the needs of the medieval Church⁴⁹. This is not a theological, social and historical analysis which seeks to depart from the gospel message; it is one that aims to return to the Gospel texts: whatever the cost to the organisation may be, surely the mission of every Church today must be to rekindle this beacon of light.

However people disrupt and challenge gender conventions for many reasons. Those who engage in paedophilia, pornography and sexual abuse are a very real threat. Such behaviour is to be utterly condemned, but that fear is colluded with in a Christian doctrine which identifies all forms of gender and sexually variant behaviour regardless of purpose as disordered acts of grave depravity which pursue inappropriate sex. All transgender people have their own agendas, many merge invisibly into society and others pursue responsible roles. However some create antagonism by seeking to challenge or shock. Unfortunately it is only these people who tend to gain media attention. Anger forces others to behave in ways that are counterproductive to their cause. Because of these public misconceptions, medical misdiagnoses and religious doctrines, the harassment and persecution of

⁴⁶ For the most recent paper see: Gilchrist, S. (2017): "*The Gospel of Thomas and its Impact on Gender and Sexual Variation in the Christian Church*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/027B-Thomas.pdf> also Gilchrist, S. (2017): "*Hearing without Listening: The Eunuch and the Christian Church*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/013B-HearingWithoutListening.pdf> and Gilchrist, S. (2016j): "*Sex and Gender Variation in the Christian Church: Is it Not Time to Consider the Science?*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/226P-ConsiderScience.pdf>, Gilchrist, S. (2016): "*Influences of Gender and Sexual Variation in the History and Traditions of the Christian Church*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/220P-InfluencesChurch.pdf>, Gilchrist, S. (2016): "*Influences of Gender and Sexual Variation on the Life and Teaching of Jesus*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/219P-InfluencesJesus.pdf>

⁴⁷ Gilchrist, S. (2013): "*A Reassessment of the Traditional Christian Teaching on Homosexuality, Transsexuality and on Gender and Sexual Variation Using a New Neurophysiological and Psychological Approach*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/207P-ReassessmentPsychologyExtended.pdf>

⁴⁸ Gilchrist, S. (2017): "*Hearing without Listening: The Eunuch and the Christian Church*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/013B-HearingWithoutListening.pdf>; Gilchrist, S. (2017): "*Condemning Sexual Abuse and Welcoming Gender and Sexually Variant People into the Christian Church*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/237P-ChangesInChurch.pdf>; Gilchrist, S. (2017): "*Religious and Secular Scapegoating of Transgender People: and its impact on the Christian Church*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/238P-SecularScapegoating.pdf>; Gilchrist, S. (2017): "*What Science and History Says about the Traditional Teaching on Gender and Sexual Variation in the Christian Church*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/239P-WhatScienceAndHistorySays.pdf>; Gilchrist, S. (2017): "*The Gospel of Thomas and its Impact on Gender and Sexual Variation in the Christian Church*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/027B-Thomas.pdf>

⁴⁹ The "Global Anglican Future Conference", a group, mainly of African churches, representing the conservative elements in the Anglican Communion. See: Gilchrist, S. (2016): "*Influences of Gender and Sexual Variation in the History and Traditions of the Christian Church*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/220P-InfluencesChurch.pdf>

transgender people, and gender and sexually variant people has been great⁵⁰. Attempts by the Christian Churches to apologise for past abuses are of little value unless they are absolutely determined to correct the errors that have occurred.

This is not an assessment which demands or supports any relaxation of moral values in the attitudes to gender and sex. Instead it demands that the boundary between use and abuse be changed from one that condemns all gender and sexually variant behaviour irrespective of purpose, to one that applies identical criteria of use and abuse to all heterosexual, cross-gender and same-sex acts. There is no toleration of any form of abusive or immoral sex. When the whole of a group is universally condemned, then all members of that group are likely to bond together in a common defence. A slogan "*It's not gay to straight. It's lost to saved.*" from a conservative Christian group sums up where the boundaries of acceptability are presumed to exist, and how misinformation can be employed⁵¹. By responding with universal condemnation, the same boundary can inadvertently be enforced by gender and sexually variant people themselves. If Christianity can find a way to recognise the full range of moral attitudes and commitments exist, and are inherent to gender and sexually variant behaviour, then the gender and sexually variant groups must also do the same. As well as the challenges which apply to the Christian Church, there are equivalent challenges which apply to the gender and sexually variant communities. If true reconciliation is to be gained both sides and even the innocent need to change and the changes required within the gender and sexually variant communities may have as great an impact as those required for the Christian church.

2:6: Management

What it means to be transgender is ultimately about changing the frame of reference in which life is lived. Usually there is no rejection of anything else. No two people are the same and a very wide range of experience is encountered. Some seek gender reassignment while others find different ways to manage the trauma it creates. For many, sexual orientation does not change after gender reassignment; others find it changes to match the gender which they come to represent. Marriages often survive after one partner transitions, because the person they married still remains the same person inside⁵². The search is for identity and other elements of personality are unlikely to be affected⁵³. Every management method which is adopted must correctly identify the nature of the condition and take account of the wide range of experiences that are found.

Earlier in this document it is shown that the development of the underlying gender and sexual identities form just two of the core elements from which personality and identity develops. It is also demonstrated that for everyone the development of their own gender identity and allegiance, atypical or not, takes place in the same way. That corresponds with the worldwide scientific consensus which regards both gender and sexually variant identities and behaviour as naturally expected variations of the human condition, which are intrinsic to the personality created, which arise very early in development and cannot be changed either by the individual concerned or by the predations of others in subsequent life. It is also demonstrated that the contagious internally created driving forces that are present from birth propel development forward at all times in life. These are only held in check by the restraining forces of cognitive development which later come into effect. On the one hand this may lead to personality disorders being created; on the other hand it

⁵⁰ See Section 6 "Murder, Discrimination and Suicide" in Gilchrist, S. (2017): "*Gender and Sexual Malpractice and Abuse in the Christian Church*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/236P-Malpractice.pdf>

⁵¹ Anchored North: <https://anchorednorth.org/>

⁵² Gilchrist, S. (2017): "*Marriage, Sex and Gender*": Article: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/030B-MarriageAndGenderArticle.pdf>. For the associated presentation, see: Gilchrist, Susan. (2017): "*One Church, One Faith, One Lord: Marriage, Sex and Gender*" Sibyls Hilfield Weekend 22-24 September 2017: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/SuH0922a-MarriageAndGenderSlides.pdf>

⁵³ See section 5 of Gilchrist, S. (2015): "*Personality Development and Gender: Why We Should Re-think the Process*": [Updating]: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/209P-RethinkPaperFull.pdf>

stimulates and promotes the highest achievements in life⁵⁴. In the identity driven conflicts the characteristics which drive it are determined before any cognitive analysis can take effect. In reward driven conflicts the sense of identity comes after the cognitive experiences have already occurred. The medical methods for managing the different types of conflict are almost opposite to each other and in both cases these techniques are already well known. It is essential that the correct ones are applied⁵⁵. Instead of trying to fight or suppress these core elements of personality and identity, methods which are based on discovery, reconciling and acceptance must be used⁵⁶.

Professional psychiatric and medical guidelines for the management and care of transgender people are laid down in a number of documents. Among these are: the American Psychiatric Association manual: DSM-5⁵⁷ The World Professional Association for Transgender Health (WPATH) Guidelines⁵⁸ and the International Statistical Classification of Diseases and Related Health Problems (ICD10), which is a medical classification list by the World Health Organization⁵⁹.

⁵⁴ It is notable that the proportion of gender and sexually variant people who are high achievers is larger than a survey of the general population would expect. Freud also noted this in his own correspondence. However transgender people also show a greater tendency towards autism and asberger's syndrome than would be expected in the general population. Both might arise from the high degree of stimulation which is provoked. For more details see: Gilchrist, S. (2015): "Personality Development and Gender: Why We Should Re-think the Process": [Updating]: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/209P-RethinkPaperFull.pdf>

⁵⁵ Gilchrist, S. (2013): "Management Techniques for Gender Dysphoria with Particular Reference to Transsexuality": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/205P-ManagementTechniquesInGenderDysphoria.pdf>: Existing theories do not adequately explain the conflicts and characteristics of gender dysphoria. Recent research and current concepts are used in a new approach which defines the formation of personality and self-identity as a process of linking together individual concepts to form a coherent whole. It is argued in this paper that the source of the conflict arises from the failure to build a coherent sense of self identity and that this manifests itself in gender terms. The rejection of the assigned gender identity drives the dynamics of the conflict, and it is the medium through which the discord is expressed. The approach presented in this paper puts forward a management strategy which calms the dynamics of the conflict. It does not itself remove the latency but it does enable people to find the correct path. Its aim is to neutralize the scapegoat mechanism by creating an inclusive identity so that considered decisions can be made. This may lead towards gender reassignment or it may not and it is fundamental to its functioning that either result must be treated as being equally correct. It works by enabling people to find a balance between the need to be fully oneself in the life that gender allegiance demands and the loyalty to the commitments and relationships that have been made in the life that has been built. This balance changes with time and attempts to fight the conflict destroy the transcendence required. A new perspective on compulsive behaviour and the way in which it impacts on gender dysphoria is presented. This explains the extremity of the conflict. It also shows how an understanding of the dynamics can moderate or eliminate the demand. A recommended method of management is given, together with a summary of this newly developed approach. It is shown how these provide strategies which can minimise the disruptions encountered. However success depends greatly on the understanding of others. The importance of achieving this is emphasised in the paper. This exploration indicates that the same or similar approaches can be applied to other areas of identity formation and personality development. It also demonstrates how the defects of the current approaches have imposed significant trauma, for which transsexuals and others have had to pay a very high price. The purpose of this approach is to give people the greatest possible freedom of choice. The results of this examination make it clear that complete support should be given to those who have decided that full gender reassignment including genital surgery is correct, since making the body conform as completely as possible to the gender allegiance which is possessed resolves these conflicts at source

⁵⁶ Gilchrist, S. (2017): "Mistreating Transgender Children": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/241P-MistreatingTransgenderChildren.pdf>

⁵⁷ The American Psychiatric Association, publisher of the DSM-5, for example states that "gender nonconformity is not in itself a mental disorder. The critical element of gender dysphoria is the presence of clinically significant distress associated with the condition". https://www.psychiatry.org/File%20Library/Psychiatrists/Practice/DSM/APA_DSM-5-Gender-Dysphoria.pdf Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders, Fifth Edition (DSM-5) Author American Psychiatric Association: Series Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders First Published May 18, 2013 ISBN 978-0-89042-554-1 In December 2002, the British Lord Chancellor's office published a *Government Policy Concerning Transsexual People* document that categorically states, "What transsexualism is not ... It is not a mental illness." *Government Policy concerning Transsexual People*. *People's rights/Transsexual people*. U.K. Department for Constitutional Affairs. 2003.

⁵⁸ The World Professional Association for Transgender Health represents trained professionals who have been working in this area for many decades, from all over the world. The latest WPATH Identity Recognition Statement is as follows: *The World Professional Association for Transgender Health (WPATH) recognizes that, for optimal physical and mental health, persons must be able to freely express their gender identity, whether or not that identity conforms to the expectations of others. WPATH further recognizes the right of all people to identity documents consistent with their gender identity, including those documents which confer legal gender status. Such documents are essential to the ability of all people to enjoy rights and opportunities equal to those available to others; to access accommodation, education, employment, and health care; to travel; to navigate everyday transactions; and to enjoy safety. Transgender people, regardless of how they identify or appear, should enjoy the gender recognition all persons expect and deserve. Medical and other barriers to gender recognition for transgender individuals may harm physical and mental health. WPATH opposes all medical requirements that act as barriers to those wishing to change legal sex or gender markers on documents. These include requirements for diagnosis, counselling or therapy, puberty blockers, hormones, any form of surgery (including that which involves sterilization), or any other requirements for any form of clinical treatment or letters from doctors. WPATH argues that marital and parental status should not be barriers to recognition of gender change, and opposes requirements for persons to undergo periods living in their affirmed gender, or for enforced waiting or 'cooling off' periods after applying for a change in documents. Further, court and judicial hearings can produce psychological, as well as financial and logistical barriers to legal gender change, and may also violate personal privacy rights or needs. WPATH advocates that appropriate gender recognition should be available to transgender youth, including those who are under the age*

Gilchrist, S. (2017): "What Does it mean to be Transgender?" 242P

First Issued: 25 December 2017. Last update: 8 February 2018.

Draft: Printed: 11/02/2018 17:35

Access via: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/articles/index.htm>

spap4144@gmail.com

15

While these documents give a very comprehensive overview, they rely on experiential evidence, and they acknowledge the limitations of the information that is used⁶⁰. As a consequence considerable disagreement exists, the medical approaches come under attack and the need for more research is claimed by religious and opposing groups. This is where the weakness and arguments arise, because all of the groups either rely on experiential evidence or theological arguments to justify their opposing views. Fundamentally both sides agree that the reasons for the existence of homosexuality and the gender and sexually variant conditions are not well understood.

This extends to how these conditions develop; how they are classified and the correct management methods to use. In previous versions of the DSM these conditions were treated as “*personality disorders*”. This was in place of the description of “*personality variations*”, which the current DSM-5 now uses. That change was justified by the argument that where there is no distress there cannot be any disorder because there is no impediment to the fulfilment of life. Despite this it is made clear that where distress is caused by these conditions, management methods that are equivalent to personality disorders should continue to be used. That viewpoint also corresponds with the author’s conclusions which, on the one hand note that distress which arises due to these conditions may lead to personality disorders being created; while on the other hand it stimulates and promotes the highest achievements in life. Freud’s distinctions between inversion and perversion are another case in point. Nevertheless these medical and psychological approaches are rejected by the Christian teaching, which regards them as being the outcome of perversions instead⁶¹. Great harm can occur if an incorrect diagnosis is made. This failure of understanding can only be resolved by establishing the true nature and origin of these conditions. That is a purpose of this author’s research.

As well as considering transsexuality the links between transvestism and non-binary gender identification should also be explored. “*Dual-role transvestism*” is the formal diagnosis used by psychologists and physicians to describe people who wear clothes of the opposite sex to temporarily experience being members of the opposite sex, but do not have a sexual motive or want gender reassignment surgery. In this research, the term “*Gender motivated transvestism*” is used. ICD-10 lists three diagnostic criteria for dual-role transvestism. ICD-10 also notes that a person who

of majority, as well as to individuals who are incarcerated or institutionalized. WPATH recognizes that there is a spectrum of gender identities, and that choices of identity limited to male or female may be inadequate to reflect all gender identities. An option of X, NB (non-binary), or Other (as examples) should be available for individuals who so choose. WPATH urges governments to eliminate barriers to gender recognition, and to institute transparent, affordable and otherwise accessible administrative procedures affirming self-determination, when gender markers on identity documents are considered necessary. These procedures should be based in law and protect privacy. <http://www.wpath.org/>.

⁵⁹ World Health Association (2016): “*International Statistical Classification of Diseases and Related Health Problems (ICD10)*” <http://www.who.int/classifications/icd/en/> also <http://apps.who.int/classifications/icd10/browse/2016/en>

⁶⁰ Both the diagnosis and treatment of Gender Identity Disorder (GID) are controversial. Although linked, they are separate issues and the DSM does not evaluate treatments. The Board of Trustees (BOT) of the American Psychiatric Association (APA), therefore, formed a Task Force charged to perform a critical review of the literature on the treatment of GID at different ages, to assess the quality of evidence pertaining to treatment, and to prepare a report that included an opinion as to whether or not sufficient credible literature exists for development of treatment recommendations by the APA. The literature on treatment of gender dysphoria in individuals with disorders of sex development was also assessed. The completed report was accepted by the BOT on September 11, 2011. The quality of evidence pertaining to most aspects of treatment in all subgroups was determined to be low; however, areas of broad clinical consensus were identified and were deemed sufficient to support recommendations for treatment in all subgroups. With subjective improvement as the primary outcome measure, current evidence was judged sufficient to support recommendations for adults in the form of an evidence-based APA Practice Guideline with gaps in the empirical data supplemented by clinical consensus. The report recommends that the APA take steps beyond drafting treatment recommendations. These include issuing position statements to clarify the APA’s position regarding the medical necessity of treatments for GID, the ethical bounds of treatments of gender variant minors, and the rights of persons of any age who are gender variant, transgender or transsexual Report of the American Psychiatric Association Task Force on Treatment of Gender Identity Disorder (PDF Download Available). Available from: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/228071071_Report_of_the_American_Psychiatric_Association_Task_Force_on_Treatment_of_Gender_Identity_Disorder .

⁶¹ The term is used in the medical rather than the pejorative sense

Gilchrist, S. (2017): “*What Does it mean to be Transgender?*” 242P

First Issued: 25 December 2017. Last update: 8 February 2018.

Draft: Printed: 11/02/2018 17:35

Access via: <http://www.tqdr.co.uk/articles/index.htm>

spap4144@gmail.com

16

is diagnosed with dual-role transvestism should not receive a diagnosis of “*transvestic fetishism*”⁶². That corresponds with the results of this research where, by taking account of the innate and contagious neurophysiological forces which drive early development, both identity driven and reward driven characteristics and conflicts are created. Transvestic fetishism falls into the reward driven category where the sense of identity comes after the cognitive experiences have already occurred. Dual-role transvestism focusses on identity instead, and in identity driven conflicts the characteristics which drive it are determined before any cognitive analysis can take effect. The common links with dual-role transvestism should therefore be explored. A new approach is taken and more detailed considerations of this are given elsewhere⁶³.

This study demonstrates that it is the rapid development of cognitive abilities during the neural transformation period around a median age of two years which enables the core elements of personality and identity, including gender identity and sexual identity to coalesce. The intensity of the drive, the fragmented nature of early development and the rapidity of the coalescence means that there is a roughness in this process. It is argued that individual components are not lost within this coalescence but these remain hidden inside the matrix underneath: therefore this underlying graininess disturbs the coherence of selfhood that is being formed. The dynamics of the conflict send people in different directions and this polarisation creates the divisions which separate the two groups. When transvestites and transsexuals first start to explore their gender identities it can be difficult for them and for others to distinguish between the two conditions. As the exploration progresses the differences become more clearly seen. It is the need to make sense of the fragmentation which means that each person and the demands of society create an exclusive and polarised gender allegiance, which is either male or female and it is one to which total loyalty is required. Today the relaxation of the requirement to conform to gender stereotypes has resulted in an increasing number of women and men coming forward who are now defining themselves as gender queer. This is a very wide ranging group but the refusal of this group to identify themselves with any one gender enables the creation of other outlets which are able to endorse the strength of the conflict's demands.

For gender motivated transvestites the ability to pass as a woman in society becomes the key ambition. Through expression it also becomes the scapegoat to reject. The compulsion becomes self-limiting since the act of expressing the female has the effect of affirming the truth of the male. If this compulsion is resisted it can become overwhelming, but the expression of the cross gender identity gives only temporary relief. Some do live full time in the cross gender role. However for most the need for expression is episodic although the compulsion is no less severe. All the medical attempts to relieve transvestites of their compulsion have failed. Now the usual advice is to encourage transvestites to accept their drive, to find an acceptable means of expression, and to treat it like a hobby to be enjoyed.

In this investigation it has been demonstrated that the contagious internally created driving forces propel development forward at all times in life, also that these are only held in check by the restraining forces of cognitive development, that later come into effect. For most people this may be seen as a battle between conscious willpower and the unconscious mind. The intensity of the drive to reject what willpower demands means that a strong polarity is created. When willpower dominates no conscious evidence of gender discomfort may exist. When willpower fails the conflict

⁶² F64:1 and F65:1 Coleman, E ; Bockting, W; Botzer, M; Cohen-Kettenis, P; DeCuypere, G; Feldman, J; Fraser, L; Green, J; Knudson G; Meyer W. J; Monstrey, S; Adler R.K.; Brown, G.R; Devor, A.H; Ehrbar, R; Ettner, R; Eyler, E; Garofalo , D. H. Karasic , A. I. Lev , G. Mayer , H. Meyer-Bahlburg , B. P. Hall , F. Pfaefflin , K. Rachlin , B. Robinson, R;. Schechter, L.S; Tangpricha, V; van Trotsenburg, M; Vitale, A; Winter, S; Whittle, S; Wylie, K.R; Zucker, K; (2012): Standards of Care for the Health of Transsexual, Transgender, and Gender-Nonconforming People, Version 7Pa Published online: 27 Aug 2012 . *International Journal of Transgenderism*. Routledge Taylor & Francis Group (13): 165–232. 2011. doi:10.1080/15532739.2011.700873.

⁶³ See section 5 of: Gilchrist, S. (2015): “*Personality Development and Gender: Why We Should Re-think the Process*”:
[Updating]: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/209P-RethinkPaperFull.pdf>

may erupt with an intensity that vastly exceeds the modesty of the perceived demands. Challenges which might have little to do with gender are also found to cause loss of control. The result is an oscillating pattern of awareness. People who take a traditional viewpoint might interpret this as gender fluidity. Others may use it to claim justification for “*reparative therapy*” - or the equivalent of the “*Gay cure*” approach. It can also mean that people remain unaware of their gender conflicts until later in life. Once the genie is let out of the bottle it cannot be put back, and this late awareness can have a devastating effect.

The challenges to gender and sexually variant people come from three quarters. The first comes from the attack on the good order of societies where gender discrimination and gender role division are strongly enforced. The second is the perceived carnal abuse of sex. The third arises from the enforcement of power and domination in dictatorial societies; where the abuses of power gave permission for the abuses of sex, most notably in same-sex acts. There is little public understanding of the condition. Even well-meaning opinion can be counterproductive since advice which expects transsexuals to use willpower to control such conflicts has the opposite effect, and instead reinforces the runaway drive. Some of the worst are religious groups who heap guilt on transsexuals who cannot follow the path they prescribe. Successful management depends on the ability to manage compulsive demands. This includes the recognition that the primary driver is the rejection of the gender identification imposed by society; instead of desire for the new. Parallel dynamics can be seen in addiction, alcoholism, depression, conflicts of sexual orientation and in other areas as well. However, unlike personality disorders, transgender experience seeks the fulfilment of life. Many do try to abstain from all forms of cross-dressing or enactment. Despite their attempts, the denial of what is seen as the fulfilment of self-identity creates tensions which can lead to collapse. Professional opinion now advises against this as a tactic, and that experience is matched in many transgender people’s lives.

2:7: Strategies

The importance and also the novelty of the research work by this author is that provides new insights into the early development of personality and identity by demonstrating how the innate, neurophysiologically driven, contagious and internally created driving forces that are present from birth, which dominate early development, come to be held in check by the restraining forces of cognitive perception which can only later come into effect. It also provides independent validation and justification for the current worldwide scientific consensus, which regards both gender and sexually variant identities and behaviour as naturally expected variations of the human condition, which are intrinsic to the personality created, that arise very early in development and cannot be changed either by the individual concerned or by the predations of others in subsequent life. From its neurophysiological studies it is additionally demonstrated that, although pre-natal influences may affect the direction that is taken, from a statistical point of view, and also because of the fragmented and contagious nature of early development, a proportion of people with gender or sexually variant identities will be created without being driven by any external cause. This in turn means that for everyone the development of their own identity and allegiance, atypical or not, proceeds in the same way. A consequence of this is that gender and sexually variant people develop an identity and allegiance which is contrary to their biological sex: but this is at least as firmly held as those for whom their identity and allegiance follow a normal path. No gender identity which is congruent with the biological sex can ever be found because it did not exist. It is further demonstrated that the contagious internally created driving forces that are present from birth continue to propel development forward at all times in life. On the one hand their contagion may lead to personality disorders being created; on the other hand they stimulate and promote the highest achievements in life. Compulsions are generated by attempting to fight or suppress their demands. Two types of compulsions are identified by the author: compulsions of *mortido* which lead to dissolution and oblivion, and compulsions of *libido* which arise because of the denial of fulfilment of life.

Gilchrist, S. (2017): “What Does it mean to be Transgender?” 242P

First Issued: 25 December 2017. Last update: 8 February 2018.

Draft: Printed: 11/02/2018 17:35

Access via: <http://www.tqdr.co.uk/articles/index.htm>

spap4144@gmail.com

18

Compulsions of libido can only be avoided if something else which is seen or believed to be better can be put in their place. Always having to rely on that hope and expectation is a difficult task. People may often fail to recognise compulsions of libido when they do not create disruption, because they produce a positive result. The attrition caused by the constant demands and the strain of maintaining this provides a recipe for failure and collapse. It is notable that the gender conflicts may only explode into conscious awareness because of some independently created trauma or depression which leads to the hope of fulfilment in the imposed role being lost.

The contradiction between science and theology is also identified in this study: where the reward driven motives ascribed by Christian doctrine to gender and sexually variant behaviour are contradicted by the current scientific knowledge, which regards them as identity driven instead. In order to resolve this contradiction an extended social historical and theological analysis has been conducted and it is shown that the present day contradiction between science and theology has arisen because of changes in the theology of the Church⁶⁴. This contradiction has major consequences since the medical methods for managing identity driven and reward driven conflicts and characteristics are almost opposite to each other⁶⁵. Great harm can be caused by the medical misdiagnoses that are made.

Many religious groups take the view that stereotypical male and female gender identities must be imposed on all children because gender identity is determined on the grounds of biology alone. Otherwise confusion and distress will arise. However the scientific research shows that these core gender identities have already become unchangeably fixed by the age of three years. That is well before children can examine their own minds, and make any choice. Giving all children the ability to explore their gender identity gives them the ability to find it. It does not give them the freedom to choose it. While a great majority of children do find that they identify with their biological sex, some will not, and the hurt, guilt and self-loathing that can result may have a very harmful effect. Like the consequence of the medical misdiagnoses, this enormous trauma, guilt and the high rates of attempted suicide among young transgender people is not caused by giving children the freedom to explore it: it is caused by the denial of that freedom instead⁶⁶.

This means that what is adopted as a compassionate approach by one group is understood as coercion by the other. Of course nobody should try to force children into any gender identity or role. Contrary to the allegations made by some Churches and religious groups, every protocol which is adopted in the United Kingdom for transgender children is designed to prevent any reversible choice being made until each person reaches eighteen years of age. For the author, who in the 1970s, was seeking to avoid transition, there was a certain irony in this situation because an approach of inclusion, acceptance, reconciling and transcendence was being taken. This sought to maintain a truce between the storms of the inner identity and the loyalty and commitment to the life that had been built. The goal was to calm the compulsive demands. Had the author followed the professional advice then being given, that truce would have been lost and gender reassignment would almost certainly have been the outcome of the runaway drive⁶⁷.

⁶⁴ See for example: Gilchrist, S. (2017): "A House Built on Sand? Attitudes to Gender and Sexual Variant Identities and Behaviour in Christianity and the Christian Church": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/231P-HouseUponSand.pdf>

⁶⁵ Gilchrist, S. (2013): "Management Techniques for Gender Dysphoria with Particular Reference to Transsexuality": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/205P-ManagementTechniquesInGenderDysphoria.pdf>

⁶⁶ Gilchrist, S. (2017): "Mistreating Transgender Children" Leaflet: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/241P-MistreatingTransgenderChildrenLeaflet.pdf> An alternative version of this document is also available online at: Gilchrist, S. (2017): "Cherishing Transgender Children": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/241P-TransgenderChildren2Leaflet.pdf>

⁶⁷ For More information on this see: Gilchrist, Susan: (2015): "A Path of My Own": Person Centred Care and Support: NHS Transgender and Non-binary Symposium 30 June 2015 <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/SuF0630q-TransgenderNBSymposiumSlidesSil-30jun15.pdf> . For the Symposium Report, see: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/SuF0630s-FINALSymposiumReport.pdf> Also: Gilchrist, S. (2015): "Written evidence submitted by Susan Gilchrist to the U.K Parliament Women and Equalities Select Committee's Inquiry into Transgender Equality": Details of the Committee's Enquiry can be found here: <http://www.parliament.uk/business/committees/committees-a-z/commons-select/women-and-equalities-committee/inquiries/parliament-2015/transgender-equality/> The personal submission by

2:8: Individual Response

The approach adopted by the author puts forward a management strategy which calms the dynamics of the conflict. It does not itself remove the latency but it does enable people to find the correct path. Its aim is to neutralize the compulsions that are created by building the self-esteem which can welcome the reality of the gender identity which is possessed, and enable considered decisions to be made. The wide range of experience and the focus on rejection leads to the conclusion that the discomfort with the imposed gender is the manifestation of the conflict instead of the source. Resolving the gender anomaly creates the coherence of self that is sought. In this investigation the creation of a coherent self-identity is understood to be the underlying demand.

Like the author, who fought against this contradictory sense of gender identity for many years, gender reassignment is not a path that everyone wants to take. For many the desire is to preserve what they most cherish in the life they have built. Many fight against the idea of transition with all their might. In this situation, methods of management must instead look for ways of calming the dynamics, since the aim is to ensure that compulsions are avoided and that considered decisions can be made. The emphasis should be on inclusion and building a coherent self-identity. Contrary to the approaches which rely on fighting and suppression; this requires a total inversion of thought. This demands the complete welcome and acceptance of the gender identity which is possessed. That reversal in perspective is needed to create a firm base. That base can then be used to transform what had been an uncontrollable compulsion into more controllable demands. Instead a conflict which attacks at the roots of identity and personality, it now strikes at the top. When this succeeds, enrichment, inclusion, self-coherence and self-esteem can be sought in ways that give people the freedom to do what is right⁶⁸. However the freedom to change must never be impeded, for changes may be needed as commitments alter and the ideals for the future give way to the realities of the past. For some this may lead towards gender reassignment and the creation of this self-esteem and transcendence allows it to be pursued in an orderly way.

Understanding the nature and the characteristics of a conflict is a key asset in managing its demands. The need to develop this understanding has been a prime driver in the author's research. However the limitations are also exposed. Keeping the freedom to change means that the decision not to change can only be made each day for the next. Therefore worries about the future cannot be addressed. That becomes more difficult with increasing age when commitments decrease and hopes for the future gave way to realities of the past. The fear of a future inability to cope with the infirmities and restrictions of age can also be a major driving force. That can become a frightening concern. It is important that people should be aware of these restrictions at an early stage, and be able to accommodate the changes that are required.

The results of this examination make it clear that complete support should be given to those who have decided that full gender reassignment including genital surgery is correct, since making the body conform as completely as possible to the true gender allegiance resolves these conflicts at source. Other transgender people instead fight a battle of identity, where the personality that has been created through the love and commitments that have been made during daily life are in conflict with the sense of identity that manifests itself deep inside. It is seen that fighting these battles

Susan Gilchrist can be found here: <http://data.parliament.uk/writtenevidence/committeeevidence.svc/evidencedocument/women-and-equalities-committee/transgender-equality/written/19610.html> . Also at: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/222P-TransgenderEqualityCteeWrittenEvidence.pdf>

⁶⁸ These management approaches are discussed more fully in: Gilchrist, S. (2013): "*Management Techniques for Gender Dysphoria with Particular Reference to Transsexuality*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/205P-ManagementTechniquesInGenderDysphoria.pdf> and in section 6 of: Gilchrist, S. (2015): "*Personality Development and Gender: Why We Should Re-think the Process*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/209P-RethinkPaperFull.pdf>

Gilchrist, S. (2017): "*What Does it mean to be Transgender?*" 242P

First Issued: 25 December 2017. Last update: 8 February 2018.

Draft: Printed: 11/02/2018 17:35

Access via: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/articles/index.htm>

spap4144@gmail.com 20

creates the runaway drive which leads to compulsive demands. For these people the knowledge that they have permission to change may be the best way of ensuring that involuntary change is never required. No two people are alike; and many different end points will be discovered. It is for each person to make his or her own decision: How that person succeeds depends on what society allows; the self-acceptance that is possible and the self-esteem that is gained.

2:9: Denial

This investigation considers the development of tribal, sexual and gender identities and the relationships between power, gender and sex. It has been demonstrated that the paradigm shift in Christian teaching has occurred, so that the first century condemnations of same-sex intercourse which were based on the abuses of power, purpose and hospitality, and were known to Jesus, have been turned into the unchangeable condemnation of the sexual act. Any departure from stereotypically male or female behaviour also challenges the institutional frameworks of socially and gender unequal societies. These departures from the cultural normalities can be seen as disordered actions which threaten the social status and the stability that these socially divided societies require. The thesis presented in this study is that it is not Christianity which is responsible for creating the persecution of gender and sexually variant people: instead that is driven by social divisions in society. However it is the collusion of the Church with this secular scapegoating of gender and sexually variant people which leads to the extremes of abuse. Therefore a Christian doctrine which condemns all forms of gender and sexually variant behaviour as disordered acts of depravity, or denounces it as the failure to live up to Christian ideals, does not make a good start. The guilt and self-loathing which is created can be enormous. The medical misdiagnosis this doctrine makes has a totally destructive effect, and the wrong methods of management are applied.

An absolute and urgent requirement is to ensure that society as a whole can develop an understanding of gender and sexually variant conditions which is medically, socially and theologically correct. However in place of treating these disagreements with the seriousness they deserve, the Church of England has determined that any future developments can only take place within its existing doctrine as "*The Church of England has received it*". Pope Francis has also made it clear that there can be no possibility of change to the traditional teaching of the Catholic Church. This is not just a matter of disagreement. It is the refusal to engage in these issues, together with the imposition of these embargos and the historic failure to involve any openly gender and sexually variant people in the working parties and the decisions that Churches make, which is blighting many people's lives.

As minority groups, gender and sexually variant people exist on the margins of society. Often in these societies only the voices of the abusers are heard. Therefore one of the greatest challenges that transgender and gender and sexually variant people must face is dealing with the misinformation that occurs. This investigation has shown that conflicts arising from these conditions cannot be fought, and that methods of acceptance, reconciling and inclusion must be used. However the attacks on the integrities of transgender and gender and sexually variant people destroy the self-acceptance and self-esteem that this requires. Self-acceptance and self-esteem are not features that can be generated individually; they are also given by others. Therefore it is imperative that the misinformation and the misunderstanding in the whole of society which relates to these issues are addressed.

3:0: Personality and Identity

The original purpose of the research work described in this document was to investigate how self-identity and personality develops in environments where tribal violence occurs. Gender identity and

Gilchrist, S. (2017): "What Does it mean to be Transgender?" 242P

First Issued: 25 December 2017. Last update: 8 February 2018.

Draft: Printed: 11/02/2018 17:35

Access via: <http://www.tqdr.co.uk/articles/index.htm>

spap4144@gmail.com

21

the theological interactions were only used as case studies to validate the processes. In section 2 of this document the development of gender and sexual identities was considered. In this current section on personality and identity that work is now extended to consider identity and personality development as a whole. A difficulty encountered in previous studies has been the inability to find an effective way of linking the neurophysiologically driven processes of early development to the cognitively driven processes in later life. This analysis resolves that issue by considering research and clinical work on the early origins of transgender conditions, and by using it to map the transition that occurs. A full description of that analysis is provided elsewhere⁶⁹. However a summary of this work is given here.

In the previous sections of this document it is shown that the creation of the core gender and sexual identities are an integral part of the processes of identity and personality formation. Therefore it is to be expected that other core elements of personality and identity will be formed in a similar way. This work on the development of gender and sexually variant identities has demonstrated the nature of the transition, in which the contagious, innate and internally created driving forces which dominate early development, and are present from birth, are held in check in subsequent life by the restraining forces of cognitive development, which only later come into effect. It is demonstrated that the rapid development of cognitive abilities takes place during the neurophysiological transformation period around a median age of two years. This enables the core elements of personality and identity, which includes gender identity and sexual identity to coalesce. “*Quorum Sensing*” is considered to be involved⁷⁰. Other core elements of personality and identity are also shown to coalesce at the same time. This transformation occurs before the cognitive processes of perception, reasoning and intuition can take a controlling role. Therefore the uncoordinated actions of the innate neurophysiological forces are the primary drivers for creating these core elements of identity. The intensity of the drive, the fragmented nature of early development and the rapidity of the coalescence means that there is a roughness in this process. In this study it is argued that individual components are not lost within this coalescence but these remain hidden inside the matrix underneath: therefore this underlying graininess disturbs the coherence of selfhood that is being formed.

The pre-frontal cortex of the brain is very primitive at birth and it remains largely in this state until the neurophysiological transformation occurs. When compared with other animals its maturation is delayed for a long time. It is argued in this analysis that the extended length of this delay, together with the stimulation provided by the lifetime tension between the feedforward and adventurous forces of physiology which are challenged by the feedback restraining forces of cognition, provides the stimulation whereby the highest achievements of human potential and individuality are created. However the downside of that is that more can go wrong with the process⁷¹. The strength and the contagious nature of early development which is identified in the neuroscientific studies, on the one hand means that the highest achievements of human potential and individuality can be achieved, on the other hand disturbances akin to personality disorders may be found. The timings of these processes are critical. If the initial development process is too strong or lasts too long the ability to develop a coherent self-identity is damaged or destroyed. On the other hand if the cognitive assessment processes dominate too early or become too great, people increasingly become

⁶⁹ Gilchrist, S. (2015): “*Personality Development and Gender: Why We Should Re-think the Process*”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/209P-RethinkPaperFull.pdf>

⁷⁰ For information on Quorum Sensing See Gilchrist, S. (2013): “*Personality Development and LGB&T People: A New Approach*”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/201P-PersonalityDevelopmentAndLGBTPeople.pdf> : Gilchrist, S. (2015): “*Personality Development and Gender: Why We Should Re-think the Process*”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/209P-RethinkPaperFull.pdf> : Gilchrist, S. (2016): “*Science and Belief. A New Approach to Identity and Personality Formation in Early Life*”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/218P-PaperPersonality.pdf>

⁷¹ For further information on this delay in the development of the pre-frontal cortex, see sections 1:1 and 2:1 of Gilchrist, S. (2013d): “*Personality Development and LGB&T People: A New Approach*”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/201P-PersonalityDevelopmentAndLGBTPeople.pdf>.

products of their surrounding environment and the ability to create the richness and uniqueness of every person's identity decreases.

Brain plasticity and brain permeability also play an important role. During early years there are specific periods when rapid learning and development can take place. These are times when the elements of plasticity and permeability reach peak values. Outside these times of peak plasticity the capabilities are much more limited and features which have been created during these periods become fixed in place. These peak periods take place in different areas of the brain at different times. The studies on the creation of the core gender and sexual identities show that by the age of three years these particular elements of identity have been unchangeably fixed in place. The reason for this can be argued for on three counts. The first comes from the early research into transgender children, which attempted to demonstrate that gender identity was created through cognitive processes, and that it was malleable before the age of three years. The failure of that work showed that the core gender identity had become unchangeably fixed by a significantly earlier age, and people now argue that pre-natal endocrinal influences are involved. The second argument comes from considering the effects of synaptic pruning and the domestication of the brain. This fixes many features in place, because those neural connections that are most used grow stronger and those that are less used die back. The third argument is available from everyday observation, where the constancy of personality is an accepted fact, which only changes if a stroke, tumour, dementia or physical brain injury occurs.

These arguments by extension lead to the conclusion that all of the core elements of personality and identity, and not just the gender and sexual identities, have become unchangeably fixed by the age of three years. However it is generally agreed that children do not establish an effective "Theory of Mind" until about one year later, at the age of around four years⁷². Before their "Theory of Mind" is sufficiently established, children are unable to question any idiosyncrasies about their own development. This means that by the time they can do this it is too late to alter what has already occurred. To many of these people the gender anomaly has been present from birth. In place of the term gender reassignment and the associated surgery, gender confirmation, and its surgery are the preferred descriptions to be used. Therefore ways of managing the core elements of personality and identity that cannot be changed and have already been created must be looked for instead.

These staged development processes, and the rapid changes during the neurophysiological transformation period mean that two different types of characteristics and conflicts are created⁷³. Those which arise during or before the neurophysiological transformation period are defined here as identity driven. The lack of overall neural co-ordination at the time of their formation means there is no direct association of desire with reward. They are driven by rejection instead. Their identity driven nature is in contrast to reward driven characteristics and conflicts where behavioural motives are involved⁷⁴. In the reward driven conflicts the initial disturbances begin during later stages of development when the cognitive processes are active. Identity driven characteristics and conflicts can be linked to personality variations and disorders while reward driven characteristics and conflicts are associated with desires and disruptions instead.

Therefore different physiognomies are found. In identity driven conflicts the features which drive them are determined before any cognitive analysis can take effect. In reward driven conflicts the

⁷² Children who can do this are described as having a "Theory of Mind". This involves the ability to attribute mental states: beliefs, intents, desires, pretending, knowledge, etc. to oneself and others and to understand that others have beliefs, desires, intentions, and perspectives that are different from one's own.

⁷³ For a comparison with Freud's and Piaget's developmental stages see section 6:3 of Gilchrist, S. (2013d): "*Personality Development and LGB&T People: A New Approach*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/201P-PersonalityDevelopmentAndLGBTPeople.pdf>

⁷⁴ Reward driven conflicts rely on cognitive abilities to associate the desire for a goal with the pleasure of the reward. The acknowledgement of distinctions between these reward driven and identity driven types of conflict is not new and in other conditions which require medical intervention, clear distinctions are currently made in the treatment and management methods that are applied.

sense of identity comes after the cognitive experiences have already occurred. These reversed patterns of formation have other major consequences since the medical methods for managing identity driven and reward driven conflicts and characteristics are almost opposite to each other. Traditional Christian theology and conventional psychiatric approaches fail to recognise these early development processes, since they both require a certain level of cognitive abilities to be present before the capabilities they rely on can come fully into effect. Great harm can be caused when medical misdiagnoses are made⁷⁵.

It is important to note that this analysis does not diminish the value of the traditional psychodynamic and social learning theories. Provided it is recognised that they act as overlays on what has already been created it enhances them instead. Freud himself defined the distinction between identity driven and reward driven conflicts in terms of inversion and perversion, and he drew from history to show how many of the leading figures in antiquity were themselves inverts in the way he describes. Freud also recognised the need for a driving force which could propel development with the intensity that his theory demanded. He chose the sexual impulse. However sexually differentiated behaviour does not become apparent until around the age of three years. That has led many psychologists and others to identify the period up to three years as a time of seething emotions, where little in the way of personality formation occurs.

From the latter part of the last century, neurophysiologically based research work pioneered by Gallese, Dawkins and others have provided the scientific foundations which affirm and justify the developmental driving mechanisms that are used in this investigation. These are present from birth, and it is shown that they dominate development during these key early years. Using this information it becomes possible to trace a continuous pattern of identity and personality development which extends from infancy to adult life. The timing and nature of the transitions between these two processes can also be mapped. Children can only use the cognitive processes of reason, perception and intuition to try to make sense of what has already been created. The formation of these core elements of personality and identity is largely complete before children are able to question the process, and much of it may be consigned to the unconscious mind.

It has been shown that the primary driving forces behind the creation of the core elements of personality and identity are the innate and contagious neurophysiological driving forces that are present from birth. These are fragmented processes which are driven by the rejection of what is wrong, and contagion, fragmentation and rejection are all present in the characteristics that are found⁷⁶. While conventional approaches may expect gender and sexual identities to lie at different points along a continuous cognitive spectrum, no such continuity exists. Even though gender and sexually variant people are common travellers in their relationships with society, and the same developmental processes are involved, the two conditions develop independently of each other. As wide a range of sexual orientations are found amongst transgender people as those which are found in society at large. Furthermore when people associate themselves with a non-binary gender identity, they are often very precise in defining how this is expressed. Because the conflicts are driven by rejection rather than desire, severe oscillations in emotion can occur. Strong polarities are often encountered. In these, the extremities of the compulsions and conflicts may bear little relation to the modesty of the perceived demands. Degrees of euphoria may be created which cross a threshold that conceals the conflict's demands. Fighting these conflicts only increases the tension.

⁷⁵ Gilchrist, S. (2013): "Management Techniques for Gender Dysphoria with Particular Reference to Transsexuality": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/205P-ManagementTechniquesInGenderDysphoria.pdf>

⁷⁶ The specific natures, limitations and narrow foci of the pre-cognitive development stages are discussed in the more detailed papers. See for example: Gilchrist, S. (2015): "Personality Development and Gender: Why We Should Re-think the Process": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/209P-RethinkPaperFull.pdf>

Also: Gilchrist, S. (2013): "Personality Development and LGB&T People: A New Approach": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/201P-PersonalityDevelopmentAndLGBTPeople.pdf>

Methods of management which involve the techniques of acceptance, reconciling and inclusion must be used instead.

These processes of personality formation are discussed more fully in other papers by the author⁷⁷. In this study it has been demonstrated that the rapid development of cognitive abilities during the neural transformation period around a median age of two years enables the core elements of personality and identity, including gender identity and sexual identity to coalesce. These unconscious concepts of personality and identity are expressed in terms of identity alone, they are about being who one is, they define the place of people in society, and they set the direction of travel for future developments that take place. It is the quality of this coalescence which determines how personality and identity is formed. For transgender people, accepting the reality of the gender identity resolves the conflict at source; however other unrelated trauma may arise. The creation of personal identities in situations where tribal violence occurs can also be better understood in the light of this analysis, together with the dynamics which reinforce these conflicts. The failure to attain effective coalescence may be a contributing factor in autism, addiction, depression and in other areas where personality disorders occur. The interactions between nature and nurture are hotly debated. This analysis does not require endocrinal or genetic influences to be active but it does not deny them. The impact of this may also depend on the nature of the condition: in autism for example these influences might be strong⁷⁸. For gender and sexually variant conditions there is evidence that genetic and/or endocrinal influences do have a significant though limited presence⁷⁹. In the case of tribal identification, there may be none. In this investigation it is demonstrated that the physiological, neurological and psychological aspects of brain development act together to form a finely tuned system in which the maximum amount of individuality, possessiveness, intelligence and inquisitiveness, together with a continuity of identity and the minimum degree of energy expenditure is formed. It is this that creates the richness of life.

4:0: Awareness

A radical approach is taken in this study and a major concern is over the lack of awareness of the early neurophysiologically driven formation processes by Christianity and traditional psychology. In section 2:6 it has already been noted that the challenges to gender and sexually variant people come from three quarters. The first comes from the attack on the good order of societies where gender discrimination and gender role division are strongly enforced. The second is the perceived carnal abuse of sex. The third arises from the enforcement of power and domination in dictatorial societies; where the abuses of power gave permission for the abuses of sex, most notably in same-sex acts. There is little public understanding of the condition. Even well-meaning opinion can be counterproductive since advice which expects transgender people to use willpower to control such conflicts has the opposite effect. A primary concern is with the interactions with society and that must include a consideration of the impact that Christianity has made.

A major challenge and achievement which was met by Christianity was its success in transferring the distinctive views of the minority Jewish religion into the dominant culture of the Greco/Roman state. This meant confronting the self-centred moralities of the culture and the sexual values which were characteristic of Greco/Roman male dominated society. That additionally meant challenging and usurping the power structures which are formed inside the powerful and dominant societies by placing the concern for the victims and the suppressed first on the religious and the social agendas of their cultures, and by embracing an all-encompassing morality which is founded on compassion,

⁷⁷ For a full personal bibliography go to: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/articles/bibliography.htm>

⁷⁸ This should not be used to increase concerns about the MMR vaccine: in the author's understanding, the benefits of the MMR vaccine vastly outweigh any difficulties that might occur, and that is supported by the great weight of medical evidence in favour of its use.

⁷⁹ See: Gilchrist, S. (2016): "Science and Belief. A New Approach to Identity and Personality Formation in Early Life": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/218P-PaperPersonality.pdf>

nurturing and love. The chasm between the condemnation of the submissive partner in a conquered society and the condemnation of the active partner in the conquering one; was an exemplar of the magnitude of the cultural clashes which occurred. Christianity strongly and vigorously challenged the abuse of sex between men as a means of enforcing subjection and domination in a male dominated world. A critique of the history, development and theology of the Christian Church, and of the surrounding Greek, Roman and Jewish societies is conducted which uses the results of the neurophysiological study. These studies confirm that the abuses of power were the major concern in first century society, and it is this abuse of power which gave permission for the abuse of sex⁸⁰.

The identity driven nature of gender and sexually variant conditions is described in section 2:2 of this document, where gender and sexually variant people who express their true attractions and identities in ways that conform to the highest moral standards of their own societies may be highly regarded, while those who misuse these relationships should be very severely condemned for their acts. This means that in any society, and at any time, where gender and sexually variant relationships are expressed the same type of evidence for this duality will also be found. Therefore everybody in first century Greek, Roman and Jewish societies would have been exposed to the experiences, including Paul and Jesus himself. In addition to this; none of these first century societies had words which correspond to the present day definitions of homosexuality and heterosexuality, and these present day definitions would not have been understood. Rather than making moral judgements on a gendered basis in these first century societies, the distinction was made between the approval of acts engaged in for the noble pursuit of love and the condemnation of those which sought the carnal abuse of sex. Thus the issue becomes one of determining what relationships could be when the concerns of power and domination do not exist.

Relationships conforming to these requirements were found in Jewish first century Chavruta and Rabbinic partnerships where love between two men could be freely expressed and the only prohibited act was that of anal penetrative sex⁸¹. In Christianity this persisted through much of the first millennium. However, because of the prevalence of sexual abuse not least within its own institutions, the influences of power were dismissed from Christian teaching⁸². This has changed, what was a condemnation based on the intention of an act, into the automatic and unvarying condemnations of the sexual act. This paradigm shift is referred to in section 2:9 of this document. By the time of Aquinas in the 13th Century, engagement in any form of gender or sexually variant behaviour for any purpose was invariably to be condemned as disordered behaviour of grave depravity which was driven by the desires of lust and improper sex. This shift is responsible for the medical misdiagnoses of these conditions; and it denies the legitimacy of engagement in sexual relationships and cross-gender behaviour which result from the outpouring of love. By defining all forms of gender and sexually variant behaviour as reward driven features, their identity driven natures are not understood and the existence of the early and innate developmental processes which give rise to them is denied.

⁸⁰ Rabbinic interpretations dating from close to the first century indicate that this was the primary purpose of the prohibitions of same-sex intercourse in Leviticus 18:22 and 20:13. These prohibitions did not apply to women and to boys under the age of nine years and one day since humiliation and domination, could not be perceived in the acts. For a full consideration see Section 4:4:1 "Power and Sex in Same-Sex Acts" in: Gilchrist, S. (2016): "Influences of Gender and Sexual Variation in the History and Traditions of the Christian Church": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/220P-InfluencesChurch.pdf>

⁸¹ See section 4:4:1 "Power and Sex in Same-Sex Acts" in Gilchrist, S. (2016): "Influences of Gender and Sexual Variation in the History and Traditions of the Christian Church": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/220P-InfluencesChurch.pdf>. Other analyses are given in: Gilchrist, S. (2016): "Influences of Gender and Sexual Variation on the Life and Teaching of Jesus": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/219P-InfluencesJesus.pdf>. Gilchrist, S. (2014): *Christianity and Crisis: An Overview of Gender and Sexual Difference in the Early and Modern Christian Church* and in Gilchrist, S. (2013): *An Unfinished Reformation*. <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/016B-UnfinishedReformationArticle.pdf>

⁸² Gilchrist, S. (2017): "Condemning Sexual Abuse and Welcoming Gender and Sexually Variant People into the Christian Church": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/237P-ChangesInChurch.pdf>

However a further limitation comes from the traditional psychodynamic and social learning theories themselves. Freud, Piaget and others attempted to describe early development by creating social constructs such as the ego, super-ego and id. This is because the relationships between these elements are always described in cognitive terms. That demands a level of brain organisation which is capable of handling these relationships. Its absence in turn leads to the assumption that the traditional theories largely act on a blank canvas, and that has been the foundation of much research. Compared with the “bottom up” neurophysiologically based analysis which is presented this investigation these theories adopt a “top down” approach. They begin by considering mature brain functioning, from which constructs are created which seek to explain the relationships between the conscious and unconscious mind. Although constructs such as the ego and id are created, the interactions between them are still explained in cognitive terms. A sufficient level of cognitive ability must therefore be present for the psychodynamic theories to come into effect: And the social learning theories require them to be present at all times. No account is taken of the innate neurophysiological forces which dominate early life. It is therefore presumed that meaningful development starts from about the age of three years on a blank and malleable canvas. The consequence of this is that the existence and influence of the innate physiological development processes that dominates development before and up to the time of the neurophysiological transition period is likewise denied.

The social changes of the last sixty years, which include equality legislation and the provision for same-sex marriage that are now enshrined in law in many countries and states, have enabled people to see for themselves the wide variety of moral behaviour that is encountered. Relationships can also be established which past criminalisation has prevented. When people are prepared to keep an open mind, the same full range of moral commitments and aspirations can be observed among gender and sexually variant people as those in the general population. The same public attitudes to the same-sex behaviour which are openly experienced in many societies at the present time would also have been known to Jesus, John, Paul, and to all others in their own first century cultures; because cross-gender and same-sex relationships were widely expressed. That moral duality is contradicted by the traditional teaching of the Christian Church which condemns without exception every expression of gender and sexually variant behaviour as inherently sinful and it regards all of these as heinous acts. It is affirmed in this analysis that Paul correctly summarises the teaching of Jesus when he states in Galatians 3:26-29: *“For in Christ Jesus you are all children of God through faith. As many of you as were baptized into Christ have clothed yourselves with Christ. There is no longer Jew or Greek, there is no longer slave or free, there is no longer male and female; for all of you are one in Christ Jesus. And if you belong to Christ, then you are Abraham’s offspring, heirs according to the promise”*. When the abuses of power are absent it is concluded that all people, transgender, transsexual, lesbian, gay, heterosexual and bisexual people who attempt to live their lives in ways that fulfil the love of Christ, and who seek to express their own identities within roles that are true to themselves; must be fully accepted in their own right⁸³. It is further demonstrated in this investigation that the recovery of this teaching of Jesus can be achieved by altering the boundary imposed by the traditional teaching of the Christian Church: from one which condemns all forms of gender and sexually variant behaviour whatever its purpose, into one which applies the same standards of morality, behaviour and duty to the full range of gender identities, sexualities, intentions and acts⁸⁴. In accordance with the teaching of Jesus in the New Covenant, there is no condemnation of any heterosexual, cross-gender and same-sex behaviour or acts of sex when these are governed by the love, purity of intention, the commitment and the faithfulness which the Gospel message expects

⁸³ Gilchrist, S. (2017): *“Hearing without Listening: The Eunuch and the Christian Church”*: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/013B-HearingWithoutListening.pdf>

⁸⁴ See section 4:5:6: *“Accuracy”* of Gilchrist, S. (2016): *“Influences of Gender and Sexual Variation in the History and Traditions of the Christian Church”*: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/220P-InfluencesChurch.pdf>.

5:0: Family Values, Church and Transgender Issues

To consider these issues it should again be noted that the challenges to gender and to sexually variant people come from three quarters. The first of these comes from the attack on the good order of societies where gender discrimination and gender role division are strongly enforced. The second is the perceived carnal abuse of sex. The third arises from the enforcement of power and domination in dictatorial societies; where the abuses of power gave permission for the abuses of sex, most notably in same-sex acts. In Judaism, the Rabbis identified a number of intersex and cross-gender condition which they tried to fit into binary patterns. However this was principally because of the need to conform to the rituals of purity in the Jewish tradition. The driving force was not a horror of sex.

The exclusive practice of same-sex relationships was also censured by the Rabbis for four main reasons⁸⁵. The first was that same-sex relationships cannot result in procreation. The second was stability in marriage: in a society where arranged and early marriages were the normal practice, the sexuality of each of the partners was not taken into account. The third was the disruption of the social order: in a society where men and women are treated unequally, the gender based power structure is challenged by all same-sex and cross-gender acts. The fourth is for power and control, by the debasement of citizenship, the use of same-sex rape to enforce subjection and domination between unequal individuals and societies, also to humiliate a beaten enemy. Although the attitudes to non-reproductive sexual acts are extensively discussed in the Jewish Talmud and elsewhere the Halacha there are few principal passages in the Old Testament which condemn such non-reproductive sex. The most commonly referred to are those about Sodom and Gomorrah⁸⁶ and Leviticus 18:22 and 20:13, although Numbers 31:18 is also relevant. There is little controversy in the rabbinic tradition about the meaning of these texts. They are translated in various ways, but the basic meaning is made quite clear that their focus was on condemning the abuses of power which gave permission for the abuses of sex. The same is found when the teaching of Jesus is examined. Both Jesus and Peter condemned Sodom and Gomorrah for their lack of hospitality and their social immoralities rather than the act of sex⁸⁷. In the story of the Centurion and the slave it is the primacy of love which dominates any concern about a sexual act⁸⁸. Evidence of the high degree of trauma and distress that these power conflicts create continues to be present today. In the past that has also extended from the Christian practice of slavery in the Americas to the empires of the ancient world. Paul also sets his own condemnations in the context of sexual abuse⁸⁹. No examination of

⁸⁵ See section 4:5 of Gilchrist, S. (2011): *Issues on the Sanctity of Same-Sex Relationships*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/014B-IssuesOnTheSanctityOfSame-SexRelationships.pdf>.

⁸⁶ See: Genesis 10:19, 13:10, 12, 13, 14:2, 8, 10-11, 12, 17, 21-22, 18:16, 20, 22, 26, 19:1, 4, 24, 28; Deuteronomy 23:17, 29:23, 32:32, Ezekiel 16:46, 48-49, 53, 55-56. The entire first chapter of Isaiah is an utter condemnation of Judah which is repeatedly compared with Sodom and Gomorrah because of their evildoing and depravity. The Prophet lists many sins of the people: rebelling against God, lacking in knowledge, deserting the Lord, idolatry, engaging in meaningless religious ritual, being unjust and oppressive to others, being insensitive to the needs of widows and orphans, committing murder, accepting bribes, etc. There is no reference to any sexual activities at all. Jeremiah 23:14 also states: "...among the prophets of Jerusalem I have seen something horrible: They commit adultery and live a lie. They strengthen the hands of evildoers, so that no one turns from his wickedness. They are all like Sodom to me; the people of Jerusalem are like Gomorrah." Even though Jeremiah compares the actions of the prophets with the adultery, lying and evil of the people of Sodom; what today would be regarded as homosexual activity is not mentioned. Ezekiel 16:49-50 writes: "Now this was the sin of your sister Sodom: She and her daughters were arrogant, overfed and unconcerned; they did not help the poor and needy. They were haughty and did detestable things before me. Therefore I did away with them as you have seen." God states clearly that he destroyed Sodom's sins because of their pride, their excess of food while the poor and needy suffered; again sexual activity is not mentioned. Jude, in Chapter 4 Verse 7, disagreed with Jesus and Ezekiel; he wrote that Sodom's sins were sexual in nature. Various biblical translations of this passage in Jude describe the sin as: fornication, going after strange flesh, sexual immorality, perverted sensuality, homosexuality, lust of every kind, immoral acts and unnatural lust. However a likely interpretation is that the author of Jude was criticising the men of Sodom for wanting to engage in sexual activities with angels. This reflected a then current myth.

⁸⁷ For a discussion of these see alleged abuses see section 4:4:1 Gilchrist, S. (2016): "*Influences of Gender and Sexual Variation in the History and Traditions of the Christian Church*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/220P-InfluencesChurch.pdf>

⁸⁸ See section 3:4 of Gilchrist, S. (2016): "*Influences of Gender and Sexual Variation on the Life and Teaching of Jesus*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/219P-InfluencesJesus.pdf>

⁸⁹ See section 4:5 of: Gilchrist, S. (2016): "*Influences of Gender and Sexual Variation in the History and Traditions of the Christian Church*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/220P-InfluencesChurch.pdf>

Christian theology and its attitudes to all forms of gender and sexually variant behaviour can be complete without taking a full account of these relationships between power and sex.

Much of the current campaigning focus on LGBTI issues is concerned with the acceptability of same-sex relationships and same-sex marriage in Christianity and the Christian Church. For transgender people there are important differences since those who have obtained legal recognition of their gender identity through the granting of a United Kingdom Gender Recognition Certificate are already able to have a full Church of England wedding, which can also take place in a Church of England Church. The traditional doctrine of the Christian Church is that marriage can only be between a man and a woman for life, but that doctrine on marriage is confronted when one person in a heterosexual marriage undergoes gender reassignment. How marriage can or may survive when one partner transitions is of crucial concern and the adjustments which are demanded of spouses are at least as great, if not greater than those on the transgender partner. That challenge is made even greater because gender identity and sexual orientation act independently of each other⁹⁰. Many transgender people marry in their imposed gender role, and do so for all the right reasons and love they possess. However as age increases the drive gets stronger, and if no way is found to manage these dynamics the outcome can be a total, sudden and catastrophic collapse. This can have devastating results. Of the genetic males⁹¹ who seek professional help, approximately 50% are either married or they have been married, and about 70% of these have children. In about one third of female to male transsexuals, their sexual attractions shift while they are transitioning⁹². Circumstantial evidence and the available studies also suggest that an equivalent rate amongst male to female transsexuals might be expected. About 50% of the marriages do survive: however in only a quarter of all the marriages, is the breakup directly attributed to transgender issues.

These findings highlight the fact that many relationships can and do endure through a gender transition, and they emphasise the importance of close, supportive relationships both during and after the transition has taken place. It is demonstrated from this research and from practical experience of transgender people, that the love and commitment which can be found in a marriage is not determined by gender identity or by sexual orientation. That highlights the major conflict which occurs because the traditional teaching of the Christian Church on gender and sexual variation contradicts the scientific results. The subverting of these boundaries suggests that the same degree of acceptance must be applied to all marriages, heterosexual, same-sex and transgender alike⁹³. Thus the gender transition, together with the associated changes in sexual orientation, (whenever they occur), confound the principles on which the traditional teaching of the Church on marriage and on gender and sexual variant behaviour, is based. If Christianity is to be able to deal with this situation it must either deny the validity of the journey that transgender people make, or it must be prepared to consider changes to its traditional doctrine. If it adopts the former, it destroys the self-acceptance and self-esteem that transgender people need to manage their conditions, it also gives legitimacy to the medical misdiagnoses of these conditions and it justifies the harm that is created

⁹⁰ Gilchrist, Susan. (2017): "Marriage, Sex and Gender": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/030B-MarriageAndGenderArticle.pdf>. This also draws on the following paper: Gilchrist, Susan and Beardsley, Tina. (2014): A Presentation for The Workshop: "Love's constancy & legal niceties: transgender perspectives on marriage". Led by Tina Beardsley & Susan Gilchrist⁹⁰, "To Have and To Hold – the theology of marriage", held on Saturday 27th September 2014 10 a.m. to 4.30 p.m. at St John's Church, Waterloo, London. For the paper see: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/SuE0927f-TrangenderMarriageFinal.pdf>

⁹¹ This identification is used in the research work which is being quoted: using it does not define the gender identity: its use excludes intersex conditions where genetic differences occur.

⁹² Meier, S. Colton; Sharp, Carla; Michonski, Jared; Babcock, Julia C; Fitzgerald, Kara: (2013) "Romantic Relationships of Female-to-Male Transgender Men: A Descriptive Study" International Journal of Transgenderism, 14:75–85, 2013: Taylor & Francis Group: ISSN: 1553-2739 print / 1434-4599 online DOI: 10.1080/15532739.2013.791651. Erhardt, V. (2007): "Head over heels: Wives who stay with cross-dressers and transsexuals". New York: Haworth Press. Bischof, Gary H. Warnaar, Bethany L. Barajas, Mark S. Dhaliwal, Harkiran K (2011): "Thematic Analysis of the Experiences of Wives Who Stay with Husbands who Transition Male-to-Female". Western Michigan University: *Michigan Family Review*, 15(1), 16-34, 2011 © Michigan Council on Family Relations

⁹³ Gilchrist, S. (2016): "Sex and Gender Variation in the Christian Church: Is it Not Time to Consider the Science?": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/226P-ConsiderScience.pdf>

by the “*reparative therapy*” approaches described in section 2:3 of this document. In July 2017 the Church of England General Synod passed a resolution affirming the legitimacy of the identities of transgender people and asked the House of Bishops to consider the preparation of a liturgy to mark the gender transition which affirmed the identity of the persons concerned⁹⁴. However the presumptive way in which the House of Bishops has decided that no special liturgy is needed has caused considerable anger and distress⁹⁵. Many gender and sexually variant people feel let down and abused by this response. Lives are at risk when these issues are avoided or are not properly addressed.

Amoris Laetitia (English: *The Joy of Love*) is a post-synodal apostolic exhortation by Pope Francis addressing the pastoral care of families. It was released on 8 April 2016. It follows the Synods on the Family held in 2014 and 2015⁹⁶. On same-sex relationships and gender identity Pope Francis states: (paragraph 52): “*On gay and lesbian partnerships: We need to acknowledge the great variety of family situations that can offer a certain stability, but de facto or same-sex unions, for example, may not simply be equated with marriage*”, and (paragraph 56): “*On questions of gender identity: Yet another challenge is posed by the various forms of an ideology of gender that “denies the difference and reciprocity in nature of a man and a woman and envisages a society without sexual differences, thereby eliminating the anthropological basis of the family. This ideology leads to educational programmes and legislative enactments that promote a personal identity and emotional intimacy radically separated from the biological difference between male and female. Consequently, human identity becomes the choice of the individual, one which can also change over time.” It is a source of concern that some ideologies of this sort, which seek to respond to what are at times understandable aspirations, manage to assert themselves as absolute and unquestionable, even dictating how children should be raised. It needs to be emphasized that “biological sex and the socio-cultural role of sex (gender) can be distinguished but not separated.”*⁹⁷ In a 2008 Christmas message Pope Benedict XVI denounced gender theory, warning that it blurs the distinctions between male and female and that it could lead to the “self-destruction” of the human race. He also warned against separating the term gender from sex. He said: “*What is often expressed and understood by the term “gender” is definitively resolved in the self-emancipation of the human being from creation and the Creator: “Man wants to create himself, and to decide always and exclusively on his own about what concerns him.” “This is humanity living “against truth, against the creating Spirit”.* Pope Benedict directly addressed transgender issues by cautioning Catholics about “*destroying the very essence of the human creature through manipulating their God-given gender to suit their sexual choices*”⁹⁸. Pope Francis has also been quoted in a book, saying that “*gender theory*”, like nuclear weapons, is a danger to humanity⁹⁹.

⁹⁴ Gilchrist, S. (2017): “*Transgender Liturgies: The Interactions between Science and Theology in the Life of the Church*”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/234P-SynodMotionTransgender.pdf>

⁹⁵ The continuing refusal to consult with transgender people is seen in the way the House of Bishops has responded to the motion passed in the Church of England General Synod in July 2017. This required the Bishops to consider the preparation of liturgies affirming transgender people’s identities. A response is contained in the statement: <http://www.onebodyonefaith.org.uk/news/jan-18-trans-statement/>. The official Church of England press release states that “*the House of Bishops has prayerfully considered whether a new national commended service might be prepared to mark a gender transition*”. However in place of any due consideration of the liturgy requested, it is understood that the existing rite of Affirmation of Baptismal Faith was placed on the agenda under “business for deemed approval” and accepted without debate. It is hard to believe that a motion overwhelmingly approved at the General Synod, which explicitly calls on the Bishops to consider collectively an issue of such sensitivity was treated in this desultory way. For such a sensitive issue to be accepted without debate, and unrecorded, represents a significant failure by the bishops, who, as “moral agents” are both “collectively and separately” responsible for ensuring that the highest standards of governance are maintained.

⁹⁶ Pope Francis (2016): “*Amoris laetitia: Post-Synodal Apostolic Exhortation on love in the family*”: (19 March 2016): https://w2.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/apost_exhortations.index.html

⁹⁷ Paragraph 251 of “*Amoris Laetitia*” Pope Francis also stated: “*In discussing the dignity and mission of the family, the Synod Fathers observed that, “as for proposals to place unions between homosexual persons on the same level as marriage, there are absolutely no grounds for considering homosexual unions to be in any way similar or even remotely analogous to God’s plan for marriage and family”. It is unacceptable “that local Churches should be subjected to pressure in this matter and that international bodies should make financial aid to poor countries dependent on the introduction of laws to establish ‘marriage’ between persons of the same sex”.*

⁹⁸ Israely, Jeff: (2008): “The Pope’s Christmas Condemnation of Transsexuals”. *Time Magazine* Tuesday, Dec. 23, 2008 <http://content.time.com/time/world/article/0,8599,1868390,00.html>. Also: “*Address Of His Holiness Benedict XVI To The Members Of*

In this investigation it is shown that the teaching of Pope Francis which is contained in “*Amoris Laetitia*” medically misdiagnoses these conditions. By identifying the development of gender identity as a matter of choice and the pursuit of reward it defies the scientific consensus adopted by the great majority of professional institutions. It also contradicts the results of this research, which identify these as identity driven features instead of characteristics driven by reward. That consensus regards both gender and sexually variant identities and behaviour as naturally expected variations of the human condition, which are intrinsic to the personality created, that arise very early in development and cannot be changed either by the individual concerned or by the predations of others in subsequent life. The allegation which Pope Francis makes in this Church doctrine that “*Gender theory denies identity*” is totally contrary to the principles established in this scientific research. The real purpose of what Pope Francis defines as “*Gender theory*” is not to deny gender identity: instead it is to ensure that a secure gender identity can be obtained. The argument that “*Gender theory*” is pursued by propagandists is also a slur on the integrity of those who are involved. A Canadian Catholic Bishop additionally upheld these perceptions when he condemned a school policy by stating: “*It is the conviction of the Catholic Church that genetically, anatomically and chromosomally, the body reveals the divine plan, and that humans are "obliged to regard [their bodies] as good and to hold [them] in honour since God has created [them]."* Therefore, to attempt “*gender transitioning*” is contrary to the teachings of the Catholic Church”¹⁰⁰. In August 2016 Pope Francis stated: “*Its ‘terrible’ children taught they can choose gender*”. He also said there were powerful institutions which funded the spread of “*gender theory*” in schools. He told the Polish bishops: “*Today, children are taught this at school: that everyone can choose their own sex. And why do they teach this? Because the books come from those people and institutions who give money,*” he said. “*God created man and woman; God created the world like this and we are doing the exact opposite*”¹⁰¹. These theologically based arguments are refuted in more detail in the paper by the author: Gilchrist, S. (2017): “*No, Pope Francis: Gender Identity is not a Choice*”¹⁰².

Amongst fundamentalist protestant churches in America and in many African countries the same type of approach is adopted. In 2014, the Southern Baptist Convention approved a resolution at its annual meeting stating that “*God's design was the creation of two distinct and complementary sexes, male and female*” and that “*gender identity is determined by biological sex, not by one's self-perception.*” Furthermore, the resolution opposes hormone therapy, transition-related procedures, and anything else that would “*alter one's bodily identity,*” as well as opposing government efforts to validate transgender identity¹⁰³. The logic of these arguments is that transgender identities cannot exist. On the 15th December 2017, twenty Catholic Bishops and religious leaders of various denominations signed a letter issued by The United States Conference of Catholic Bishops, which affirmed their traditional religious position and declared that gender identity must always be determined by biological sex¹⁰⁴. The legitimacy of all transgender identities was also denied¹⁰⁵. The destructive nature of the collusion of the Church with the secular scapegoating of transgender people in these societies is described in section 2:4: “*Social Consequences*” of this document.

The Roman Curia For The Traditional Exchange Of Christmas Greetings, Clementine Hall Monday, 22 December 2008

https://w2.vatican.va/content/benedict-xvi/en/speeches/2008/december/documents/hf_ben-xvi_spe_20081222_curia-romana.html

⁹⁹ McElwee, Joshua. (2015): “Francis strongly criticizes gender theory, comparing it to nuclear arms”. *National Catholic Reporter (US)* Feb. 13, 2015 <https://www.ncronline.org/news/vatican/francis-strongly-criticizes-gender-theory-comparing-nuclear-arms>

¹⁰⁰ Christine Niles, Christine. (2015): “*Canadian Catholic Schools Defy Archbishop on Transgender Policy*” ChurchMilitant.com October 7, 2015 <http://www.churchmilitant.com/news/article/canadian-catholic-schools-to-approve-inclusive-transgender-policy>

¹⁰¹ Pope Francis (2016): “*It's ‘terrible’ children taught they can choose gender*” Catholic Herald 3 August 2016

<http://catholicherald.co.uk/news/2016/08/03/pope-francis-its-terrible-children-taught-they-can-choose-gender/>

¹⁰² Gilchrist, S. (2017): “*No, Pope Francis: Gender Identity is not a Choice*”. <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/227P-No-PopeFrancis.pdf>

¹⁰³ Southern Baptist Convention: (2014): “*On Transgender Identity*”, Baltimore, MD 2014 <http://www.sbc.net/resolutions/2250/on-transgender-identity>

¹⁰⁴ Gilchrist, S. (2017m): “*Mistreating Transgender Children*” Leaflet: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/241P-MistreatingTransgenderChildrenLeaflet.pdf>

¹⁰⁵ Catholic Bishop's Letter: <http://www.usccb.org/issues-and-action/marriage-and-family/marriage/promotion-and-defense-of-marriage/created-male-and-female.cfm> See also: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/SuH1215x-USCatholicBishopsLetter.pdf>

Gilchrist, S. (2017): “*What Does it mean to be Transgender?*” 242P

First Issued: 25 December 2017. Last update: 8 February 2018.

Draft: Printed: 11/02/2018 17:35

Access via: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/articles/index.htm>

spap4144@gmail.com

31

The harm that can be done by “*gay cure*” and “*reparative therapy*” approaches is described in section 2:3: *Misunderstanding and Misdiagnoses* in this account. That arises because the assumption continues to be made that gender identity is a God-given feature which is determined by biological sex, and any departures from this are driven by the predations of others or the pursuit of illicit rewards. In this analysis it is demonstrated that gender and sexually variant people develop an identity and allegiance which is contrary to their biological sex: but this is at least as firmly held as those for whom their identity and allegiance follow a normal path. This consensus regards both gender and sexually variant identities and behaviour as naturally expected variations of the human condition, which are intrinsic to the personality created, that arise very early in development and cannot be changed either by the individual concerned or by the predations of others in subsequent life. No gender identity which is congruent with the biological sex can ever be found because it did not exist. Attempting to recover or to reinstate such an identity leaves a vacuum in its wake, and creates its harmful effect.

In section 2:1 it is shown that two different types of characteristics and conflicts are created. Identity driven characteristics and conflicts can be linked to personality variations and disorders while reward driven characteristics and conflicts are associated with desires and disruptions instead. There are major differences between the two conflict types¹⁰⁶. In identity driven conflicts the features which drive them are determined before any cognitive analysis can take effect. In reward driven conflicts the sense of identity comes after the cognitive experiences have already occurred. These reversed patterns of formation have other major consequences since the medical methods for managing identity driven and reward driven conflicts and characteristics are almost opposite to each other, and great harm can be caused when the resulting medical misdiagnoses are made¹⁰⁷. In sections 2:7 and 2:8 of this document a different approach is presented which recognises the identity driven nature of these conditions and affirms the foundations upon which the development of gender and sexual identities are based. In place of the blame for letting oneself down, the hurt to other people that has been caused, and the guilt for the inability to conform to the edicts of others and one’s own expectations, which are created by the “*gay cure*” and “*reparative therapy*” approaches, this methodology works to create the inclusion and acceptance of the reality and worth of the gender identity that is possessed to create the self-acceptance and self-esteem that is needed to calm the compulsive demands.

Despite all of these abuses and concerns there is little evidence that the Churches are willing to move sufficiently on these matters. Current approaches by the Church of England and the Catholic Church¹⁰⁸ seek to provide pastoral care for transgender and other gender and sexually variant people, while at the same time refusing to consider any change to the traditional teaching of the Church. The 2017 report of the Church England “*Bishop’s Reflection Group on Sexuality*” confined

¹⁰⁶ Freud himself defined the distinction between identity driven and reward driven conflicts in terms of inversion and perversion, and he drew from history to show how many of the leading figures in antiquity were themselves inverted in the way he describes.

¹⁰⁷ Gilchrist, S. (2013): “*Management Techniques for Gender Dysphoria with Particular Reference to Transsexuality*”: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/205P-ManagementTechniquesInGenderDysphoria.pdf>

¹⁰⁸ See for example the Catechism of the Roman Catholic Church (2017), *Part 3 Life in Christ*. Article 2357: Homosexuality refers to relations between men or between women who experience an exclusive or predominant sexual attraction toward persons of the same sex. It has taken a great variety of forms through the centuries and in different cultures. Its psychological genesis remains largely unexplained. Basing itself on Sacred Scripture, which presents homosexual acts as acts of grave depravity, tradition has always declared that “homosexual acts are intrinsically disordered.” They are contrary to the natural law. They close the sexual act to the gift of life. They do not proceed from a genuine affective and sexual complementarity. Under no circumstances can they be approved. Article 2358: The number of men and women who have deep-seated homosexual tendencies is not negligible. This inclination, which is objectively disordered, constitutes for most of them a trial. They must be accepted with respect, compassion, and sensitivity. Every sign of unjust discrimination in their regard should be avoided. These persons are called to fulfil God’s will in their lives and, if they are Christians, to unite to the sacrifice of the Lord’s Cross the difficulties they may encounter from their condition. Article 2359: Homosexual persons are called to chastity. By the virtues of self-mastery that teach them inner freedom, at times by the support of disinterested friendship, by prayer and sacramental grace, they can and should gradually and resolutely approach Christian perfection.
http://www.vatican.va/archive/ccc_css/archive/catechism/p3s2c2a6.htm

any future consideration to that of: *“Interpreting the existing law and guidance to permit maximum freedom within it, without changes to the law, or the doctrine of the Church”*. On the 16th February 2017 following the decision by the General Synod not to take note of the report of the Bishops Reflection Group the Archbishops of Canterbury and York wrote a letter to members of the Church of England which restated the same position. In the paper: *“Next Steps on Human Sexuality”* also written by the Archbishops of Canterbury and York, which was approved by the General Synod of the Church of England on the 7th July 2017, the same constraints were applied. This has the implication that they will continue to be applied to all future work. If these dishonours are to come to a better resolution, there must be no cover-ups, and no holding back. That must include a re-examination of the traditional doctrines on homosexuality and on gender and sexually variant behaviour, not *“As the Church of England has received it”*, but by taking a fresh approach: so that the Church is not misled in future years. For as long as any Christian church continues to proclaim a doctrine which medically misdiagnoses how gender and sexual identities develop and excludes any consideration of the relationships between power, gender and sex from its remit, these gender and sexual abuses will continue to take place

Extended studies have been undertaken to determine how and why this has taken place. A critique of the history, development and theology of the Christian Church, and of the surrounding Greek, Roman and Jewish societies has therefore been conducted. This uses the results of the neurophysiological and psychological study, in combination with the knowledge of the full range of moralities in gender and sexually variant behaviour that this has shown to exist. Full descriptions of this analysis can be found in other papers by this author¹⁰⁹. One of these is: Gilchrist, S. (2017): *“A House Built on Sand? Attitudes to Gender and Sexual Variant Identities and Behaviour in Christianity and the Christian Church”*¹¹⁰: Another is: Gilchrist, S. (2017): *“The Gospel of Thomas and its Impact on Gender and Sexual Variation in the Christian Church”*¹¹¹. A brief summary of the conclusions is given in section 4 of this account. As with Paul’s statement in Galatians 3:28, this requires that all transgender people, transsexual lesbian, gay, heterosexual and bisexual people who attempt to live their lives in ways that fulfil the love of Christ, and who seek to express their own identities in roles that are true to themselves; must be accepted in their own right. When influences of power and abuse are absent there is no automatic condemnation of any cross-gender identification or same-sex act of sex. All such behaviour is governed by love, commitment, purity of intention and there is no toleration of abusive sex. Today it is the clashes between what is seen by society as the common sense values, and the fervent reliance by the Church on its traditional doctrines, which is destroying the credibility of Christianity in the eyes of the world. Change is urgently needed, but it is not change which departs from the Gospel message, it is change which returns to the Gospel texts.

6:0: Disorder and Abuse

Because of the need to combat the gross abuses of power and sex in Roman society, most notably in same sex acts, all awareness of the identity driven nature and the full range of moral expression in gender and sexually variant behaviour, which is fully recognised in the teaching of Jesus and in this scientific research, has been lost. Any form of gender and sexually variant behaviour, for any purpose, which disrupts the social divisions demanded by these very unequal and gender differentiated societies can be considered a disordered act. The subsequent criminalisation and persecution of gender and sexually variant people for nearly two thousand years has since prevented all evidence of the full range of moral attitudes being encountered. Any behaviour which

¹⁰⁹ See the bibliography

¹¹⁰ Gilchrist, S. (2017): *“A House Built on Sand? Attitudes to Gender and Sexual Variant Identities and Behaviour in Christianity and the Christian Church”*: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/231P-HouseUponSand.pdf>

¹¹¹ Gilchrist, S. (2017): *“The Gospel of Thomas and its Impact on Gender and Sexual Variation in the Christian Church”*: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/027B-Thomas.pdf>

challenges the normally expected behaviour of men and women in society can challenge the moral expectations of that community and can be regarded as disordered acts.

With the traditional doctrine which condemns all gender and sexually variant behaviour as acts of grave depravity the suspicion that it is being engaged in for abusive purposes can easily arise. Thus any departures from the expected ordering of society can be quickly attacked. On the 13th November 2017 the Church of England published new guidance to Church schools: "*Valuing All God's Children*" on tackling homophobic, biphobic and transphobic bullying¹¹². The immediate response of the popular press was to ridicule and to trivialise this approach. The headline in the Sun said: "*The skirt on the drag queen goes swish; swish; swish*"¹¹³. An article in the Daily Express on gender neutral shop changing rooms expresses the opinion that because that transgender people are such a tiny minority, any rights that they might have should be disregarded, because the majority may be perverts who abuse this approach¹¹⁴. Another article; published by the Daily Mail Online states "*I'm not surprised the absurd Church of England says boys can wear tiaras to school. All common sense has been lost in the gender debate*"¹¹⁵ When splashing the headline: "*Church: Let Little Boys Wear Tiaras*", the Daily Mail quoted a conservative Christian activist who called the new guidelines: "*unkind, unloving and lacking in compassion*". She said: "*we are all against bullying, but the Church is using these guidelines to pursue an agenda that runs counter to the Church's teaching.*" The article also states "*schools have been told they can't use Bible as basis for gender identification*"¹¹⁶. A rash of other articles of this type has since appeared¹¹⁷. All of them demonstrate how both church and society collude in the condemnation of all forms of gender and sexually variant behaviour. The encouragement that is given for children to explore their gender identity in the Church of England document: "*Valuing All God's Children*", is condemned as advancing moral degradation, increasing the potential for sexual abuse, and supporting the engagement in dissolute acts¹¹⁸.

These matters are of considerable concern. Transgender people are between eight and ten times more likely to attempt suicide than are all heterosexuals¹¹⁹. Higher rates of drug abuse are also

¹¹² Church of England: (2017): "*Valuing All God's Children: Guidance for Church of England schools on challenging homophobic, biphobic and transphobic bullying*": Second Edition, Autumn 2017 https://www.churchofengland.org/sites/default/files/2017-11/Valuing%20All%20God%27s%20Children%27s%20Report_0.pdf

¹¹³ The Sun: Monday 13 November 2017

¹¹⁴ Daily Express 10th November 2017: "*We must stop pandering to the tiny minority that is the transgender lobby says TIM NEWARK THE news that Topshop has caved into transgender pressure and is to abandon separate men's and women's changing rooms is just another indication of a minority rights culture that has got way out of hand*". <https://www.express.co.uk/comment/expresscomment/877876/Stop-pandering-to-tiny-transgender-lobby>

¹¹⁵ Daily Mail 14 November 2017: "*I'm not surprised the absurd Church of England says boys can wear tiaras to school. All common sense has been lost in the gender debate, writes A.N. WILSON*": <http://www.dailymail.co.uk/debate/article-5079597/The-absurd-Church-England-says-boys-wear-tiaras.html#ixzz4yWRloWQM>

¹¹⁶ Daily Mail: 13 November 2017: See: <http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-5075641/Let-little-boys-wear-tiaras-says-Church-England.html#ixzz4yWNdxTNw>

¹¹⁷ Gilchrist, S. (2017): "*Religious and Secular Scapegoating of Transgender People: and its impact on the Christian Church*": <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/238P-SecularScapegoating.pdf>

¹¹⁸ In section 2:7 of the document it is shown that giving all children the ability to explore their gender identity gives them the ability to find it. It does not give them the freedom to choose it. While a great majority of children do find that they identify with their biological sex, some will not, and the hurt, guilt and self-loathing that can result may have a very harmful effect. Like the consequence of the medical misdiagnoses, this enormous trauma, guilt and the high rates of attempted suicide among young transgender people is not caused by giving children the freedom to explore it: it is caused by the denial of that freedom instead.

¹¹⁹ Attempted suicide among transsexuals: A common theme that is found in many studies is that 41 percent of transgender people in the United States have attempted to commit suicide. About 19 percent of transgender people report being refused medical care because of their gender-nonconforming status, and 2 percent have been violently assaulted in a doctor's office. These statistics come from the findings from a survey of more than 7,000 transgender people conducted by the National Center for Transgender Equality and the National Gay and Lesbian Task Force, released in the October 2010. *Journal of Homosexuality*. Other surveys and research papers provided similarly high statistics. A figure of 32% is cited by Clements-Nolle, Kristen. Marx, Rani, Katz, Mitchell (2006): "*Attempted Suicide among Transgender Persons*". *Journal of Homosexuality* Volume 51, Issue 3, 2006. Figures of 35% are reported in the UK. See: Reed, Bernard. Rhodes, Stephennie, Schofield, Pieta, Wylie, Kevan. (2009) "*Gender Variance in the UK: Prevalence, Growth and Geographic Distribution*." GIRES <http://www.gires.org.uk/assets/Medpro-Assets/GenderVarianceUK-report.pdf>. This compares with about 5% for the general population. See: <http://www.samaritans.org/support-us/why-support-samaritans/facts-and-figures-about-suicide>

found. In this context meta studies are also important and references to some of these are given¹²⁰
¹²¹ ¹²² A recent report on research carried out in association with the University of Cambridge of over 3,700 lesbian, gay, bi and transgender (LGBT) pupils in Britain's schools shows that more than four in five trans young people have self-harmed, as have three in five lesbian, gay and bisexual young people who aren't transgender. Also more than two in five transgender young people have attempted to take their own lives¹²³ Useful non-technical accounts can also be found elsewhere¹²⁴. Reasons for transgender suicide are also examined. In a simple literature search this author found over 40 peer reviewed papers dealing with the subject. Consistently it is shown that reasons for suicide relate to the guilt, bullying, rejection by families and communities, allegations of sexual abuse, violence, and the persecution and scapegoating of minorities, which are the causal features leading to the internalised transphobia that involves the depression and the self-loathing, which lead people to take their own lives.

For most people the intuitive expectation is that gender identity should conform to biological sex; and that any departure from this is either because of the predations of others, the engagement in sexual abuse or the rewards of inappropriate sex. What it means to be transgender therefore involves facing a battle between science and theology which disagree about the fundamental nature of the condition and how to manage their demands. Although there is now a great deal of experiential scientific evidence which shows that these conditions are about the search for identity and not reward, and which demonstrate that at a fundamental level the drive is not primarily to be a man or a woman, it is to be themselves, the arguments of theology continue to be used to attack the scientific principles that are applied. The research work described in this analysis is important because it provides a scientific base for the experiential evidence that already exists. However instead of engaging in open arguments and discussions, the Catholic Church, the Church of England, and many conservative and fundamentalist churches, are placing embargos which prevent these foundational issues being addressed. The trauma and damage which is being created by this

¹²⁰ Liu, Richard; Mustanski, Brian: (2012): "Suicidal Ideation and Self-Harm in Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, and Transgender Youth": *American Journal of Preventive Medicine*: March 2012, Volume 42, Issue 3, Pages 221–228. Haas, Ann P .Rodgers, Philip L. and Herman, Jody L: (2014): "Suicide Attempts among Transgender and Gender Non-Conforming Adults: FINDINGS OF THE NATIONAL TRANSGENDER DISCRIMINATION SURVEY" American Foundation for Suicide Prevention, Williams Institute, UCLA School of Law <https://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-content/uploads/AFSP-Williams-Suicide-Report-Final.pdf> Marshall Ellen, Claes Laurence, Bouman Walter Pierre, Witcomb Gemma L., and Arcelus, Jon: (2016): "Non-suicidal self-injury and suicidality in trans people: A systematic review of the literature": *International Review of Psychiatry* Vol. 28 , Iss. 1, 2016 <http://www.tandfonline.com/action/showCitFormats?doi=10.3109%2F09540261.2015.1073143>. Virupaksha, H. G. Muralidhar, Daliboyina and Ramakrishna, Jayashree; (2016): " Suicide and Suicidal Behavior among Transgender Persons": *Indian J Psychol Med.* 2016 Nov-Dec; 38(6): 505–509. doi: 10.4103/0253-7176.194908

¹²¹ Seelman K.L. (2016): "Transgender Adults' Access to College Bathrooms and Housing and the Relationship to Suicidality". *J Homosex* . 2016 Oct;63 (10):1378-99. doi: 10.1080/00918369.2016.1157998. Epub 2016 Feb 25. ABSTRACT: Transgender and gender non-conforming people frequently experience discrimination, harassment, and marginalization across college and university campuses. The minority stress model posits that experiences of discrimination often negatively impact the psychological wellbeing of minority groups. However, few scholars have examined whether college institutional climate factors-such as being denied access to bathrooms or gender-appropriate campus housing-are significantly associated with detrimental psychological outcomes for transgender people. Using the National Transgender Discrimination Survey, this study analyses whether being denied access to these spaces is associated with lifetime suicide attempts, after controlling for interpersonal victimization by students or teachers. Findings from sequential logistic regression indicate that denial of access to either space had a significant relationship to suicidality, even after controlling for interpersonal victimization. This article discusses implications for higher education professionals and researchers.

¹²² Perez-Brumer, Amaya; Hatzenbuehler, Mark L. Oldenburg, Catherine E. & Bockting Walter: (2015) "Individual- and Structural-Level Risk Factors for Suicide Attempts Among Transgender Adults"

Pages 164-171. *Behav Med.* 2015; 41(3): 164–171. <http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/08964289.2015.1028322>

¹²³ Stonewall/Cambridge University (2017): "School Report (2017)" <http://www.stonewall.org.uk/school-report-2017> Almost half of trans pupils in UK have attempted suicide, survey finds. Stonewall's new research with the Centre for Family Research at the University of Cambridge into the experiences of over 3,700 lesbian, gay, bi and trans (LGBT) pupils in Britain's schools shows that more than four in five trans young people have self-harmed, as have three in five lesbian, gay and bi young people who aren't trans. Also more than two in five trans young people have attempted to take their own life, and one in five lesbian, gay and bi students who aren't trans have done the same

¹²⁴ Tannehill, Brynn. (2016) "The Truth About Transgender Suicide": Huffington Post January.2015, Updated Nov, 2016: http://www.huffingtonpost.com/brynn-tannehill/the-truth-about-transgend_b_8564834.html also:

Barr, Sebastian. (2015): "Why Are Transgender People More Likely To Attempt Suicide?":

<http://www.sebastianmitchellbarr.com/blog/2015/10/8/why-are-transgender-people-more-likely-to-attempt-suicide>

Gilchrist, S. (2017): "What Does it mean to be Transgender?" 242P

First Issued: 25 December 2017. Last update: 8 February 2018.

Draft: Printed: 11/02/2018 17:35

Access via: <http://www.tqdr.co.uk/articles/index.htm>

spap4144@gmail.com

35

denial should be obvious from any reading of this account. Until that embargo is lifted, and these issues are fully addressed, transgender people will continue to face the scapegoating which involves the complicity of the church with secular society, and the charges of abuse and inappropriate behaviour that are frequently made.

7:0: Changes in the Church

As a voluntary way of living earthly life the practice of gender complementarity has much to recommend it, but the perils of first century life, including responsibilities for nurturing children, families, pregnancies and the dangers of childbirth could also be expected to force women into this position. When it is made compulsory severe gender discrimination almost inevitably occurs. The results of this analysis do not demand or support any relaxation of moral values. Instead they demand that the boundary between use and abuse be changed from one that condemns all gender and sexually variant behaviour irrespective of purpose, to one that applies identical criteria of use and abuse to all heterosexual, cross-gender and same-sex acts. There is no toleration of any form of abusive or immoral sex. Nevertheless any departure from the male and female stereotypes and roles enforced by the church or state can be condemned as disruptive or disordered acts. In this investigation it is made very clear that those gender and sexually variant people who live true to their own identities in ways that conform to the highest standards of their own societies should be highly regarded, while those who do the reverse may be severely condemned for the actions they take. However people cross-dress and disrupt the gender boundaries for many reasons, and gender and sexually variant people represent a minority group. When one side is attacked by the other both sides reinforce the boundaries that already exist. If Christianity to become able to find a way to recognise the full range of moral attitudes and commitments which exist and are inherent to gender and sexually variant behaviour, then the condemnation of sexual abuse and the acknowledgment of the same range of moralities by and inside the gender and sexually variant communities must be equally strongly made.

True reconciliation can only take place when openness, engagement and respect are obtained. That cannot happen for as long as any organisation or church refuses even to consider the possibilities of any change to its traditional doctrine, or it places an embargo which ensures that only pastoral issues can be considered. By examining both the scientific and the theological foundations it has been demonstrated in this analysis that the traditional teaching of the Church medically misdiagnoses these conditions. Great harm can also be created because the incorrect methods of management are often applied. A paradigm shift is shown to have occurred in Christian teaching, which has changed a condemnation based on the intention of a sexual act, into the automatic and unvarying condemnation of the same act. It is shown that these transformations have brought the Church to collude with the secular demands of society rather than to challenge them. Not only has this collusion reinforced the secular prejudices of such discriminatory societies; it gave and it still gives religious legitimacy to them. All awareness of the identity driven nature and the full range of moral expression in gender and sexually variant behaviour, which is totally recognised in the teaching of Jesus has been lost because of the need to combat the gross abuses of power and sex in Roman society and later to protect the institutions of the Church.

The early Christian Church described the types of moral behaviour which are identified in this analysis in terms of “The Way of Darkness” and “The Way of Light”. The same early Church set out to be a beacon of light, shining out to the hostile and discriminatory society around it. However the Gospel message which demanded true equality and fairness for all people did not last. This analysis does not diminish in any form the rightful condemnation of the way of darkness. There is no condonation of abusive acts. Instead it identifies the way of light for all gender and sexually variant people who seek to live their lives in ways that are true to their own identities in the Love of Christ.

Gilchrist, S. (2017): “What Does it mean to be Transgender?” 242P

First Issued: 25 December 2017. Last update: 8 February 2018.

Draft: Printed: 11/02/2018 17:35

Access via: <http://www.tqdr.co.uk/articles/index.htm>

spap4144@gmail.com

36

Today that light should shine most strongly in places where there are discriminatory societies around it. Whatever the cost to the organisation may be, surely the mission of every Church today must be to rekindle this beacon of light.

References are given in the accompanying notes. For selected papers and the supporting research: See <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/documents/000B-SG-SelectedPapers.pdf>

© Susan Gilchrist 2017

spap4144@gmail.com

Gilchrist, S. (2017): "What Does it mean to be Transgender?" 242P

First Issued: 25 December 2017. Last update: 8 February 2018.

Draft: Printed: 11/02/2018 17:35

Access via: <http://www.tgdr.co.uk/articles/index.htm>

spap4144@gmail.com

37